List of comment Revision of IJC

Title : Development of Voltammetry Analysis Method of Iron Metal Ions by Solid-State Membrane with Carbon Nanotube

Name : Suyanta

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| No | Page | Comment of Reviewer | Revision |
| 1 | 1 | The abstract contains a maximum of 200 words and state the implication of the finding in the last sentence. | I think my abstract as a role, contain about 140 words and in the ending abstract I give a sentence : *So, the technique that was develop can be use analysis of Fe(II) is better than another method.* |
| 2 | 3 | Make explanation about procedure | WE add explanation : The procedure of experiment is include 3 part, that are electrode preparation, voltammetry analysis (differential pulse voltammetry) and data analysis |
| 3 | 4-8 | Use Arial 8 for numbers and letters in figures and illustrations, and paste the figures and images in editable format. | We were change some text on some table dan picture with standard font and kind or word. |
| 4 | All | Use the journal style for references; the maximum number of out-of-date references (published over ten years) is only 20%. | We were change some references that publish no over 10 years. Some references are number 2, 3, 4, 6, 7, 12, 14, and 15. (8 references). |
| 5 | 5 | in pages 5 it is written: Should in research the difference in concentration not affect the potential . This sentence is not complete | It is correct that concentration is not effect to potential, but concentration effect to current. It is as Nernst equation and Ilkovic equation. In the paragraph we revise like this:  “Based on the potentiometry theory the difference in concentration does not affect the potential straightly[27]. The results showed a shift in the potential value, because the standard potential determination used pure Fe metal, while in this study used a modified 1.10-orthophenanthroline solid membrane electrode and formed a complex, thereby affecting the potential value”. |
| 6 | 9 | In Table 3 it written data for "Linear measurement range". It should changes to "correlation coefficients" | It is correct, that I was change “measurement range" with "correlation coefficients" |
| 7 | All | Many similarities with reference no. 25. The only difference is between copper and iron. The Turnitin score is 75%. How do the authors explain this? | Yes, that my research have two object that is Copper ion metal and Iron ion metal. The development copper electrode was publish in IJC at last year, and this year the second paper about the development iron electrode. So, may be the similarity rather in major category, but it is self similarity category.  In this case we have basic difference between copper ion electrode and iron ion electrode, in the use of active sensor membrane material. In the copper ion electrode we use Na-diethyldithiocarbamate ligand and in the iron ion electrode we use 1,10-orthophenantroline ligand. |
| 8 | 4-9 | Please add the explanation in the results and discussion, kindly check the file | We were try to add discussion in the result of the research as so possible. |

TTd

Prof. Suyanta,