PENINGKATAN KINERJA TENAGA EDUKATIF DI BIDANG PARIWISATA

(Studi Kasus *Makassar Tourism Training Project*/MTTP di Kota Makassar)

Farid Said

Pascasarjana UNM Makasar

faridmks@yahoo.com

ABSTRACT

This paper discusses 'Makassar Tourism Training Project' (MTTP) which aims to increase the human resources performance for tourism. Many programs have been implemented by this project such as Competency Based Training/Assesment Workshop; Fellowship Programs; Training Programs; and Upgrading Facilities. This paper shows that MTTP have succeeded in increasing the tourism performance particularly and human resources for tourism in wider sense. However, various obstacles found oi this program, such as; lack of commitment in the parts of local government, insufficient budget, and poor motivation. These obtacles have to be tackled in order to ensure the program sustainability.

Keywords: MTTP, performance, human resources for tourism

PENDAHULUAN

Kompetensi tenaga edukatif bidang pariwisata merupakan tuntutan yang tidak bisa ditunda lagi untuk menghasilkan sumber daya manusia profesional baik di sektor publik maupun swasta. Sejalan dengan keluarnya UU No. 20 Tahun 2003 tentang Sistem Pendidikan Nasional dan UU No. 13 Tahun 2003 tentang Ketenagakerjaan, lahirlah *Makassar Tourism Training Project* (MTTP). Program ini merupakan kerjasama antara pemerintah Indonesia dan Australia *("G to G")* yang telah disepakati oleh empat menteri terkait yakni Menteri Pendidikan Nasional, Menteri Kebudayaan dan Pariwisata, Menteri Tenaga Kerja, Menteri Perindustrian dan Perdagangan serta KADIN. MTTP terbentuk melalui proyek *Indonesia-Australia Partnership for Skill Development* (IAPSD). IAPSD bermaksud untuk mengembangkan kepariwisataan di kota Makassar dan Sulawesi Selatan pada

umumnya. Proyek ini memfokuskan pada pengembangan sumber daya manusia di perguruan tinggi pariwisata dan sekolah kejuruan pariwisata Negeri. Selain itu, proyek ini juga bertujuan untuk meningkatkan keterampilan sumber daya manusia bidang pariwisata baik di sektor publik maupun swasta. Sebagai *Team Leader*, pemerintah Australia mengirim Lawrence Vandenberg untuk ke Makassar untuk melakukan strategi perencanaan dengan menjalin kolaborasi antara asosiasi usaha pariwisata dan pihak pemerintah terkait. Kolaborasi antara DPD ASITA-Sulawesi Selatan *(Association of Indonesia Travel Agency)*, BPD PHRI Sulawesi Selatan (Perhimpunan Hotel Dan Restoran Indonesia), DIKNAS, DISPARDA, DISNAKER dan KADIN diperlukan untuk mengimplementasikan sistem kompetensi melalui dana hibah dengan jangka waktu empat tahun (2001 sampai dengan 2005).

KAJIAN TEORI MENGENAI INDIKATOR PROGRAM PELATIHAN

Tujuan dari proyek MTTP adalah memperkuat hubungan antara pemerintah dengan asosiasi industri pariwisata. Kedua pihak ini bertanggungjawab dalam menerapkan sistem pelatihan berdasarkan kompetensi yang relevan dengan kebutuhan industri pariwisata di kota Makassar. Sasaran yang ingin dicapai adalah menghasilkan kemitraan kerja yang kuat dalam membuat perencanaan dan pengelolaan sebuah pusat institusi pendidikan yang purwa–rupa *(prototype)* dan menentukan metode sukses untuk mengenali bentuk pelatihan yang dibutuhkan oleh industri pariwisata.

Dari tujuan dan sasaran diatas telah tercetus 34 jenis program kerja. Masing-masing program kerja diperuntukkan bagi bidang keahlian tenaga edukatif khusus *Travel and Tourism, Room Division, Food and Beverage Services*, serta pengembangan program kepariwisataan bagi 100 orang PNS dilingkungan Pemerintah daerah (Pemda) Kota Makassar. Masing–masing bidang keahlian ini mempunyai seorang pembimbing dari Australia dan didampingi oleh pengajar pada masing-masing bidang *(Counterpart)*. Pembimbing ini merupakan suatu badan konsultatif, *Project Reference Group (PRG)*. Setiap program yang akan dilakukan didasarkan harus pada pertimbangan PRG. Badan ini juga yang mencetuskan nama proyek *Makassar Tourism Trainning Project* (MTTP). Proyek ini bukan hanya upaya peningkatan kualitas sumber daya manusia pariwisata tenaga edukatif namun juga bagi aparatur pemerintah di Kota Makassar

Indikator yang hendak diukur dalam program pengembangan tenaga edukatif di Kota Makassar adalah: 1) seberapa sering tenaga edukatif mengikuti pelatihan kompetensi sesuai bidangnya; 2) sejauhmana mereka dapat mengikuti kemajuan tehnologi peralatan yang digunakan sesuai kebutuhan industri; 3) seberapa besar keluaran sekolah pariwisata di Kota Makassar telah terserap industri pariwisata baik di dalam maupun luar negeri. Tujuan dari pengembangan ini adalah meningkatnya kinerja *(performance)* tenaga edukatif guna tercapainya efisiensi, efektivitas

dan pada gilirannya dapat meningkatkan produktivitas. Hal itu selaras dengan pendapat yang dikemukakan Castetter (1981: 272) dan Curtis R. Finch (1982: 136).

Adapun kinerja, yang menjadi tujuan "pengembangan", diartikan secara luas oleh Borg (1979:608) sebagai: *"the actual program is put into operation"*. Kinerja merupakan variabel dependen signifikan yang mempengaruhi baik secara parsial maupun serempak. Menurut Sutermeister (1976:11), kinerja pada dasarnya terbentuk dari kemampuan (*ability*) dan kemauan (*motivation*).

Pelatihan berdasarkan kompetensi *(Competency Based Training/CBT)* adalah pelatihan yang didasarkan atas hal-hal yang diharapkan dapat dilakukan oleh seseorang di tempat kerja. Hal ini secara luas diterima di mancanegara, dan merupakan salah satu cara untuk membuat pelatihan lebih relevan terhadap dunia kerja. CBT memberi tekanan pada apa yang dapat dilakukan oleh seseorang sebagai hasil dari pelatihan (output). Sementara pengujian berdasarkan kompetensi *(Competency Based Assessement/CBA)* merupakan suatu bentuk penilaian dimana bukti dari pekerjaan yang dilaksanakan dalam penilaian dibandingkan dengan kriteria pelaksanaan tugas relevan di tempat kerja *(workplace)*, penilai *(assessor)* kemudian memutuskan apakah kriteria pelaksanaan tugas telah dipenuhi atau belum.

Dalam kaitan ini, MTTP dapat mengundang institusi pendidikan dan asosiasi usaha pariwisata untuk duduk dalam satu meja guna membahas indikator baik terkait pelatihan TOT *(Train Of Trainer)*, penerapan dan pengujian kompetensi, maupun pelatihan sesuai dengan bidang keahlian bagi tenaga edukatif. Pertemuan-pertemuan untuk membahas kurikulum berdasarkan kompetensi lainnya dihadiri oleh utusan baik dari institusi pendidikan maupun usaha pariwisata hotel, restoran, agen travel, penerbangan dan Dinas Pariwisata sebagai pengguna dari keluaran institusi pendidikan pariwisata. Pertemuan tersebut bertujuan agar industri pariwisata dan institusi pendidikan pariwisata tidak saling mengklaim hasil keluarannya. Sebab, peningkatan kinerja sumberdaya pariwisata merupakan bagian dari tanggung jawab industri pariwisata. Adapun program pengembangan sumberdaya manusia pariwisata yang dilakukan adalah sebagai berikut:

1. *Workshop* dan Sosialisasi CBT dan CBA

Sejak tahun 1985 Indonesia sudah memiliki kurikulum pariwisata berdasarkan kompetensi yang disebut SKNI (Standar Kompetensi Nasional Indonesia). Sekarang kurikulum tersebut disebut dengan SKKNI (Standar Kompetensi Kerja Nasional Indonesia-bidang Pariwisata). SKKNI dibuat oleh sebuah tim terpadu antara industri pariwisata dengan tenaga edukatif pariwisata yang memiliki pengalaman industri. SKKNI merupakan proyek bersama bantuan Australia yang kegiatannya berpusat di Jakarta.

Pendekatan CBT berbeda dengan pendekatan tradisional yang lebih memberi

tekanan pada jumlah kehadiran peserta dalam pelatihan (input). CBT memberikan manfaat baik bagi peserta, pelatih maupun pemakai kerja. Bagi peserta pelatihan, manfaat CBT diantaranya memungkinkan peserta untuk bersikap lebih bertanggung jawab terhadap kemajuannya, bukan berdasarkan nilai semata. Sementara bagi pelatih, CBT memungkinkan adanya kebebasan dalam menentukan waktu mulai, selesai dan kecepatan program pelatihan. Selanjutnya bagi pemberi kerja, CBT dapat menjamin kemampuan seorang karyawan.

Manfaat yang sama besarnya juga diperoleh dari pelaksanaan CBA. Bagi peserta yang diuji *(assessed)*, ia dapat memperlihatkan bahwa dirinya kompeten dan dalam keterampilan tertentu dapat maju lebih cepat. Hal ini mengingat terdapat perbedaan antara belajar pada jalur pendidikan profesional dan jalur akademik. Jalur akademik mengutamakan pada hasil *output*, sedangkan jalur pendidikan profesional mengutamakan keluarannya. Dalam hal ini, kemampuan sikap perilaku dan keterampilan lebih diutamakan. Oleh karena itu, proses pembelajaran di kelas juga menjadi sangat berbeda. Sebelumnya kita menganut sistem pembelajaran terpusat pada pelatihnya *(Teacher Center Learning)*, yang menjadi ciri jalur pendidikan akademik. Sementara kini telah bergeser menjadi pembelajaran terpusat pada yang dilatih *(Student Center Learning)*, yang menjiwai jalur pendidikan profesional.

2. Program Beasiswa

Program ini merupakan suatu bentuk pengamatan terhadap penerapan kurikulum pariwisata dan CBT/CBA di Canberra-Australia. Ada sekitar 19 orang pengelola MTTP yang dikirim ke Australia. Mereka berada di *Canberra Institute Of Technology* (CIT) selama 1 bulan untuk melakukan observasi langsung dikelas dan berkunjung ke beberapa industri pariwisata seperti hotel, biro perjalanan wisata, *airport*, *canberra visitor center* dan sebagainya. Kurikulum yang diajarkan di Australia tidak jauh berbeda dengan Indonesia. Namun metode penerapan kurikulum tersebut berbeda *(Delivery Strategy)*. Selain itu, fasilitas pembelajaran di Australia jauh lebih maju dibanding Indonesia. Namun dalam empat tahun berjalannya proyek MTTP, Makassar mengalami perubahan yang sangat signifikan. Kini fasilitas di Makassaar sudah hampir mencapai apa yang dilakukan di CIT Canberra.

3. Program Training

Pelatihan yang dilakukan MTTP telah menjangkau luas baik dari volume unit kompetensi maupun pesertanya. Di Kota Makassar kurang lebih telah diajarkan 50 unit kompetensi (mata kuliah). Sementara diluar kota Makassar telah diajarkan 32 unit kompetensi. Peserta yang telah mengikuti pelatihan sebanyak 3.690 orang termasuk 125 orang pegawai negeri Pemda kota Makassar. Lima peserta terbaik dari pelatihan ini melanjutkan observasinya ke kota Canberra.

Tabel 1.
Kursus *Demand-Driven* Pengolahan Makanan dan Minuman

Waktu	Judul Kursus	Tujuan	Tempat	Jumlah Peserta
11-13 November 2003	Penilai Lingkungan Kerja (*Workplace Assessor*)	Membekali peserta dengan pengetahuan yang cukup untuk merencanakan, membina, dan menilai tingkat kemampuan pegawai. Meningkatkan pemahaman tentang **Competency Based Training (CBT) and Competency Based Assessment (CBA)** terutama di dalam sistem Pendidikan Kejuruan.	Hotel Marannu	16
4-5 November 2003	Penggunaan Metode Dasar dalam Tata-boga (*Cookery*)	Memberi pemahaman kepada para peserta tentang prinsip dasar dan metode tata-boga; penggunaan alat dan perkakas yang tepat, penyiapan dan penyajian sesuai standar industri pariwisata.	SMK6	14
4-5 Oktober 2003	Merangkai Buah dan Sayur	Meningkatkan keterampilan dan pengetahuan yang diperlukan dalam merangkai dan menghias buah dan sayur untuk keperluan buffet.	Hotel Imperial Aryaduta	24
30-31 Mei 2003	Mengelola Pendapatan dan Biaya dari Bisnis Catering	Memberi pemahaman tentang prinsip-prinsip dasar penghitungan biaya dan pendapatan dalam bisnis konsumsi.	AKPAR	28
23-24 Mei 2003	Merancang menu sesuai kebutuhan pasar.	Membantu para peserta untuk merencanakan, menghitung biaya dan menuliskan menu yang seimbang sesuai dengan berbagai macam kebutuhan Catering dan selera konsumen.	AKPAR	30
10-11 April 2003	Prosedur kesehatan, kenyamanan dan keamanan.	Membantu para peserta untuk memahami masalah kesehatan kerja, faktor-faktor kenyamanan dan keamanan yang berpengaruh dalam industry pariwisata.	Hotel Aston	24

29-30 Januari 2003	Layanan Makanan dan Minuman (Food and Beverage Service)	Meningkatkan keterampilan dan pengetahuan peserta dalam sistem layanan makanan dan minuman dalam lingkungan industri pariwisata yang variatif.	Hotel Dynasty	26
10 Desember 2002	Prosedur kesehatan di tempat kerja (Workplace Hygiene Procedures)	Meningkatkan keterampilan dan pengetahuan peserta tentang prosedur kesehatan yang berlaku dalam banyak sektor industri pariwisata.	SMK6	16
28 28-29 November 2002	Penyiapan Bahan Dasar dan Bumbu (Prepare Basic Stocks and Sauces)	Meningkatkan pemahaman dan keterampilan para peserta mengenai berbagai produk bahan dan bumbu, membina relasi dengan para penyalur yang bermanfaat untuk dapur komersial	SMK6	20
26-27 November 2002	Merangkai Buah dan Sayur	Meningkatkan keterampilan dan pengetahuan yang diperlukan dalam merangkai dan menghias buah dan sayur untuk keperluan buffet.	SMK6	13

Pelatihan berdasarkan kompetensi ini mengacu pada lama jam pelatihan, bukan pada lama waktu pelatihan. Perbedaannya terletak pada setiap unit kompetensi (mata ajaran) yang sudah memiliki perkiraan jumlah jamnya masing – masing. Dari mulai hanya 10 jam hingga bisa mencapai 100 jam pada kelompok unit kompetensi yang tidak bisa dipisahkan. Sedangkan lama waktu pelatihan diselesaikan dalam periode waktu yang sudah ditentukan. Mulai dari tiga bulan, satu semester, satu tahun dan seterusnya. Pelatihan juga dilakukan pada tingkat manajemen *(Senior manejemen training)* dikalangan industri pariwisata, baik tingkat manajer maupun *head department*. Selain itu, pelatihan juga diberikan pada kepala bagian akademik, kurikulum, dan ketua jurusan di institusi pendidikan. Mereka kemudian dibagi dalam beberapa kelompok untuk mengikuti pelatihan yang di-selenggarakan di hotel bintang lima, di kota wisata Malino maupun daerah tujuan wisata lainnya.

Program pendidikan ataupun pelatihan sebaiknya tidak dilakukan secara kaku. Sebab hal ini hanya akan membuat Indonesia menjadi sangat tertinggal jauh dari negara-negara Asia lainnya. Oleh karena itu, perlu suatu upaya untuk meningkatkan Program Pengembangan Kejuruan Terpadu (PPKT) baik ditingkat

pendidikan menengah maupun perguruan tinggi. Program ini diperlukan untuk menjawab persaingan tenaga kerja dari luar negeri yang akan masuk pada semua lini usaha di Indonesia.

4. Pembaharuan Fasilitas

Peningkatan kemampuan dosen Akademi Pariwisata Makassar tidak lepas dari kemampuannya menggunakan peralatan yang digunakan di industri untuk diajarkan di sekolah. Penambahan dan peningkatan kualitas peralatan praktik di AKPAR Makassar dilakukan dengan memperbaiki atau menambah apabila salah satu unit kompetensi (mata ajaran) yang akan diajarkan belum memiliki peralatan yang memadai. Ada empat peralatan yang disumbangkan pada AKPAR Makassar: 1) sistem reservasi *(Video System)* yang digunakan di hotel berbintang; 2) sistem reservasi tiket pesawat *(Abacus System- CRS);* 3) perbaikan hotel praktik; 4) perbaikan dapur praktik di AKPAR Makassar. Selain itu, MTTP juga melakukan peningkatan kualitas dosen yang akan mengunakan alat tersebut kepada mahasiswanya. Seluruh fasilitas ini bukan hanya diperuntukkan kepada siswa dan mahasiswa dimasing–masing institusi pendidikan, tapi juga disediakan bagi kalangan industri yang ingin meningkatkan keterampilan karyawannya. Hal ini bertujuan agar tercipta hubungan saling mengisi dan saling membantu diantara kedua belah pihak. Tidak saling menyalahkan seperti yang terjadi pada beberapa tahun sebelumnya

Pertanyaan yang muncul pasca proyek berakhir adalah bagaimana pemeliharaan fasilitas dilakukan. Pemda seringkali tidak memberi perhatian pada upaya meningkatkan kualitas pendidikan dan sumber daya manusia di daerahnya sesuai dengan visi dan misinya. Padahal keseriusan proyek ini dalam mengembangkan program kepariwisataan di Sulawesi Selatan sudah sangat terlihat. Pemda harus mendukung kesinambungan proyek MTTP dalam peningkatan sumber daya manusia pariwisata, khususnya peningkatan kualitas pembelajaran di perguruan tinggi pariwisata. Pemda harus memikirkan sumber pendanaan bagi kelanjutan pemeliharaan fasilitas pembelajaran yang telah dibuat oleh proyek MTTP.

Peningkatan Kinerja Dosen

Peningkatan kinerja dosen dapat dikaji dari dua sudut pandang, yakni dari sudut pandang kemampuan dosen dalam penerapan kurikulum berbasis kompetensi dibidang kepariwisataan *(Delivery Strategy)* dan hasil kekeluaran yang diserap industri pariwisata. *Pertama,* terkait hasil keluaran adalah sejauhmana institusi pendidikan menghasilkan keluran yang dapat diterima di industri setelah mendapatkan pelajaran di institusi pendidikan. Peran ini merupakan tanggung jawab moral

institusi pendidikan. Institusi pendidikan yang tidak mampu menghasilkan keluaran yang diserap industri pariwisata tidak akan diminati oleh calon peserta didik. *Kedua,* bentuk kurikulum pendidikan pariwisata serta penerapannya didepan kelas memegang peranan penting. Dewasa ini institusi pendidikan harus merubah paradigma dari bentuk kurikulum konvensional yang sangat terpusat *(National Contain Curriculum),* ke bentuk kurikulum berdasarkan kebutuhan lokal atau industri *(Local Contain Curriculum).* Dengan kurikulum ini diharapkan terjadi kesesuaian antara kebutuhan industri pariwisata dengan apa yang diberikan kepada mahasiswa di institusi pendidikan kepariwisataan.

Penerapan sistem pelatihan dan pengujian berdasarkan kompetensi *(Competency Based Training/Assessment)* merupakan salah satu jalan keluar yang harus ditempuh guna meningkatkan kinerja dosen. Tantangan yang harus dihadapi terkait dengan waktu, peralatan, dan banyaknya bahan yang harus dibeli dengan harga mahal. Oleh karena itu, diperlukan infrastruktur dan fasilitas memadai sebelum dapat membuka program pendidikan kepariwisataan. Meskipun pembukaan program juga bisa dilakukan melalui kerjasama dengan institusi pendidikan pariwisata yang sudah mapan. Sistem pendididkan CBT bukanlah hal yang baru, tapi kadang kita kurang peduli akan sistem tersebut.

Perguruan tinggi pariwisata dan perhotelan memiliki karakteristik yang berbeda dibanding perguruan tinggi pada umumnya. Perbedaan dapat dilihat pada pengadaan dan pengelolaan dana. Perbedaan ini berimplikasi luas pada optimalisasi aspek lain, yaitu: aspek sumber daya manusia, aspek perangkat dan aspek proses. Karenanya, upaya perbaikan mutu harus sejauh mungkin direncanakan berdasarkan skala prioritas sesuai dengan perkembangan kota dan perkembangan pariwisata. Sehubungan dengan itu, memikirkan upaya optimalisasi variabel vital dengan strategi yang tepat, mempertimbangkan konsep normatif maupun konsep teknis, adalah langkah penting untuk pengayaan mutu manajemen pendidikan tinggi pariwisata.

Pengembangan *(development)* tampaknya menjadi kebutuhan nyata bagi usaha perbaikan kinerja Sumber Daya Manusia Pariwisata (SDMP). Melalui proses yang sistematis konsep pengembangan dapat meningkatkan produktivitas.

Di era globalisasi, sekolah pariwisata dituntut untuk berjalan diatas jalur *market-oriented,* mengingat iklim kompetisi pariwisata yang semakin menghangat. Pada kedua tahapan itu sekolah pariwisata harus memfokuskan manajerial organisasinya pada kepuasan pelanggan. Pelanggan disini meliputi: masyarakat pengguna (usaha perhotelan, usaha travel, dan instansi yang menangani pariwisata), masyarakat intelektual, dan masyarakat peminat pendidikan (calon siswa dan mahasiswa). Oleh karena itu, keluwesan dan keleluasaan sistem kerja, budaya dan struktur sekolah pariwisata perlu dievaluasi dan diperbaiki.

Konsekwensi dari hal tersebut adalah perlunya koreksi terhadap dimensi aturan yang mengikat baik perguruan tinggi maupun sekolah pariwisata. Namun koreksi tidak perlu dilakukan menyangkut standar mutu minimal yang perlu dirumuskan secara bersama-sama. Model *Total Quality Management (TQM)* yang mengedepankan aspek kualitas, dan aspek pelayanan perlu diintrodusir bagi setiap perguruan tinggi melalui upaya optimasi kualitas manajemen aspek proses dan sumber daya manusia serta ketersediaan dana.

Akademi Pariwisata Negeri Makassar, selaras dengan karakteristik dan fungsi, telah menyatakan diri sebagai usaha jasa pendidikan pariwisata dalam beberapa waktu terakhir. Sebagai usaha jasa, pendidikan tinggi pariwisata mempunyai kelompok pelanggan yang harus dilayani dengan pelayanan jasa yang bermutu. Perhatian terhadap mutu harus tergambar dalam tiga wilayah utama (*three main areas*) pendidikan, yakni: pengajaran (*teaching*), penelitian (*research*), dan pendidikan berkelanjutan (*continuing education*).

Pada ketiga wilayah utama pendidikan tersebut, selain faktor kualitas, yang perlu mendapat sorotan dalam model TQM adalah faktor proses dan faktor sumber daya manusia. Faktor proses berkaitan dengan perancangan proses, sistem (termasuk teknologi informasi), budaya kerja struktur, sistem pengendalian, proses penyusunan perencanaan, penganggaran dan produktivitas. Sedangkan faktor sumber daya manusia mencakup permasalahan yang memuat dimensi sosial dan psikologi, interaksi dan interelasi, motivasi, keterampilan, gaya, penghargaan dan imbalan.

Implikasi MTTP

Secara umum, program MTTP berdampak positif terhadap peningkatan kualitas sumberdaya manusia pariwisata. Hal ini dapat dilihat baik secara langsung bagi peningkatan kinerja dosen AKPAR Makassar maupun implikasinya tidak langsung terhadap kualitas pelayanan sumber daya manusia sektor pariwisata dan perhotelan. Program MTTP telah meningkatkan daya saing pariwisata Makassar terhadap daerah tujuan wisata lain di Indonesia. Selain itu, dampak lain diantarannya adalah keberlanjutan program (*Cadre of Champion, Traineeship, Lighthouse School*), dan sistem artikulasi (*Articulation System & Credit Transfer*).

1. Keberlanjutan Program

Enam bulan sebelum proyek ini berakhir, ketiga pembimbing dari Australia, mengangkat beberapa orang yang selama ini membantu mereka untuk melanjutkan program. Program yang dilakukan berupa pelatihan kepada dosen, guru serta karyawan usaha pariwisata di Makassar, Pare-pare, Polmas, Tana Toraja bahkan lebih luas lagi sampai merambah ke Menado, Merauke dan Jayapura.

Program tersebut disebut dengan 'Sustainability Program' dan timnya disebut dengan Cadre of Champion. Dalam program ini juga dibentuk traineeship yang merupakan kader-kader terbaik dari alumni institute pendidikan AKAPAR dan SMK yang telah menyelesaikan beberapa mata ajaran kompetensi di sekolah masing-masing. Selanjutnya, mereka mensosialisasikan pengalamannya kepada mahasiswa lain serta kepada industri pariwisata tentang manfaat mengikuti pembelajaran sistem pelatihan dan pengujian berdasarkan kompetensi (Competency Based Training and Assesment-CBT/A).

Program ini juga telah melahirkan konsep sekolah percontohan implementasi (CBT/CBA) yang dikenal dengan Lighthouse School. Sekolah ini terdiri dari tiga sekolah tingkat SMK dan satu Akademi Pariwisata seperti yang disebutkan diatas.

Institusi pendidikan inilah yang akan menjadi pusat pelatihan dan pendidikan dikawasan timur Indonesia dalam meningkatkan sikap, keterampilan dan pengetahuan sumber daya manusia bidang pariwisata atau perhotelan melalui sistem kompetensi. Institusi pendidikan ini juga digunakan sebagai pusat pendidikan dan pelatihan kepariwisataan karena telah memiliki infrastruktur dan fasilitas memadai.

2. Sistem Artikulasi

Sistem artikulasi adalah suatu bentuk credit transfer yang memudahkan peserta didik untuk melanjutkan transfer ke sekolah satu tingkat lebih tinggi dari SMK, seperti dari SMK ke Akademi Pariwisata. Sekolah setingkat diatas SMK telah mengakui unit kompetensi (mata pelajaran) yang telah diselesaikan dengan bukti-bukti yang dapat dipertanggungjawabkan. Peserta didik yang bersangkutan dapat duduk pada semester 2 atau 3 pada tingkat Akademi jika telah menjalankan SKKNI yang dilakukan oleh SMK. Hingga saat ini, unit kompetensi SKKNI (mata ajaran) yang telah disahkan oleh tim penyusun SKKNI mencapai jumlah cukup signifikan. Pada kelompok usaha perjalanan wisata mencapai 171 unit, kelompok usaha perhotelan 257 unit, sedangkan pada kelompok siswa SMK sampai dengan kelas 3 baru menyelesaikan kira-kira 30 % dari jumlah diatas. Sisanya dapat diselesaikan pada tingkat Akademi. Transfer kredit bahkan juga dapat dilakukan pada industri pariwisata sejauh telah ditunjuk oleh lembaga sertifikasi profesi (LSP) sebagai training provider ataupun assessmen provider. Inilah kemudahan-kemudahan yang dapat ditempuh oleh peserta didik dalam mencapai kompetensi yang dibuktikan dengan hasil pekerjaan, bukan hasil secarik kertas berbentuk ijasah, sertifikat dan sejenisnya.

Pada setiap akhir tahun selama proyek berjalan telah dilakukan Progress Coordinating Confrence (PCC). Konferensi memaparkan tentang hasil kerja selama setahun sebagai pertanggung jawaban kepada public. Konferensi dihadiri semua stake-

holders pariwisata dan aktor yang terlibat langsung dalam kegiatan MTTP.

Pada PCC pertama, kedua dan ketiga dilakukan presentasi laporan hasil kerja oleh *Long Term Advisor* dari masing-masing program. Sedangkan pada PCC terakhir (Desember 2004) presentasi dilakukan oleh Kepala Sekolah SMK, Direktur Akpar Makassar, serta pihak industri, *Cadre of Champion* dan *Traineeship*. Pada konferensi keempat ini juga sempat dipaparkan hasil penelitian yang dilakukan oleh Akpar Makassar tentang "Bunker Jepang sebagai potensi pariwisata Sulawesi Selatan" yang pencetusnya juga dari tim leader MTTP.

Adapun implikasi dari proyek ini seperti diuraikan dibawah sebagai berikut:

1. Terjadinya perubahan paradigma yang sangat signifikan dan terstruktur dalam penerapan sistem pembelajaran di bidang Usaha Perjalanan Wisata dan Perhotelan. Paradigma ini dibutuhkan oleh siswa dan industri dalam bentuk pemberian materi praktis untuk meningkatkan sikap, keterampilan dan pengetahuan bidang pariwisata yang sudah ada serta terpenuhinya harapan industri. Hal ini sejalan dengan UU No. 20 Tahun 2003 pasal 35 (1) tentang Sisdiknas, UU No.13 Tahun 2003 Tentang Ketenagakerjaan pasal 1 (10) tentang serta PP. No. 23 Tahun 2004 Tentang Badan Nasional Sertifikasi Profesi, pada tingkat Nasional dan Lembaga Sertifikasi Profesi sebagai operasionalisasi ditingkat provinsi.

2. Terjadinya hubungan kerjasama antara institusi pendidikan sebagai *training provider* dan industri pariwisata sebagai *assesment center* (tempat uji kompetensi). Uji kompetensi bertujuan menciptakan obyektifitas dalam menerapkan sistem pelatihan dan pengujian berdasarkan kompetensi di bidang pariwisata. Hasilnya diwujudkan dalam bentuk pengakuan sertifikat kompetensi baik melalui asosiasi usaha pariwisata maupun lembaga sertfikat profesi (LSP) pariwisata.

3. Meningkatnya kualitas dan kuantitas fasilitas seperti *Fidelio System, Abacus System* dan lain-lain sebagai fasilitas pembelajaran pada sektor pariwisata/ perhotelan ditempat institusi pendidikan. Peningkatan fasilitas telah menjadikan Makassar sebagai pusat laboratorium pembelajaran yang terlengkap di Indonesia. Buktinya, banyak sekolah-sekolah baik dari kawasan timur maupun dari pulau Jawa melakukan studi banding ke lembaga pendidikan pariwisata Makassar.

4. Menimbulkan percaya diri bagi tiap siswa dan mahasiswa dalam menerima hasil pembelajaran. Melalui pelatihan dan pengujian berdasarkan kompetensi, alumni juga menjadi percaya diri dalam mengimplementasikan sikap, keterampilan dan pengerahuannya pada dunia industri pariwisata. Ini tidak lain karena pengakuan standar internasional yang dapat digunakan untuk bekerja ataupun melakukan studi ke luar negeri. Terbukti salah seorang siswa mendapat beasiswa dari Canberra Institute of Technology-CIT (Australia). Siswa ini langsung ke tingkat

Diploma karena unit Kompetensi yang telah diselesaikan (program artikulasinya), diakui dan tidak perlu lagi melalui empat program sertifikat di CIT.

5. Tercapainya pengakuan kompetensi keluaran sekolah pariwisata oleh pihak manajemen hotel maupun biro perjalanan wisata terhadap tenaga kerja yang akan digunakan. Bahkan industri pariwisata dalam menentukan tingkat jabatan karyawan dilakukan melalui pelatihan-pelatihan kompetensi oleh pihak MTTP dan timnya. Sistem CBT atau CBA telah mampu menjembatani kesenjangan yang dihadapi selama ini antara pihak institusi pendidikan dan industri parawisata.

6. Terwujudnya Misi dan Visi Provinsi Sulawesi Selatan khususnya kota Makassar sebagai pusat pendidikan dan pelatihan pariwisata. Makassar kini telah memiliki laboratorium implementasi CBT/A terlengkap dengan kemampuan sumber daya manusia bidang pariwisata yang kompeten.

7. Dipercayanya Akademi Pariwisata Makassar sebagai pemimpin dalam penerapan CBT/A terhadap sekolah tinggi pariwisata dan Akademi Pariwisata lainnya yang ada di Indonesia, bahkan hingga ke Asia Tenggara.

8. Terwujudnya hampir 40 % karyawan hotel dan biro perjalanan wisatawan di kota Makassar yang telah memiliki sertifikat kompetensi. Sementara jumlah keseluruhan peserta didik yang dilatih di kota Makassar oleh MTTP berjumlah 3.690 orang. Para peserta berasal dari industri pariwisata dan institusi pendidikan dengan fokus utama pada unit kompetensi tentang pelayanan terhadap konsumen *(Custumer Service)* serta kesehatan dan keselamatan kerja *(Follow, Health & Security Procedure)*. Materi ini adalah hasil analisis MTTP yang menunjukkan masih rendahnya perhatian terhadap persoalan tersebut ditempat kerja Makassar.

9. Terlaksananya hasil pelatihan penguji *(Assesor Trainee)* dikota Makassar sebanyak 642 *Assesor*. Penguji ini terdiri dari institusi pendidikan *(internal assesor)* 512 *assesor*, utamanya industri pariwisata *(external assesor pariwisata)*, 116 assesor pada usaha hotel dan 13 assesor pada usaha perjalanan. Nantinya *training* dan *assesor* akan mempunyai tugas dan fungsi yang berbeda. Trainer berasal dari *training provider* dan *assesor* berasal dari *assesment center* (tempat uji kompetensi TUK).

10. Keluaran Akademi Pariwisata dan sekolah pariwisata lainnya dalam dua tahun terakhir telah mampu bersaing dengan tenaga kerja luar negeri. Hal ini terlihat dengan banyaknya alumni yang telah bekerja di negara-negara seperti Australia, Singapura, Malaysia, London serta di kapal pesiar milik Amerika Serikat: Holand American Line dan Caribian. Ini menunjukkan bawha Sulawesi Selatan telah mampu mengekspor tenaga kerja profesional keluar negeri.

KESIMPULAN

Setiap implementasi bentuk pengembangan di Akademi Pariwisata Negeri Makassar membutuhkan pemikiran yang lebih integratif antara pertimbangan sosiologis, psikologis dan keuangan. Hal ini disebabkan terdapatnya masalah-masalah struktural dalam Perguruan Tinggi Pariwisata yang bersifat spesifik. Masalah-masalah tersebut antara lain; perangkat aturan yang mengarah pada deregulasi pengelolaan pendidikan tinggi pariwisata dan kaji ulang terhadap ketentuan-ketentuan yang justru tidak rasional dan tidak akomodatif terhadap sistem akademik yang berlaku. Ini terlihat misalnya terkait jumlah mahasiswa dalam satu kelas yang melebihi tiga puluh orang. Sistem pembelajaran berbasis kompetensi mestinya membatasi siswa di kelas 20 orang dan di tempat praktik hanya 6 orang.

Konsep pengembangan melihat aspek kualitatif lebih penting ketimbang aspek kuantitatif. Dengan demikian permasalahan pengembangan tenaga edukatif terletak pada upaya pemberdayaan komponen tenaga edukatif agar berkontribusi optimal terhadap penciptaan mutu proses dan hasil keluarannya. Pada dasarnya program pengembangan didasari oleh prinsip terpenuhinya dua harapan pokok, yakni: (1) meningkatnya kontribusi individu selaras dengan harapan manajemen perguruan tinggi, (2) terpenuhinya kebutuhan dosen, kerja dan individual, dari manajemen perguruan tinggi. Jalinan simbiosis mutualisme merupakan *conditio sine qua non* dalam setiap upaya peningkatan kualitas.

Pengembangan disiplin kerja hendaknya diarahkan pada konsistensi individu dalam memahami, menghayati, melaksanakan, dan memasyarakatkan ketentuan berperilaku dalam sistem kelembagaan. Sosialisasi berbagai ketentuan dan aturan mengenai disiplin harus dilakukan. Ketentuan yang tidak diketahui sering menyebabkan pelanggaran atas disiplin kerja dosen. Praktik yang sering terjadi adalah beban tugas dalam bentuk satuan kredit semester (SKS) belum banyak dipahami baik oleh pimpinan maupun dosen. Sering dipertanyakan, apakah dosen yang tidak datang ke kampus karena mengadakan bimbingan skripsi di rumah merupakan bentuk pelanggaran disiplin. Begitu pula apakah membimbing skripsi harus selalu di kampus. Jika harus demikian, apakah tersedia fasilitas memadai dalam menunjang interaksi yang baik dalam proses bimbingan itu. Dalam prakteknya, perguruan tinggi pariwisata belum mampu memberikan fasilitas yang memadai untuk kegiatan perkuliahan sekalipun. Apalagi jika harus menyediakan fasilitas bagi kegiatan diluar perkuliahan, walau masih dalam kerangka kegiatan akademis.

Pengembangan semangat kerja berkaitan dengan ketulusan hati karena adanya kepuasan kerja sebagai akibat terpenuhinya kebutuhan dasar dari pekerjaan yang dilakukan. Kehadiran, partisipasi, antusisme, kerjasama merupakan indikator-indikator penting untuk mengukur semangat kerja.

Selanjutnya, pengembangan karir dan kesejahteraan sangat dibutuhkan dalam mendukung usaha-usaha pengembangan sebelumnya. Pengembangan karir dan kesejahteraan berfungsi melakukan pemeliharaan atas upaya-upaya yang telah dilakukan dalam pengembangan-pengembangan sebelumnya. Harus diakui penghargaan berupa kesejahteraan untuk profesi pengajar umumnya, khususnya dosen, masih belum menggembirakan. Setiap perguruan tinggi pariwisata dituntut melakukan inovasi untuk mengatasi hal tersebut.

DAFTAR PUSTAKA

Lemlit Unpas. "Kinerja Dosen Perguruan Tinggi Pariwisata", makalah dalam Simposium Nasional

MTTP. Laporan *Progress Coordinating Conference* (PCC) 2001 sampai dengan 2005

Unmer Malang. 1996. "Mutu Perguruan Tinggi Pariwisata Menjelang Era Globalisasi". Kumpulan makalah Hasil Seminar Nasional

Unmer Malang. 1995. "Menuju Manajemen Perguruan Tinggi Pariwisata yang Efisien". Laporan Hasil Seminar.

Wahjoetomo.1996. "Manajemen Perguruan Tinggi". Malang

GOVERNANCE OF STREET VENDORS IN A PRESPECTIVE OF STATE-SOCIETY RELATIONS IN SOLO

Sudarmo [1]

INTISARI

Kegiatan ekonomi sektor informal yang dijalankan oleh pedagang jalanan (street vendors) di Kota Solo secara signifikan dapat meningkatkan pendapatan daerah. Namun, keberadaan pedagang jalanan yang sebagian besar berasal dari pendatang luar daerah, ditanggapi secara negatif oleh Pemkot Solo. Implikasi dari hal tersebut adalah kegiatan ekonomi yang dijalankan oleh para pedagang jalanan dikontrol oleh pemerintah daerah dan elite berkuasa lainnya. Semenjak adanya pembatasan akses partisipasi pedagang jalanan terhadap proses pengambilan kebijakan maka tata kepemerintahan Kota Solo mulai memberdayakan para pedagang jalanan untuk membangun jejaring kerja. Membangun jejaring kerja merupakan hal yang sangat vital bagi kemampuan bertahan pedagang jalanan. Semakin banyak jejaring kerja yang dimiliki maka semakin tinggi pula kemampuan para pedagang jalanan untuk bertahan. Namun, para pedagang jalanan yang tidak memiliki atau sedikit memiliki jejaring kerja merupakan pihak-pihak yang cenderung rapuh dalam menghadapi persaingan dunia usaha.

Kata kunci: pedagang jalanan, tata kepemerintahan, partisipasi, pemerintah kota dan jejaring kerja.

INTRODUCTION

It was apparent that there were many different local actors who directly involved with street vending issues in Solo - street vendors, bureaucrats, politicians, market vendors, investors, shopping mall developers, operators in transport industries, car owners, and neighbours and others in the wider Solo society. To begin to

[1] The author is a lecturer of the Department of Public Administration of the Faculty of Social and Political Science, Sebelas Maret University, Surakarta. Email: sudarmo63@yahoo.com Mobile phone: 087878207689. Home Address: Jl Bido 1 no. 71 Kampung Gumunggung RT 01/RW 03, Kelurahan Gilingan, Kecamatan Banjarsari, Surakarta pisr code: 57134.

make sense of their actions we need to become acquainted with the structures, cultures or views of the world and of their place in it, that they share and that they contest. Therefore, this paper will introduce, describe and explain governance of street vendors which focuses on state-society relations in Solo

Finally, this paper will provide an argumentative conclusion for the study of governance and participation.

DEFINING GOVERNANCE

Using a very wide perspective Davis and Keating define "governance as the process by which institutions, both state and non-state interact to manage a nation's affairs" (Davis and Keating, 2000: 4). In a narrow statist view 'governance' usually refers to "the capacity of the government to make policy and put into effect," (Pierre and Peters, 2000: 42) but, in many societies, "the game of policy formulation is no longer played only by those in government" (Denhardt, and Denhardt, 2003: 84) and it is accepted that "participants from outside government recognized as stakeholders who have rights to be involved and should be engaged in deciding what should be done and possibly carrying it out" (Colebatch, 2004: 78). The term 'stakeholder' refers to "an individual or group that makes a difference, or that can affect or be affected by policy or public decision' (Brinkerhoff and Crosby, 2002: 141). One major example of this is 'citizen participation,' defined as "broad forms of engagement by citizens in policy formulation and decision making in key arenas which affect their lives." (Gaventa and Valderrama, 1999: 4) This is to underline that Governance may be implemented in any public issue such as that of street vendors whom require collective decisions and actions.

In many developing countries, however, policy implementation sometimes is under a system of personal rule to achieve the goals of the ruler's policy. The term "personal rule" may be used exchangeably with "neopatrimonialism" (Acemoglu, Robinson & Thierry: 2003: 6; Jackson and Carl, 1982).

STREET VENDORS AND STATE-SOCIETY RELATIONS
1. Defining and Assessing the 'Street Vendors'

Some literatures define street vendors by simply referring to the definition of the 'informal sector' (see Kartini Kartono, et al., 1980). But the scope of the informal sector is much wider than that of street vending, thus the latter requires a more specific definition. Edi Suharto (2004: 4-5) defines the street vendors as follows: " (1) They operate in public premises, which are not intended for business purposes, such as the roadside, pavement and other connected-to street premises (e.g. near public market, the square, green area); (2) They trade a variety of

items that can be categorized as food, goods, or services for economic benefits involving market transaction; (3) They form linkages with the rest of economy, especially backward linkages with the modern-formal sector (e.g. many commodities sold by street vendors are industrially manufactured goods); (4) They are mostly unlicensed, but not categorized as criminal by law or the regulations of the local administrative area; (5) They do not pay tax, but pay daily fees, called *retribusi* to the city authorities such as for sanitary and security purposes; (6) Their business commonly involves family members in both ownership and management systems; (7) Their enterprises are small and are mostly own-account workers or employing less than five workers or apprentices; (8) Their employment is not protected by any sort of employment benefit either from government (e.g. social services, pension) or labour union (e.g. insurance, fixed salaries); (9) Their establishments are mostly characterized by inadequate infrastructure and technology, and limited economic and human capital.

The definition seems to negate the possibility of someone with relatively large capital becoming a street vendor. As my research is dealing with street vendors in Surakarta, I used a combination of the definition of street vendors by the Surakarta Municipality and where they can run their business, which refers respectively to the consecutive Articles 1 (c) and 1(d) of the Municipality's Local Law 8/1995. These articles stated:

"A street vendor is a person running a business and/or service in public places either using or not using something in it;"[2]

"The places for street vendors are on sides of public roads, pavements and squares and any other place on the state land decided by the Mayor."[3]

The definition suggests that the street vendors may include not only those who have limited capital in their small business but also those who have large capital in an extensive business; and in running their business they may utilize portable devices such as push charts, plaited mats, portable tents as their shelters and they also may utilize static stalls. The latter include a variety from semi-permanent stalls/kiosks which are small, roofed, open, fixed structures that stand on pavements or on the street or in other public places up to others which look more like a residential accommodation equipped with bathroom, toilet and a well drilled in the ground. This official general definition covers most but not all of the characteristics in Edy Suharto's description. Therefore, this paper use the combination of the definitions employed by the City Government of Surakarta

---

[2] The original text is *"Pedagang Kaki Lima adalah orang yang melalukan usaha dagang dan atau jasa, ditempat umum baik menggunakan atau tidak menggunakan sesuatu, dalam melakukan kegiatan usaha dagang."*

[3] The original text is *"Tempat Pedagang Kaki Lima adalah tempat umum yaitu tepi-tepi jalan umum, trotoar dan lapangan serta tempat lain diatas Negara yang ditetapkan oleh Walikotamadya Kepala Daerah."*

and by Edy Suharto because this combination of characteristics makes it possible to comprehensively cover Solo's street vendor definitions and categories.

The state officials usually classified them into two categories: ordinary street vendors and *oprokan* vendors. The former are street vendors running businesses beyond a radius of 50 metres of the traditional markets and the latter running theirs within that radius. This distinction is not based on the rule of law but it is only based on the common agreement between the Street Vendor Management Office, the Market Management Office and the Regional Income Office in taking the daily fees from the street vendors; in practice, this rule is not strictly implemented. In this thesis both categories are defined as street vendors.

In assessing an informal sector, including street vending as a micro business activity within it, there are widely differing opinions on what should be the appropriate attitudes and policies toward this kind of economic sector. Some advocates of an informal sector tend to present it in positive tones as a form of popular development, a vital source of employment and income for the poor, a seedbed of local entrepreneurship, and a potent instrument in the campaign to combat poverty and social exclusion. The International Labour Office (ILO) and PREALC (Regional Program for Employment in Latin America and the Caribbean), for example, see the informal sector as a potential solution to unemployment in developing countries with an informal sector, even capable of being used as a collection of survival strategies especially for those whom undercapitalized and/or lacking in skills and with a small size enterprise; and it is even capable of absorbing employment if this weakness can be improved (Sethuraman, 1981: 31-32). Many scholars also suggest that the problem of employment and income distribution can be reduced by introducing and promoting an urban informal sector where its existence could not be denied (Otero, 1994: 177-97; Bromley, 1990: 328-49; Turnham, Salome and Schwartz, 1990; Rachbini and Hamid, 1994). Thus, from these points of view, the encouragement of the informal sector is seen as an important policy since the state is unable to provide adequate formal employment. There is evidence that the informal sector, including street vendors, represents a growing proportion of economic activity, particularly in less developed countries (LDC) but its growth has provoked a debate about its role with respect to economic development.

Many planners and government authorities, dismiss the informal sector as an anomaly, a source of disorder, and an obstacle to the development of a modern economy (Nwaka, 2005: 2). They condemn the slums, health risks, insecurity, and exploitation associated with the sector and hope that, like other transitory phases in the course of development, the informal sector will wither away with the time and economic progress. The informal sector including street ven-

dors even is accused of creating new social problems such as traffic jams, illegal settlers, residential slums, and a general deterioration of the urban environment, cleanliness and tidiness. It is also seen unfavourably as being unable to provide sufficient revenue for the government to cover its own cost to government so that it reduces the government capability to provide satisfactory public services (Franks, 1994: 99-100). Even those idealizing the informal sector recognize that it is at best a mixed blessing; informal sector activities are seen as not respecting the formal legal, social, health and quality standards, and as they do not pay taxes they violate the rules of fair competition. It is argued that the informal sector has run its course, is now oversupplied, and may just be replicating the disguised unemployment that prevails in rural areas (Nwaka, 2005).

These conflicting positions pose a difficult dilemma for planners and policy makers, and tend to reinforce the ambivalence and hostility of official attitudes towards the sector. If the informal sector succeeds because of its informality, and because the rules and regulations that are imposed are minimal, there is a doubt whether it makes sense to formalize and integrate it into the formal economy with laws, codes, and standards that could disrupt its activities and growth. If this sector is controlled firmly by the formal rule of law there will be doubt about the survival of the vulnerable and marginalized groups. Moreover, although the informal sector has often grown faster in many less developed countries than has the industrial/formal sector, it also creates a question of whether regulatory norms should be enforced at the risk of reducing these opportunities (Nwaka, 2005).

These doubts about the informal sector are parts of the long-term debates about the rural and urban paths to development, and doubts about whether urbanization in general is destructive or useful in the point of view of the government. It is argued that as conditions in developing cities improved, more and more people may be attracted to them. This may worsen the problems of unemployment and unpleasantness in the city as creating opportunities for formal employment in urban areas is a major problem for many governments, especially in developing countries.

Nwaka suggests that governance for the informal sector in an urban area, in particular the street vendors as concern in this paper, is important in terms of democratic values as it provides a chance for these stakeholders to be involved together with other non-state stakeholders and the state in the policy decision process.

2. Citizen Participation

Participation is an important dimension in governance. It is a taking part or involvement and it may include distinct and complex meanings. Nasikun's publi-

cation on "*Partisipasi Penduduk Miskin Dalam Pembangunan Pedesaan: Suatu Tijiauan Kritis*" based on the work of Ralph M Kramer on "*Participation of the Poor: Comparative Community Case Studies in the War on Poverty*" defined participation in three categories. The first category is where "participation requires the involvement of the poor citizen in the process of decision making which is represented by their representatives in coalition together with the government agents and non-government organizations, and other leaders of interest groups". The second category is where "participation means the poor citizen is placed as the main consumer of a development program and therefore their interests and advisory must be heard and considered by policy makers." The third category, what Nasikun calls 'radical participation', is where "the poor people are seen as the constituency of a development program which is politically "powerless" and "therefore they need stimulation and support". In this category of Nasikun's, their powerlessness is the factor causing them to remain in poverty and only through mobilization of them and their organization as an effective pressure group will make them able to influence the process of decision-making that has effects on their lives (Nasikun, 1990: 199-100). These categories are based in political ideologies of what activism is possible and desirable. Participatory approaches need to be used in such a way that people are empowered, rather than being used as window dressing by the powerful.

Nagel (1987: 1) defined participation more generally as "actions through which ordinary members of a political system influence or attempt to influence outcomes." According to Nagel, participation includes both psychological involvement and engaging in action. He also noted that although there might be engagement in an activity that does not depend on one's own preference it could not be regarded as participation. Such a condition is labeled by some writers as 'mobilization' or 'pseudo participation' which is assumed to be not real participation.

However, the definition used by Nagel did not specifically address the existence of powerless people as discussed in Nasikun's works, which state that they basically need support from others so that they will act in particular ways. In Nasikun's definition mobilization and the provision of support from others, such as non-government organizations, to the powerless people that is intended to make them aware of their own interest and encourage them to participate and give their voice based on their interest in the process of decision making, can be seen as 'participation.' Since this participation refers to broad forms of engagement, as discussed earlier, what will be defined as 'street vendor participation' in this study can take the forms of actions, protests, demonstrations, movements and any other action intended to influence the public decisions that affect their livelihood.

Participation of citizens in policy process in local governance may face a range of obstacles. For example, Gaventa and Valderrama, using reports of research in Latin America by Schonwalder, Tanzania by Mukandela, and Bolivia by Robinson, had identified six factors that constituted obstacles for the citizens in more participation: (1) control of power relations by the state, (2) level of citizen organization, (3) participatory skill, (4) political will, (5) level of participation, and (6) insufficient financial resources at the local level (Gaventa and Valderrama, 1999: 8-10).

They concluded that, although citizen participation "is about power and its exercise by different social actors in the spaces created for interaction between citizen and local authorities, control of the structure and the process for participation including defining spaces, actors, agenda and procedures, is usually in the hands of government institutions and can become a barrier for effective involvement of citizens" (Gaventa and Valderrama, 1999).

The study by Schonwalder, examining the degree to which decentralization offers a space for more democratic participation in Latin America, argued that "not enough attention was paid to the question of power." He showed that the "local elite, local governments and other actors operating on the local setting such as political parties and even some NGOs have often been prone to co-opt popular movements in order to further their own agenda" (Gaventa and Valderrama, 1999).

The study in Tanzania by Mukandela found that decisions over who should participate in the lowest local level decision making bodies, which approved requests before being forwarded to higher levels in the district, hindered their effectiveness in achieving high levels of popular participation in decision making. He underlined that although "the norms state that the majority of the positions are for community representatives, in practice decisions on who to invite can and were taken in some of the districts by government officers at high levels of the administration who invited influential people when important decisions were made" (Gaventa and Valderrama, 1999).

Control by the government over decisions about the nature and structure of participatory channels at the local levels also restricts the influence of traditional decision-making bodies in the local affairs. The study by Muzitwa et al in Zimbabwe showed that when the certain powers of traditional structures of decision-making were taken away and granted to village development and ward development committees, frictions between traditional leaders and democratically elected leaders emerged (Gaventa and Valderrama, 1999).

Drawing from Robinson's study in Bolivia, Gaventa and Valderrama summarized that in municipalities with strong union traditions people were able to

influence decisions over municipal spending while in those areas where people lacked organizational capacity political participation were generally low. They also concluded from the study by Herzer and Pirez in Argentina, Peru and other countries in Latin America, that "the existence of popular organizations with a certain presence at a local level and the occupation of political posts in the municipal government by parties or individuals who favour popular participation seem to be fundamental conditions under which citizens can influence decisions at the local level (Gaventa and Valderrama, 1999).

Citizen participation is also affected by the participatory skills of local authorities in planning processes. The study by Mukandala in Tanzania, for example, found the importance of educated officials in expressing the local people's needs. He concluded, "when the populist legislative members lack of education they have difficulties to push through their particular issues from the grassroots and have difficulty countering the technical presentations of the departmental technical staff." Another study by Manor and Crook also found the importance of planning skill and experience as important factors for participation. They argued that "when essential planning skills and experience of local authorities in the planning process are lacking, they become obstacles for more meaningful participation for disadvantaged groups" (Gaventa and Valderrama, 1999).

Another obstacle to more citizen participation is political will. Gaventa and Valderrama underline the importance of the availability of this as well as of opportunities of the local people. They argued that barriers to strengthening participation include "the absence of a strong and determined central authority in providing and enforcing opportunities for participation at the local level ... (and) 'the lack of political will by local government officers in enforcing the legislation that has been created for this purpose" (Gaventa and Valderrama, 1999).

Barriers for participation also may be higher in a society due to that society being firmly hierarchic (Gaffar, 1990: 64). In Javanese culture, societal hierarchy is still persistent. People are still usually classified as *wong gedhe* (people with high rank of status) and *wong cilik* (ordinary people, as well as poor people). This dichotomization resulted in self misconception among the officials who regard themselves in the former class and as benevolent to the ordinary people in the latter; people seen as being socially, economically and politically backward. Consequently, the ordinary people are considered and treated as requiring to be assisted. As their rewarding of the officials' or the government's benevolence, the ordinary people are expected to obey the officials' policy. This condition would then become a barrier for more participation by the 'ordinary people' (Gaffar, 1990).

Moreover, direct local citizen participation in decision-making may be affected by the extent to which "the individuals or groups or institutions that

strengthen them exist" and "the extent to which the financial resources of the local government to support them also are provided." Other factors, including the level of education, social and economic status, level of inequality and strong social hierarchy, also may impede participation (Gaffar, 1990).

The failures of local organizations set up to increase participation in policy formulation may have different causes. Montgomery classified major ones into three groups. The first group he described as 'apathy', the condition in which organizations fail because of the indifference of their members; the second group of failures are identified as 'internal colonization', which occurs when small groups of local notables seize control of a functioning organization and divert it to their own interests; the third is described as 'external colonization', the situation that arises when outside actors (usually governments) discover a well-run local organization and seek to use it for purpose incompatible with local priorities (Gaffar, 1990).

The participation barriers of the Solo street vendors in the policy process may take one or more of the forms discussed above, such as the internal barriers set by the street vendors themselves such as their status in the social economy and their Javanese culture of social hierarchy but also external barriers such as the bureaucracy hierarchy of Solo's city government, the political will of the government and the DPRD and a lack of support from individuals, groups or local institutions, including the leaders of location-based organizations and city-wide associations of Solo's street vendors and local NGOs.

Although participation can be conducted through "negotiation ... (and) protest" (Munro-Clark, 1992: 26) it does not always mean that all the demand, interest and thoughts of street vendors are accommodated, because "participation can result in political co-optation" (Cooke and Kothari, 2001: 25) as "authority-structures often attempted to use participation for their own purposes" (Munro-Clark, 1992); and thus, "it masks continued centralization in the name of decentralization" (Cooke, 2001: 7). In other words, although Solo now has a decentralized local government that may involve the street vendors in decision making, there is a probability that they or some elites of them can be co-opted by the city government to influence others. The decision making would then be basically still dominated by the city government or even be carried out through adopting a top-down approach which centralized the decision-making in the hands of the city government which represents the city government interests or agenda which may differ from what the street vendors demand, prefer and think. Moreover, the "acts and process of participation ... sharing knowledge, negotiating power relationships, political activism and so on –can both conceal and reinforce oppres-

sion and injustices in their varied manifestations" (Cooke, 2001: 13). This is to underline that as the city government has its own agendas or goals, the city government may use a variety of ways to materialize or achieve them, including oppression, eviction or other ways which are unjust, including using a divide and rule approach to achieve its own goals of its policy implementation.

3. Street Vendors, Migration and Citizen Forums

Street vendors, as part of the informal sector economy, had existed in Solo before 1997 but the number was relatively small; only several hundred. In the early years of growth, they were mostly local people but also many people from outside Solo migrated into the city. According to Lee, there are four main factors associated with migration: (1) factors associated with the area of origin, (2) factors associated with the area of destination, (3) intervening obstacles, and (4) personal factors (Lee, 1966: 47-57). Most migration has happened because of the economic motive to make the migrant's livelihood better.

The Municipal District of Solo city is within the Province of Central Java and surrounded by three other districts: Karanganyar (from the east around the north to the west), Boyolali (north), and Sukoharjo (from the east around the south to the west).

As mentioned previously, Solo is a centre of business and, after the pervasive economic crisis, started to recover from early 1999 (Rejeki, 2006). In 2000 the property sector of the primary market started to expand; and in 2002 and 2003 new centres of trading rose (Kompas, 13 April 2006). Solo's economic growth in 2005 reached 5.9 per cent which was much higher than those of its neighbouring Central Java large cities such as Jogyakarta and Semarang, respectively with only 5.45 per cent and 4.89 per cent (Kristianto, 2006). According to Adib Ajiputra, the chief executive of the Indonesian Real Estate of Surakarta, Solo also has attracted many people due to its economic potential (Kompas, 13 April 2006). It is also a city where many people run their activities during day and night. During the day the population of Solo is estimated to increase to one and a half million although its official residential population was only about half a million in 2005. Solo has many centres of people's activities including business and industrial centres, private and public offices, entertainment and tourism, and education, the latter including 2 state and 24 private universities (Profil Kota Surakarta, 2007). In these centres, there are many people from outside Solo working. Many other migrants from outside Solo are also looking for formal employment but not all of them are being absorbed due to their lack of skill required for this so many work in the informal sector. Moreover there are not such unlimited employment possibilities that anyone arriving can find formal employment, largely

irrespective of their education and skills. As an example related to this study, recent statistics show that Solo's street vendors include people with low, medium and high levels of education: 65 per cent reporting junior high school or less; 32 per cent senior high school and 3 per cent college or university (Kantor Pengelolaan PKL Kota Surakarta, 2003).

Many Solo residents are involved in activities during the evening and this leads to Solo being described as "a city that never sleeps" (Kristianto, 2006). The situation where there are many centres of activities during the day and night provides market opportunities for street vendors; and this market also encouraged migrants from the surrounding districts who had failed to get formal employment in Solo city as well as in their own area of origin due to their low education, to enter the city's informal sector and try to operate a business nearby. The number of street vendors has increased from year to year, compounded by the economic crises where the formal sector could not provide employment for them; and becoming a street vendor was the only option for their survival available with easy entry requirements. In 2001 there were officially 1,115 street vendors; in 2002 this had tripled to 3,390; in 2003 increased by another 13% to 3,834 (Handayani, 2006[a]: 9); and by mid-2005 by more than half again, to 5,817 (Bambang Santosa , 31 October 2005) . In a politically important change, at the end of 2003, about 74 per cent of the total street vendors were long term Solo residents (Kantor Pengelolaan PKL Kota Surakarta, 2003) but by mid-2005 the city government claimed that about 80 per cent were non-Solo residents; migrants from the surrounding Districts, who had entered this informal sector for economic reasons.[4]

The street vendors formed location-based groups in the different locations where they operated their business. Several of these also allied themselves into city-wide associations and some associations and individuals joined the *forum warga* (citizens' forum) SOMPIS (*Solidaritas Masyarakat Pinggiran Surakarta*, the Solidarity of Marginalized People of Surakarta). However, other vendors remained unorganized and did not join any of the city wide street vendor organizations or the *forum warga*.

The street vendors are one of several marginalized communities in Solo. Others include: domestic helpers, prostitutes, pedicab/trishaw drivers, parking

---

[4] Data was provided by Bambang Santosa, the head of the Street Vendor Management Office, 31 October 2005; See also Kantor Pengelolaan PKL Kota Surakarta, 2003, *ibid*, p.IV-4.
 The long-term Solo resident street vendors refers to local residents (Solo people, *warga Solo*) who have always lived in Solo and are working as street vendors, while those who have moved to Solo more recently are immigrants (*pendatang*), many of whom are not legal residents in Solo but have established street vendor businesses in the city. Solo officials acknowledge the difference between local Solo street vendors and immigrant street vendors.

attendants, street singers, beggars, masseur and disabled people (Handayani, 2006[a]: 9). Some of these marginalized communities had formed their *SOMPIS* association between 1996 and 2000. There was a common awareness among these communities that they all felt economically, socially and politically marginalized and that they needed an organization that could accommodate and promote their interests. In a congress on 25-26 July 2001 in the Yayasan Indonesia Surakarta (YIS, Surakarta Indonesian Foundation) Hall facilitated by a local NGO in Solo, the *Konsorsium Monitoring dan Pemberdayaan Institusi Publik* (Consortium for Public Institution Monitoring and Empowerment, or *KOMPIP*), they declared an organization named *Solidaritas Masyarakat Pingiran Surakarta* (the Solidarity of Marginalized People of Surakarta or *SOMPIS*). This starting association consisted of: (1) pedicab drivers (already organized into the Tritonadi Pedicab Drivers Association and the Surakarta Pedicab Drivers Association); (2) traditional market vendors (members of the Gede Market Association); (3) street singers (in the Committee of Indonesian Street Singers and the Union of Indonesian Street Singers); (4) parking attendants (in the Surakarta Parking Attendants Association), (5) workers (in Surakarta Workers Union Coalition); (6) disabled people; (7) slum residents, (8) hawkers, (9) collectors of used goods (*pemulung*), (10) two location-based groups of street vendors (the *Panca Manunggal* street vendors group, led by Edy Sarnyoto, and the *PKL 2000* street vendors group, led by Joko Sugiharto); and other elements.

The declared mission of the *SOMPIS* was making its members aware of their rights in social, economic and political affairs; with a declared vision of the materialization of the rights of the marginalized in moving towards a just and prosperous society which was participatory and democratic. Since its establishment the number of marginalized organizations affiliated to it has grown considerably but some of them have disintegrated. By 2006, there were only six associations of self-labeled marginalized people which had joined *SOMPIS* (Handayani, Suci, 2006a). There had also been a city-wide street vendors association that had been formed and joined in 2002, *Gundang Kalimnas*, which itself had 17 location-based street vendor associations as its members and was led by Edy Sarnyoto (who had previously led the location-based *Panca Manunggal* group), but disintegrated the following year.

As well as the failed *Gudang Kalimas* there have been other recent attempts to form city-wide associations of street vendors: the *Forum Komunikasi PKL se Surakarta* (usually abbreviated to *Forkom*) with Joko Suryadi as its leader and the *Pedang Kaliso*, led by Arisdono. The *Forkom* rose in 2003 as the *Gudang Kalimas* fell. But the *Forkom* also sank into inactivity after it had held a single large demonstration in April 2003 and tried to free itself from its relationship with *KOMPIP*

and *SOMPIS*. Its leaders moved to a position where they preferred to cooperate with the city government in the mayoral period of Slamet Suryanto and became involved in controlling the street vendors. After its first mass demonstration in February 2003, the *Forkom* had never organised any significant public activity in favour of the street vendors' participation until Mayor Slamet Suryanto was replaced by Mayor Joko Widodo in July 2005. Since then *Forkom* has organized demonstrations as responses to Joko Widodo's more restrictive policy on street vendors. This organization prefers to use a physical confrontational approach to express their dissatisfactions with the city government policy such as by public demonstrations, although it also more privately lobbied the power holders in protecting its members, who are loyal to their leader. The *Pedang Kaliso* rose in 2004 because the *Forkom* was seen as incapable of carrying out the street vendors' mandate for promoting their interests and acting as the public representative of street vendors of Solo city, particularly during Mayor Slamet Suryanto's period of office. However, there are many other street vendors who have not joined or will not join *SOMPIS*, *KOMPIP*, the *Pedang Kaliso* or the *Forkom*. They remain unorganized, either because of inactivity on their part or because they actively prefer to be independent. Some have no emotional or organizational ties with others, in order to avoid compulsory membership fees for the associations. Both the *Forkom* and the *Pedang Kaliso* have different approaches toward the city government's policy on street vendors. Although the *Forkom* is relatively strong because it cooperates in its actions with a local NGO, *YAPHI* (*Yayasan Pengabdian Hukum Indonesia*, Foundation for Indonesian Legal Awareness), and other activists and non-street-vendor associations and the *Pedang Kaliso* obtained support from the *SOMPIS* and *KOMPIP*, the Solo street vendors were fragmented.

There were many locations where street vendors were numerous: the area surrounding the Monument of 45 in Banjarsari (Monjari), the area surrounding Manahan Stadium, Slamet Riyadi Street, Urip Sumoharjo Street, General Sudirman Street, privatized Tipes squre, area surrounding Kasunanan Surakarta palace including Alun-alun Lor (north square of the royal palace) and that of the traditional market named *Cinderamata* market, other areas closing to traditional markets, and other streets. In these trading areas they formed location-based groups. In one location usually there were more than one group. Although in public forum city government often declared that sreet vendors were local asset that should be empowered, it mostly saw the street vendors as sources of messiness, slums and city disturbance for city transportation. These assessments had been part of its reason to govern them by relocating, providing shelter or just removing them.

4. Street Vendor Participation in Policy Formulation and Decision Making Processes

As the numerous street vendors both long-term Solo residents and migrant occupied many public spaces in Solo and constructed permanent or semi-permanent constructions, the city government defines them as a public problem, perceiving them as the cause of a deterioration of the Solo Beautiful City. According to Anderson (1990: 79), "a public problem can be formally defined as a condition or situation that produces needs or dissatisfactions on the part of people for which relief or redress is sought by persons other than those directly affected; and there is always the possibility that a problem will be defined differently by those directly affected than by others," Anderson also pointed out the obvious fact that "problems are often defined differently by individuals and groups holding varying interest and values; while problems may be persistent, how they are defined may change over time as society changes." In addition, as Pal argues, "problem definitions are inextricably bound to policy goals, which are what the policy is trying to achieve, its aim and its direction. A policy's goals are made specific by the problems the policy identifies; and policy makers are often sensitized or prepared to recognize a certain problem because of pre-existing goals they may have." (Pal, 1987: 12). When government positively takes action on the problem on the agenda, thereby development of a solution for the problem occurs, and policy formulation takes place (Levine, Peters & Thompson, 1990: 86). Policy formulation is basically the development of specific instruments to achieve goals (ibid).

In an advanced democratic country, this involves highly political processes in which many interest groups seek to get legislation agreed to that is advantageous to their groups (Greene, 2005: 281), in which the development of relevant and acceptable proposed series of actions for dealing with the public problem take place. In this formulation process; the two main questions generally raised are "how are alternatives for dealing with the problem developed and who participates in the process of policy formulation" (Anderson, 1990: 35). The answer to the first question usually is represented in the development of instruments to overcome the perceived problem; and the actors who are involved in the formulation of policy in the local government could include a number of players such as interest groups, local representatives in an elected legislature, the mayor of the municipality, local government agencies and other non-state stakeholders such as local residents, developers, investors, public transport drivers, street vendors and any other road user. Despite this, for the basis for defining the problem of Solo's street vendors and to achieve the policy goals it is not enough for the city government (Mayor and the DPRD) to merely take account of the symptoms and base

its response on its own perspective on street vendors as the sources of the city deterioration. Nor is it appropriate to simply act in its own interest, nor be dependent on the work of a team it has hired as they may simply perform whatever the city government orders because they are subject to it. The local authority should be required to explore both long-term Solo resident street vendors and immigrant street vendors ideas, interests, demands and preferences or even to involve them or at least their valid representative in a participation as the basis for deciding or formulating policy. This would provide for more representing of the street vendors' aspirations without undermining other stakeholders' interests, provide for more adequate consideration of the causes of their becoming street vendors, including why so many have migrated to Solo to become street vendors. As Anderson argues, it is very important to consider the "what causes of conditions" in defining a problem as the basis for formulating policy (Anderson, 1990: 79).

In other words, given the involvement of various actors including the state and other non-state stakeholders, with Solo's street vendors, or at least their representatives, being involved in the policy formulation, a wider range of information and different points of view can be obtained so that a more appropriate solution can be developed. Thus, a fundamental difficulty in policy formulation, which, as Levine argues, is "the limited information so that policy makers have little guidance in the selection of appropriate responses... could be minimized." (Levine, Peters, & Thompson, 1990: 86). This could be achieved if the street vendors or at least their valid representatives by the city government and it is willing to explore honestly and transparently into their interests, preferences, demands and ideas, considering and taking them into account in formulating its policy.

5. Administrative Organization and Elements for Policy Implementation Effectiveness

After the process of policy formulation to solve the problem has been adopted, the public policy begins. The public policy the city government makes may take forms of relocation, the provisions of permanent or portable shelters/tents, push carts or just cleaning up the street vendors on the street to overcome the city problem that the city government has perceived. However, before the policy is implemented the city government forms an administrative organization which may deal with "structure, operating styles, political support, expertness, and policy orientation" to carry the public policy into effect (Anderson, 1990: 79). Smith (2005: 5) points out that to function effectively, policy implementation needs rules of the game, structures, a clear mission, goals, functions, administration, finance, information-management, and human resources. This suggest

that before the public policy is implemented the city government of Solo needed to form an administrative organization with such as an organizational structure, human resources, financial resources, teamwork, rules of the game and clear goals to make it effective. This suggests that there is no guarantee that the policy implementation will successful due to several factors such as a lack of resources, a program outside the street vendors' interest, mismanagement leading to corruption, financial shortages, competing goals, and exclusion of the affected street vendors from the decision making process.

Wallis (1989: 130) has pointed out that "local government and sub-national administrative units in most developing countries lack both the resources and the authorities to raise sufficient revenue to carry out the tasks transferred from the centre." Wallis further argues that inadequacy of revenue is the major constraint hindering effective local government in many developing countries; and even when the sources of revenue are directly accessible it is difficult for local government to provide the services expected because of (1) political pressure that led to the materialization of a program that is beyond the real needs of the local people and so ambitious that it wastes money, and (2) financial mismanagement which leads to corruption practices; and even in many cases, "local government has nearly reached the bankruptcy stage, becoming dependent on central government support to survive." In addition, the goals sometimes are not stated clearly and specifically. Instead, it usually "couched in more general terms than the problems with which they are associated...because the goals correspond not to single policy problems but to clusters of problems" (Pal, 1987 : 13). The goals of policy implementation on street vendors also correspond to a cluster of problems. The preamble of the Local Law 8/1995 stated:

> "...the national development...is...development spread through the whole population...materially as well as spiritually...including the street vendors' need to have guarantees including protection, guidance so that they are successful and their welfare increases." [5]

Moreover, in some of articles of that Local Law, the goals implicitly include the attempts to increase the locally raised revenue (*Pendapatan Asli Daerah, PAD*) for the city government and 'to keep Solo city beautiful.' Furthermore, as Wallis (1989: 24) argues, that "the policy implementation and programmes often fail because the people most affected, those living within the local area, are not allowed to play a part in deciding how the various activities should be carried out.' Moreover, there is an ethical aspect linking to issues of human rights and democracy that local people should have adequate opportunities to be involved in public affairs policy processes, particularly where "they are directly affected by what-

ever decisions are made and implemented." These suggest that although the administrative organization had been formed and requirements for implementation effectiveness, as Smith argues above, had been provided by the city government, any public policy the Solo government implements on street vendors' issues that directly affect them in any location where they run their business requires the government to explore, understand and take into account their ideas.

6. Policy Implementation: Outcome, Goals, Accountability and Transparency

The implementation of city government policies refers to "a process consisting of a series of governmental decisions and actions attempting to turn an already determined mandate into reality; how change occurs or how change may be induced; how organizations outside and inside the political system conduct their affairs and interact with one another; what motivates them to act in the way they do or act differently" (Greene, 2005: 286). It also involves "a series of (city) governmental decision and actions to accomplish outcomes which are the results of the programs. Outcomes of these policies can be positive and negative; positive outcomes are those "positively appropriate to the realization of the objective" (ibid). In the context of the implementation of a policy on Solo's street vendors, these positive outcomes may include the increase of street vendors' income, the street vendors keeping Solo beautiful, and their obeying the rules to pay the daily fees. Negative outcomes may take forms of marginalization, decreases in income, loss of occupation, being abused, and police or state official or thug pressures.

According to Lane (1993: 102), "if these outcomes are matching with the objective, then there will be successful implementation; and if the set of outcomes is related to the set of objectives in such a way that to each objective there is a corresponding outcome or vice versa relationships, then we have policy accomplishment par preference". In real practice, however, objectives do not always match with their outcomes, and there are outcomes that did not have objectives. Lane suggest that outcomes should be interpreted in terms of the objectives; one objective may be to a certain extent fulfilled by several different outcomes, or it may be satisfied by one outcome but being in conflict with another. However, according to Lane, whether a policy goal has been accomplished or not depends on how the goal and the outcomes are perceived by the stakeholders or actors involved in the implementation process. Lane argues that "whether there is policy success or policy failure depends on how the actors perceive the environment and judge the implementability of the policy or the means to be implemented." Thus, what is successful implementation to one group may be a failure

to another because different stakeholders perceive the ends, the means and the outcomes differently. These suggest that to understand whether the policy has achieved its goals or not it must be based on the perception of every stakeholder within city government and those who are outside the line of hierarchy of it including street vendors, local residents and any other non-state stakeholder. Street vendors may perceive that the policy implementation is successful if it improves their livelihood although other city government's objectives are not achieved. On the other hand, they will perceive the policy implementation as unsuccessful if it does not provide any benefit to them although the city could be keep clean and beautiful and the locally raised revenue for the city government increases.

As the city government as well as the street vendors themselves may implement the public policy on Solo's street vendors and the government deals with "the extent to which objectives and outcomes match" then it needs to assess "accountability" (Lane, 1993: 102). Lane also suggests that "the fact that objectives sometimes do not find their outcomes or that outcomes sometimes cannot find their objectives does not imply that accountability is impossible. Implementation according to this aspect, is simply the match between objectives and outcomes, perfect implementation being perfect match as it were." He underlined that "it is always valid to find the extent to which objectives of this policy have been materialized and the degree to which outcomes have come about that work in contradiction to the objectives. This is the basis for judging the accountability of implementers and the responsibility of politicians and officials" (1993: 13).

In the context of governance of Solo's street vendors, however, policy implementation does not always adopt an outcome solely to measure the objective achievement but it also adopts the process of producing the outcome by the government together with any other stakeholder to measure its accountability (Pierre and Peters, 2000: 30). As Colebatch (2004: 54) argued, implementation can be seen as

> "...an exercise in collective negotiation that is that the focus shift from the desired outcome to process and people through which it would be accomplished. It recognizes that policy is an on-going process, and that participants have their own agenda and therefore their own distinct perspective on any policy issues."

This suggests that the accomplishment of a policy on participation with street vendors is both a means and an end to achieve effective use of resources so that corruption could be minimized. As Robert Klitgaard hypothesized, "corruption is more likely to occur in an environment where officials monopolize the controls over state resources, while at the same time the mechanisms for holding these officials accountable for their actions are weak or non-existent" (Colebach,

2004: 54). The corruption, as it may happen in the process of achieving the objectives of a policy on the Solo's street vendors, is "a symptom of poor governance" (Sumarto, Suryahadi and Arifianto, 2004: 4).

7. Local Law on Governance of Street Vendors: Consistency and Discretion

The existence of formal law that encompasses both well-defined rights and duties of city government and of Solo's street vendors as well as mechanisms for enforcing them and settling disputes in an impartial manner is important. To achieve accountability the implementation of this law must be predictable in the sense that it must be consistent and fair in application (ADB, 2006). In other words, the obligation of the street vendors and the rights they have to receive must be balanced. However, as Scott (1998: 6) argues,

> "Formal order to some considerable degree is parasitic on informal processes...formal schematic design or planned for social order may ignore essential features of any real condition...(thus by simply going along with the rules strictly)... the workforce can practically stop the progress of improvement and creativity."

Thus, formal regulation, which is intended to ensure that street vendors obey the rule of law, must be accompanied by an awareness by the government that it is not always completely suitable for current situations. Also, there is a possibility that a "top down authoritarian (approach) simply drives resistance underground ... (and) tells them what to do instead of encouraging them to work out what to do by themselves" (Edgar, 2001: 193). Moreover, formal law is not always the most effective solution. As Edgar argues, "effective solutions never come from separate programs or services tacking the problem in isolation from the surrounding community. They come from integrated, wrap-around, linked efforts across a whole range of community agencies aimed at improving the quality of life and support." (Edgar, 2001: xv-xvi). In dealing with the matter of Solo's street vendors, the Surakarta Municipality issued a Local Law, *Perda (Peraturan Daerah) 8/ 1995* on the *Penataan dan Pembinaan Pedagang Kaki Lima* (Regulation and Guidance of Street Vendors). This *Perda* is an example of the type of public policies which are called 'protective regulatory'; it is "intended to protect the public by setting conditions under which private activities may be conducted; conditions that are believed to be damaging are forbidden; activities that are beneficial are required; ... Such a policy requires a condition where "a sector of society conforms to the general law." It is formed in a highly political process through policy making involving special interest groups and lobbying efforts and any other stakeholders, depending on the political system (Greene, 2005: 274).

Six years later, the Local Law 8/1995 was followed by the specific legal prescriptions for its implementation, the Mayoral Decree 2/2001 on the *Pedoman Pelaksanaan Peraturan Daerah Kotamadya Daerah Tingkat II Surakarta Nomor 8 tahun 1995 Tentang Penataan dan Pembinaan Pedagang kaki Lima*. The latter is more detailed, pragmatic and operational than the former, and some stipulations in the basic Law are not stated in the implementing Decree.

The Local Law and Mayoral Decree provide extremely detailed requirements for the operation of Solo street vendors' businesses: places and manner of activities; licensing; responsibilities for cleanliness and orderliness; fees; fines and other sanctions; and, in far fewer and in lesser detail, city government responsibilities for assisting the development of street traders' activities and welfare. Particular new or existing sections of the Solo city government bureaucracy are nominated as having responsibility and/or authority for particular elements of the regulation and development of the street vendors. Despite this, this rule of law is only a "small part of law as an integral system in which no official could interpret the rule of law arbitrarily" (Ali, 2006). Interpretation of the rule of law "should not only be testified by and conform to the existing norms and the principles of law prevailing universally" such as Universal law of Human Rights and "nationally" such as the Indonesian Constitution (UUD 1945), the Indonesia Law No. 39/1999 Concerning Human Rights but also "should not contradict the goal of law: justice, utility and legal certainty" (*Fajar*, 12 April 2006). These suggest that in its implementation, no individual is to be treated unfairly due to his or her type of business, personal links with the local residents, the capacity to lobby the power holders, personal relationship with the mayor, or individual interests of the power holder or decision maker. For example, all street vendors are to be treated justly and consistently according to the existing local law. As Gudstav Radbruch (cited in Ali) argues, "as the universal goals of law including justice, utility and certainty are contradicting each other, the justice must be the most prioritized to be implemented" (*Fajar*, 12 April 2006). Moreover, as Haryatmoko underlined, "unequal treatment is only justified if the law takes side to those who become the most disadvantaged or the victim," (*Kompas*, 10 July 2001) because the goal of law is to achieve "social justice" (MD, 1999: 151) and provide "the protection for human rights." (Petrova, 2002: 16). This suggests that discretion in the implementation of the Local Law and Mayoral Decree is justifiable as far as it is intended to achieve justice for those who are the most disadvantaged as the result of the implementation of the rule of law. It also means that such discretions can be made in particular "to respond the high rule rigidity because too rigid an adherence to rules and rule-guided procedures may give rise to inflexibility, insensitivity to differing needs and circumstances and impersonal treatment" (Adler and

Asquith, 1993: 401), however, "excessive discretion may lead to arbitrariness, inequality and dependency and fail to meet the most basic requirements of justice."

Regional Development, Marginalization, Social Justice and Human Rights

It has been argued by Turner and Hulme that "governance correlates closely with economic development," (Turner and Hulme, 1997: 236) with development seen as "progress towards a complex of welfare goals such as the elimination of poverty, the provision of employment, the reduction of inequality and the guarantee of human rights" (ibid, 1997: 6).

Similarly, the governance of Solo's street vendors is closely related to the Solo development as mandated in the preamble of the Local Law 8/1995 that the development of the Surakarta Municipality is part of the National Development where it is the development of all human beings and society which include the material and spiritual" and "the city government recognizes that the informal sector including the street vendors is one of the potentials of National Development" (Pemerintah Kotamadya Daerah Tingkat II, 1995). Due to its potential, the Solo government recognizes that "the city government needs to provide protection, legal certainty, guidance and regulation in running their business for the street vendors so that their welfare improves" (ibid).

However, the governance of Solo's street vendors where the city government implemented the policy in the context of Solo development, does not always provide positive outcomes or "benefits" but may bring about negative results or "produces losses and generates value conflicts" (Goulet, D., 1992: 470).

The United Nations Development Program (UNDP) asserted that the governance in developing countries is intended to encourage them to achieve their developmental goals where they may involve other non-state stakeholders, such as the private sector and local residents or those who may be affected by the development, in participation in the decision-making process (UNDP, 1997: 4-5. Given the affected people or local residents' participation in this decision-making process it could "attain sustainable human development" (ibid). This suggests that although governance of Solo street vendors in the context of Solo's development may involve the formal business sector or other non-government elite stakeholder, such as an aristocratic family, it should place more emphasis on human development where the city government provides access or alternatives to make the street vendors survive and be better off rather than privileging elite stakeholders for their own benefits at the expense of a marginalization of street vendors from their site of operation or their occupation without providing the best alternative for their sustainable livelihood.

According to Schaffer and Smith, marginalization implies the issue of human rights (Schaffer, and Smith, 2004: 2). These authors of *Human Right and Narrated Lives: the Ethics of Recognition*, however, underline that whether or not storytelling in the field of human rights results in the extension of human justice, dignity, and freedom depends on the willingness of those addressed to hear the stories and to take responsibility for recognition of others and their claim (ibid, 2004: 5). Marginalization happens because "the perspectives, ideology, culture, interests and preferences of the powerful group dominate those of the weak group." (Suparno, et al., 2005: 24). Both society-at-large and government sometimes may be involved in the process of marginalization through its policy (ibid), 2005: 136-7). As the street vendors have families, children and old parents, who they have to look after, the marginalization of the street vendors that may happen deals with issues of human rights. Sen's publication on *Development as Freedom* which proposed a "protective security" and Nussabaum's on *Woman and Human Development* which propose a "capability approach" are relevant to overcoming these problems, at least for a city government in deciding its policy options.

Regarding the governance of Solo's street vendors in the context of Solo's development which may bring about unjust practices and marginalization, Nussabaum's *Woman and Human Development* provides an important argument on human rights and social justice issues where rights and justice, including those of women and children, lie in the person's capability (Nussabaum, 2000: 5). She argues that "in short, thinking in terms of capability gives us a benchmark as we think about what it is to secure a right to someone (ibid 2000: 98)."

Both Sen and Nussabaum see human rights and questions of social justice focusing on a "capability approach"; in which it "can be either on the *realized* functionings (what a person is actually able to do) or on the capability set of alternative she has (her real opportunities)" (Sen, 1999: 75; Nussabaum, 2000: 98; Nussabaum, 2002: 1).

9. Social Capital and Governance of Street Vendors

Street vendors require making networks for their survival. Pellini and Ayress' discussion paper on *Social Capital and Village Governance Experiences with Village Networks* underlines the importance of social capital in governance. They argue that "in order to build a local governance and local development model that is culturally appropriate and therefore legitimate, the model should support existing social capital, strengthening relationship between group and association at the community level, and between these groups and the commune" (Pellini and Ayers, 2005: 25). This argument suggests that "social capital can be used to improve governance" of street vendors (Grafton, 2005: 754).

Social capital is "an all-encompassing term for the norms and the social networks that facilitate co-operation among individual and between groups of individual" (ibid). It is "the norms and networks that enable people to act collectively" (Woolcock and Narayan, 2000: 226). Social capital can be divided into three kinds, "bonding social capital," "bridging social capital" and "linking social capital." (Putnam, 2000; Woolcock, 2001, Narayan, 1999). Bonding social capital involves "linkages or strong ties within groups of like-minded individuals," (Grafton, 2005: 756) that often "correspond to denser and more localized networks." In this kind of social capital, "behavior, rules and expectations are known and met by people who shares values, ideas and relationship" (URL:http://www.communitybuilders.nsw.gov.au/download/social_capital.pdf). Because this kind of social capital can exist in social groups such as aristocratic family, street vendors associations, formal business groups and informal security or thugs that operate in the trading areas of street vendors "it can be elitist, negative and destructive if the rules and networks are used to exclude others, those who do not conform." (Beugelsdijk and Smulders, 2002: 5). Therefore, "it can be a resistance to change and attitude of preserving the status quo" but "it may have positive effects for the members belonging to this closed social group or networks." Strong ties are particularly useful for informal trading context because they are associated with trust and cooperation that in turn can encourage individual street trader to examine trading rules and sustainable trading practices for his or her survival, build sense of solidarity and protect his or her friends.

Bridging Social capital is concerned with linkages across similar, but different, groups or social networks (Putnam, 2000; Grafton, 2005). Although these bonds of connectedness "are often much weaker between heterogeneous groups than within a relatively homogenous group" (Grafton, 2005: 756) they "can be very important as they provide a critical mechanism for the diffusion of knowledge and innovation." In governance of street vendor, bridging social capital may also play a crucial role in strengthening and improving cooperation among location based groups, city wide associations and between location-based groups and city wide associations of street vendors and in conflict resolution across competing informal trading mechanism and interests.

Linking social capital refers to not only "relationships between individuals and groups in different social strata in hierarchy where power, social status and wealth are accessed by different groups" (Harper, 2001: 11) but also "the capacity to leverage resources, ideas and information from formal institution beyond the community." For example, links between street vendors and other institution such as formal business group, leading aristocratic family, city government, local NGO, local residents and other social groups of grassroots. Linking social capital

may include "involvement and inclusion, and work towards institutional change to empower members of community (through decision making, representation and participation, education and training, mentoring and support networks)" (Graftton, 2005: 756). Such links are "required" if the governance of street vendors is "to be effectively shared." This links also can "create the condition and spaces that facilitate collective action" of street vendors and other institutions of different social strata (Uphoff, 2000: 215-251; Pellini and Ayress, 2005: 8). However, as street vendors may have been living in exclusion from public decision making in which powerful groups may use their decision to regulate or control them and thus affect their livelihood, developing and strengthening linking by individual or groups of street vendors across different groups and networks at different hierarchies of the powerful groups and other social groups to support them is useful for their survival.

CONCLUSION
Governance of Solo's street vendors may use old paradigm which perceives street vendors negatively so that the way the city government treats them used top down approach in decision making that negate street vendors to participate in it. They are not only controlled by the city government but also any other elites that affect their lives.

The above discussions suggest that creating networks is essential for survival as a Solo street trader. The more links people have the more likely they are to be able to survive. Those who are excluded and those who have few networks in Solo are the most vulnerable.

REFERENCE
ADB Asian Development Bank. "Elements of Governance", URL:http//www.adb.org/governance/gov elements.asp [Accessed 8 June 2006].

Acemoglu, Daron; Robinson, James & Thierry, 2003, "Verdier, Kleptocracy and Divide-and-Rule: A Model of Personal Rule", paper Presented the *Marshall Lecture at the European, Economic Association's Annual Meetings* in Stockholm, August, 24th.

Adler, Michael and Asquith, Stewart, 1993, 'Discretion and Power', in *the Policy Process, A Reader*, Michael Hill (ed.), Harvester Wheatsheaf, New York.

Ali, Achmad, 2006, "Hukum Bukan Hanya Aturan Hukum", *Fajar,* 12 April URL:http://www.fajar.co.id/kolom/nwes.php?newsaid [Accessed 26 February 2007],

Anderson, James E., 1990, *Public Policy Making An Introduction, 2nd ed.*. Houghton Mifflin Company, Boston.

Beugelsdijk, Sjoerd and Smulders, Sjak, 2002, *Bridging and Bonding Social Capital: Which Type is good for Economic Growth?* Center/Faculty of Economics, Tilburg University, LE Tilburg.

Brinkerhoff, Derick W. and Crosby, Benjamin L., 2002, *Managing Policy Reform, Concepts and Tools for Decision Makers in Developing and Transitioning Countries*, Kumarin Press, Bloomfield.

Bromley, R, 1990, "A New Path to Development? The Significance and Impact of Hernando de Soto's ideas on Underdevelopment, Production and Reproduction", *Economic Geography*, (66): 328-49.

Colebatch, H. K., 2004, *Concepts in the Social Sciences, Policy, 2nd ed.* Open University Press, Buckingham.

Cooke, Bill and Kothari, Uma, 2001, "The Case for Participation as Tyranny", in *Participation: The New Tyranny*, Bill Cooke and Uma Kothari (eds.), Zed Books, London, p.6; See also Munro-Clark, 1992.

Davis, Glyn, and Keating Michael, 2000, *The Future of Governance*, Allen & Unwin, St Leonards NSW Australia.

Denhardt, Janet V. and Denhardt, Robert B., 2003, *The New Public Service, Serving Not Steering*, M.E. Shape, New York.

Edgar, Don, 2001, *The Patchwork Nation, Re-thinking Government – Re-building Community*, Harper Collins Publishers, Sydney.

Franks, J.R., 1994, "Macroeconomic Policy and the Informal Sector", in *Contrapunto: The Informal Sector Debate in Latin America*, C.A. Rakowski (ed.), State University of New York Press, New York.

Gaffar, Affan, 1990, "Pengembangan Sumber Daya Manusia Pedesaan Sebagai Partisipasi Pembangunan", in *Beberapa Aspek Pembangunan Orde Baru, Esei-Esei Dari Fisipol Bulaksumur*, Akhmad Zaini Abar (ed.), Ramadhani, Solo.

Gaventa, John and Valderrama, Camilo, 1999, "Participation, Citizenship and Local Governance", Background note prepared for workshop on '*Strengthening participation in local governance*' Institute of Development Studies, June 21-24.

Goulet, D., 1992, 'Development: Creator and Destroyer of Values', *World Development*, 20(3).

Grafton, R. Quentin, 2005, "Social Capital and Fisheries Governance," *Ocean & Coastal Management*, 48.

Greene, Jeffrey D., 2005, *Public Administration in the New Century, A Concise Introduction*, Thomson Wadsworth, Belmont.