
Prostitute Praising Represented by Male Novelists in Post-1998 Religious Society

Lelu Dina Apristia

Universitas Negeri Semarang
Sekaran, Gunung Pati, Semarang, Jawa Tengah, 50229
Email: leludinaapristia@mail.unnes.ac.id

ABSTRACT

Prostitute praising is represented by Remy Sylado in novel titled *Ca-Bau-Kan: Hanya Sebuah Dosa* (1999) and Arswendo Atmowiloto in novel titled *Dewi Kawi* (2008). Prostitute praising in the novels written by males in religious society in the midst of discourse about freedom of expression flowing in post-1998 era in Indonesia becomes problem of this research. Regarding the problem, this research aims to identify: (1) how prostitute praising is represented by males in their novel, (2) why male novelists produce such representations by applying Stuart Hall's representation theory in relation to production of meaning through language and production of knowledge through discourse. The theory application reveals that male novelists represent prostitute praising in private and public domain which are mixed up and that there is relation between male and female in the domains siding with male as constructed by post-1998 discursive formation involving the state and religions to uphold masculine domination.

Keywords: *prostitute praising, male novelists, Stuart Hall's representation, post-1998 discursive formation, masculine domination*

INTRODUCTION

Literary work is created in context. Stuart Hall (1990:222) states, "We all write and speak from a particular place and time, from a history and a culture which is specific. What we say is always 'in context', positioned." Referring to Michel Foucault, Hall (1997: 44) explains, "By 'discourse', Foucault meant 'a group of statements which provide a language for talking about—a way of representing the knowledge about—a particular topic at a particular historical moment.'" Understanding meaning through language and knowledge through discourse contained in literary work requires understanding a particular place where and time when literary work is produced.

One of literary works produced in Indonesia in post-1998 era is novel. Post-1998 era is the one right after Soeharto gave up his position as President of Republic of Indonesia on May 21, 1998 which means

end of repression lasting for 32 years (Heryanto, 2012; Sudirman, 2014: 450). The era encouraged contemporary artists, including novelists, to add reform theme into their works (Jones, 2015: 212-213). Novel itself is story which is easy to understand (Forster, 2022: 18) and loved by humans since childhood (Sumardjo, 1999: 11). Hence, post-1998 novels are potentially stories about end of repression reflecting freedom of expression easily understood by society in Indonesia.

Aside from discourse about freedom of expression that has been flowing in post-1998 era, society in Indonesia is surrounded by discourse about religions. The importance of religion in relation to the perception of God (Talbot, 2019) is reflected in Indonesian ideology named *Pancasila* (Suryadinata, 2015: 144), especially in the first principle of *Pancasila*

on belief in God (Triandafyllidou & Magazzini (eds.), 2021). When *Pancasila* was formed in Old-Order era (1945-1966), there were five official religions (Munaf, 2016: 5). However, in post-1998 era, Indonesia has had six official religions consisting of Islam, Protestantism, Catholicism, Hinduism, Buddhism and Confucianism for the latest one was acknowledged by the state issued in *Surat Keputusan Presiden Nomor 6 Tahun 2000* or Presidential Decree Number 6 in 2000 (Jones, 2015: 211). Struggling to avoid sin and to attain virtue (Ngong, 2013: 4), each societal member has to include one of the official religions in her or his identity card. With that being said, the religions contain knowledge that entails constraint, regulation, the disciplining or practices and thus is linked to power (Hall, 1997: 49). Further, the state needs to be kind, wise and better to persuade majority of society (Rothbard, 2018: 21, 23) and thus legitimates rules in regard to religions. If discursive formation is what Foucault (Foucault, 2008: 36) called as the interplay of the rules that make possible the appearance of objects during a given period of time, post-1998 discursive formation is occupied by the state and religions that construct freedom of expression which is still moral.

Considering the power of religion, the state meets the needs of religious followers in order to keep and expand its power. As quota of females to be legislative candidates increases along the success of democracy (Robinson, 2018: 64) which represents more females participating in public domain or getting liberation which males try to thwart because females become dangerous competitors (Beauvoir, 2011: 11-12), acts of violence by radical Islamic groups which develop to target females also increase under the pretext of controlling female sexuality (Robinson, 2018: 81). Gradually, female sexuality control is agreed by non-radical Islamic groups, non-Islamic or other religious groups and secular ones (Robinson, 2018: 73-74), meaning by majority of society in Indonesia.

At the central government level, female sexuality control was contained in *Rancangan Undang-Undang Antipornografi dan Pornoaksi* or Anti-Pornography and Porn Action Bill prohibiting pornography and porn actions including kissing, being hand in hand, hugging and exposing sensitive body parts such as breasts, thighs, belly, shoulders and legs which sparked protests from a number of females groups and civic freedom supporters viewing the bill as covert Islamization and attack on the freedom of

cultural expression or undemocratic bill for pluralistic society in Indonesia (Robinson, 2018; Suryakusuma, 2012: 416). The protests were responded by mass demonstrations in Jakarta and other big cities in 2006 supported by many Islamic groups (Suryakusuma, 2012: 418). At the local government level, female sexuality control was contained in *Peraturan Daerah* or Local Government Regulation prohibiting prostitution, requiring females to wear closed clothes and enforcing curfew which was forced by vigilante (Robinson, 2018; Suryakusuma, 2012: 414, 421). Being pressured through mass demonstrations and vigilante actions by the groups, the state led by President Susilo Bambang Yudhoyono validated the latest version of *Rancangan Undang-Undang Antipornografi dan Pornoaksi* or Anti-Pornography and Porn Action Bill to be *Undang-Undang Pornografi* or Pornography Law on October 30, 2008 prohibiting obscenity or sexual exploitation violating norms of decency fixed in society in the forms of pictures, sound, oral or written words, body moves and other forms of message through various communication media and/or performance in public and legitimized *Peraturan Daerah* or Local Government Regulation under the pretext of keeping nation morality (Suryakusuma, 2012: 415, 418, 421). Power can be kept and expanded by the state by gaining support of the majority of people (Rothbard, 2018: 23), especially in Indonesia as the most populous Muslim country in the world for more than 86% Indonesians are Islamic followers (Bubandt, 2016; Kumoro, 2009: 144). Accordingly, the needs of many religious groups representing majority of Indonesians are met, acts of violence are resolved, females can participate in public domain controllably for their freedom of expression is controlled, and aside from his hesitant, procrastinating, and consultative style of government (Jones, 2015: 211), President Susilo Bambang Yudhoyono led Indonesia in two periods (2004-2014) which can be said the longest in post-1998 era.

As Hall (Hall, 1997: 56) states that individuals have identified with those positions which the discourse constructs and subjected themselves to its rules, Remy Sylado and Arswendo Atmowiloto surrounded by post-1998 discursive formation or what Foucault called regime of truth are potentially subjected to its truth which is freedom of expression keeping nation morality. Nevertheless, Sylado in *Ca-Bau-Kan: Hanya Sebuah Dosa* (1999) narrates female

through a character named Tinung as *ca-bau-kan* that means prostitute (Hidayana, 2013: 60) declared by male through a character named Tan Peng Liang as the one who inspires him to achieve his goals and to perfect his masculinity. Atmowiloto in *Dewi Kawi* (Atmowiloto, 2008) narrates female through a character named Kawi as prostitute inspiring male through a character named Eling until he is successful, so Eling remembers her as Dewi Kawi that means Goddess Kawi. Both Sylado and Atmowiloto represent praising to prostitute.

Regarding prostitute praising, Christine Whyte (Whyte, 2013: 125) through her paper titled "*Praise be, Prostitutes as the Women We Are not.*" *White Slavery and Human Trafficking—an Intersectional Analysis* shows that anything new about prostitution is very foolish for metaphors and images of prostitutes are used to be indifferent to the sufferings and distress of the victims of prostitution; to be little women. She states that the construction of the white, innocent victim of prostitution so central to the 'white slavery' in many ways in the US context shaped the construction and understanding of contemporary human trafficking. Anise K. Strong (Strong, 2016: 60) shows that good little prostitute story blurs the lines between dominant and subordinate partners. However, it is basically used to reinforce existing social hierarchies for the benefit of the elite male, especially in the Roman context. In other words, prostitute praising studied by Whyte and Strong is not the one narrated by male novelists in Indonesia in post-1998 era.

For Remy Sylado and Arswendo Atmowiloto are well-known novelists (Hariwijaya, 2017; Roosa & Ratih, 2008: 195), their novels can be liked by a lot of people (Abi, 2020: 68), including the ones that contain praising for prostitute viewed as immoral or fallen, sinful female (Anderson, 2017: 343). Therefore, prostitute praising narrated by well-known male writers in their novels that can be liked by society in Indonesia in post-1998 era that is subjected to freedom of expression which is still moral according to religions becomes problem of this research. The problem rises research questions: (1) how is prostitute praising represented by Sylado in *Ca-Bau-Kan: Hanya Sebuah Dosa* (1999) and by Atmowiloto in *Dewi Kawi* (2008)? (2) why do Sylado and Atmowiloto produce such representations?

Method of this research is qualitative which

involves observation, interview or document study (Moleong, 2011: 9). Document study is applied in this research, so the data is in the form of words or descriptive (Creswell, 2013; Moleong, 2011: 11). The method itself consists of data collecting method and data analysis one (Faruk, 2012: 24-25). Activities with regard to data collecting method are data recording, data selecting and data arranging or data categorizing (Sudaryanto, 2015: 11-12). Thus, first activity to collect data in this research is to record data from primary data sources which are Remy Sylado's *Ca-Bau-Kan: Hanya Sebuah Dosa* (1999) and Arswendo Atmowiloto's *Dewi Kawi* (2008) and from secondary data sources which are books, journals, research reports, articles, and so forth in relation to problem of the research. Second one is to select data which is needed. Third one is to categorize data such as data about prostitute praising representations and data about forming factors of the representations.

With regard to data analysis method which means method to find relation between data based on theory (Faruk, 2012: 42, 58), the theory applied is Stuart Hall's representation theory which provides constructionist approach to representations. Hall (1997: 25) explains, "It is the language system or whatever system we are using to represent our concepts. It is social actors who use the conceptual systems of their culture and the linguistic and other representational systems to construct meaning, to make the world meaningful." Accordingly, it is an important move to understand words or what Saussure called signs which produce meanings regarding prostitute praising in Remy Sylado's *Ca-Bau-Kan: Hanya Sebuah Dosa* (1999) and Arswendo Atmowiloto's *Dewi Kawi* (2008). Then, the meanings are connected with discourse flowing in post-1998 era for Foucault studies discourse as a system of representation and meanings are constructed in discourse (Hall, 1997: 44). Hall (Hall, 1997: 42-43) says, "What concerned him (Foucault) was the production of knowledge (rather than just meaning) through what he called discourse (rather than just language)." Knowledge has power to make itself true for it is produced through certain technologies and strategies of application in institutional regimes; of a discursive formation sustaining a regime of truth (Hall, 1997: 49) in which patriarchal domination and oppression structure can be traced (Hall, 2011: 43). Therefore, connecting meanings or knowledge

about prostitute praising in Remy Sylado's *Ca-Bau-Kan: Hanya Sebuah Dosa* (1999) and Arswendo Atmowiloto's *Dewi Kawi* (2008) with post-1998 discursive formation can reveal forming factors of the knowledge.

FINDING AND DISCUSSION

Prostitute Praising Representations

Male Sexual Pleaser

Surrounded by post-1998 discursive formation involving the state and religions prohibiting sexual behaviors in public or through various communication media, Remy Sylado in *Ca-Bau-Kan: Hanya Sebuah Dosa* (1999) narrates:

Di malam harinya, Tinung seperti kebanyakan perempuan waktu itu, menganggap buka baju, telanjang bulat dan mengangkang di ranjang, demi kepuasan lelaki adalah fitrah. Dia mesti diam, tidak melakukan respon [...] dia biarkan dirinya menjadi seperti sawah atau ladang yang diam melulu jika dipacul, dibajak sebelum ditanami benih. Tinung pun hari pertama di Gang Chaulan ini ibarat patung yang bernyawa, tak lebih (Sylado, 1999: 83).

At night, Tinung, like mostly females at that time, assumes that putting off clothes, being stark-naked, and straddling in the bed, for the sake of male's satisfaction are natural tendencies. She must be silent, not doing any response [...] She lets herself become like a rice field or lea that is always silent when it is bounced, plowed before it is planted with seed. On the first day in Gang Chaulan, Tinung is like a lifeless statue, nothing more.

"Lu boleh tinggal disini," kata Tan Peng Liang. "Lu cocok sama aku. (Sylado, 1999: 83)"

"You may live here," said Tan Peng Liang "You suit me."

"Pokok'e ciamik. Lu tinggal dikasih sarung kebaya sing mahal, jadi ratu dah-sini," kata Tan Peng Liang. "Mau toh? (Sylado, 1999: 83)"

"It must be good. You just need to be dressed with expensive sarong-kebaya, then become queen here," said Tan Peng Liang. "You want

it, right?"

"Mau toh lu? katanya mengulang dalam dana membujuk (Sylado, 1999: 84)."

"You want it, right? He repeated in persuasive tone.

Sylado's narration reflects sexuality being discussed in literary works in post-1998 era as democracy one. Female writers have been more free and brave to share their sexual experiences in literary works (Defina, 2018: 203). One of them is Ayu Utami who wrote novel titled *Saman* published at the end of New Order era or at the beginning of reformation which was controversial because it was given prestigious literary award for its explicit sexual topic (Hatley, 2008: 216). However, Ayu Utami's *Saman* evoked more positive reactions—festive welcome and celebration—than negative ones (Bandel, 2013: 216), meaning discussion about sexuality in novel is fair to be done.

Sylado's narration represents prostitution that still exists in post-1998 era despite *Peraturan Daerah* or Local Government Regulation prohibiting prostitution. It is because sex including variety of pornography and prostitution is liked by people from various social backgrounds, so efforts to eradicate pornography and prostitution always fail (Suryakusuma, 2012: 435). His narration about Tinung suiting Tan Peng Liang also represents prostitute whose body is used by male for his own satisfaction (Pateman, 2006: 60). If Sylado narrates Tinung being asked repeatedly by Tan Peng Liang to live in his house in Gang Chaulan, then Sylado constructs female to keep male's sexual urge fulfilled or pleased.

Surrounded by the same discursive formation, Arswendo Atmowiloto in *Dewi Kawi* (2008) narrates:

Seperti anak muda lain, saya ke lokalisasi (Atmowiloto, 2008: 20).

As other young males, I went to localization.

Itulah pertama kali saya mengenalnya dan tidur. "Kamu cepat pergi, karena saya janji dengan tamu." Saya pergi, merasa puas, dan kembali tiga hari kemudian (Atmowiloto, 2008: 20).

That was the first time I met her and had sex. "Go quickly, because I have an appointment

with a guest." I left, satisfied, and returned three days later.

Saya, seperti biasanya, selalu setia. Tidak mencari perempuan lain (Atmowiloto, 2008: 21).

I, as usual, am loyal. Not looking for other females.

Atmowiloto's narration about localization reflects prostitution complex which is the most developed prostitution concept in Indonesia for there were more than 90 localizations—some were closed, but still operate secretly—which held coaching and providing skills for prostitutes spread over various areas where crime, spread of disease and violence were controlled (Abdi, 2019: 96). The limited and secretive quality of localization are in accordance with qualities of discourse happening in very closed environment such as wild sex being tolerated in brothels (Foucault, 2008: 21). Simply put, localization is brothel complex showing a lot of prostitutes ready to serve any sex.

However, Atmowiloto narrates *I* referring to Eling to have sex with *her* referring to Kawi, to get satisfaction and to return to her three days later. Among the prostitutes, Kawi is narrated by Atmowiloto as the only prostitute Eling looks for. His narration reflects frequency of male turning to prostitute for sexual satisfaction (Nencel, 1996: 78). Through his narration, Atmowiloto constructs female to be male sexual pleaser so that male comes more often to get more satisfaction.

Male Success Inspirer

Encircled by post-1998 discursive formation occupied by the state and religions controlling female participation in public domain, Remy Sylado in *Ca-Bau-Kan: Hanya Sebuah Dosa* (1999) narrates:

Tinung! Ya, ia pokoknya masalah. Bukan main hebatnya perempuan ini di hati Tan Peng Liang. Perempuan yang ditemukan awalnya untuk sekedar memenuhi hasrat jasmani dan hadir sebagai perhentian sementara seperti katakanlah keretaapi bagi stasiun-stasiun kecil ternyata telah berkembang lebih kuat dan rekat melebihi besi yang dicerap sembrani (Atmowiloto, 2008: 311).

Tinung! Yes, she really is a problem. It's unbelievable how great this woman is in Tan Peng Liang's heart. Woman who was originally found to be merely fulfilling physical desire and present as a temporary stop, such as a train for small stations, has grown stronger and stickier than a metal that is perceived as boldly.

Setelah itu Tan Peng Liang ke depan, memberi sambutan dan ucapan-ucapan terimakasih. "Saudara-saudara barangkali bertanya, apa yang mendorong saya berdiri seperti ini. Satu-satunya yang mendorong saya adalah keluarga. Saya ingin anak-anak saya berdiri di sebelah saya: Kim San, Kim Hok, dan Soen Bie. Keluarga dibina dari cinta. Cinta itulah yang menuntun saya kepada cita-cita. Tanpa cinta tidak mungkin ada cita-cita. Setelah menyambut anak-anak saya, saya ingin juga menyambut orang yang memberikan cinta kepada saya. Satu-satunya orang yang menyadarkan saya tentang cinta, adalah seorang perempuan. Ya, perempuanlah yang selalu menjadi ilham bagi seorang lelaki. Perempuan juga yang menyempurnakan kelakikalian seorang suami. Nah, siapa perempuan yang saya maksudkan itu, saudara-saudara? Saya minta dia berdiri juga di sebelah saya. Dia adalah Siti Nurhayati." Tinung berdiri malu, ia tersipu-sipu menyembunyikan mukanya di belakang tangannya yang mungil. Orang memberinya tepuk tangan.

"Nah, itulah Siti Nurhayati. Dia istri saya. Seperti dapat saudara-saudara lihat, badannya dua. Dia memang sedang hamil tujuh bulan. Hari ini merupakan juga upacara tujuh bulanan buat kami. (Sylado, 1999: 383-384)"

Then, Tan Peng Liang comes forward, gives opening speech and thanks.

"Ladies and gentlemen, you may wonder, what pushes me to stand like this. The only thing pushing me is family. I want my children to stand next to me: Kim San, Kim Hok, and Soen Bie. Family is built from love. Love is what leads me to my goals. Without love there can be no goals. After welcoming my children, I want to also welcome a person who gives me love. The only person who awakens me about love, is a woman. Yes, woman is always the inspiration

for man. Woman also perfects the masculinity of husband. So, who is the woman I'm referring to, ladies and gentlemen? I ask her to stand next to me, too. She is Siti Nurhayati."

Tinung stands timidly, she blushes and hides her face behind her tiny hands. People give her applause.

"Well, that's Siti Nurhayati. She's my wife. As you can see, she's pregnant. She is indeed seven months pregnant. Today is also our seven-month ceremony."

Sylado's narration about Tinung who was originally found to be merely fulfilling physical desire and present as a temporary stop reflects prostitute who is in temporary relation with her customer in which the tenure depends on the quantity of monetary or material world (Rao, 2015: 278). So when the tenure ends, the relation mostly ends as well. Nevertheless, the relation between Tinung and Tan Peng Liang is narrated by Sylado as the one having grown stronger. His narration represents permanent relation like the one between husband and wife (Rao, 2015: 278). It is understandable in accordance with Sylado's narration about Tinung and Tan Peng Liang getting married at the temple (Sylado, 1999: 231). His narration represents religious marriage offered by religious institutions without the state regulations involved (Nedelsky & Hutchinson, 2008: 59). Bound in religious marriage, Tinung and Tan Peng Liang are constructed by Sylado as wife and husband anyway.

Based on Sylado's narration about Tinung or Siti Nurhayati as the only person awaking Tan Peng Liang about love to build family that pushes him to achieve his goals, Tinung known as prostitute surpasses Soen Bie, Kim San, and Kim Hok as Tan Peng Liang's children with his legal wife in terms of awaking him of love. If Freud argued that love is one of sexual manifestations when someone instills his or her libido in another human (Feist & Feist, 2008: 29, 30), then Tinung is constructed by Sylado as the only one pleasing Tan Peng Liang's libido and perfecting his masculinity. Tan Peng Liang's libido reflects natural masculine impulse that, it is assumed, requires the outlet provided by prostitution, while the perfection of masculinity reflects satisfaction of natural masculine impulse through the use of prostitute's body (Pateman, 2006: 60). Besides, the perfection of masculinity reflects perfection of manhood defined in three roles that are protector, procreator and provider (Carlock,

1999: 261). Having Soen Bie, Kim San, and Kim Hok, especially getting Tinung seven months pregnant, reflects Tan Peng Liang's role as procreator leading him to be protector and provider. To put it simply, Sylado constructs female who is prostitute linked to private domain (Foucault, 2008; Hall, 1997: 50) through whom male gets inspired and stands in public domain achieving his goals or becoming a successful male.

Encircled by the same discursive formation, Arswendo Atmowiloto in *Dewi Kawi* (2008) narrates:

"Kamu pasti masih ingat semasa remaja ada seorang wanita tunasusila..."

"Kawi..."

"Ya, Saya pernah mengatakan itu. Bahkan setelah menikah pun saya masih sempat bertemu dengan Kawi. Kini saya ingin kamu melacakinya, sampai menemukannya. Kerahkan semua apa yang bisa kamu lakukan."

"Rasanya tak sulit. Kapan terakhir bertemu?"

"Tiga puluh tahun... Kamu tahu itu. (Atmowiloto, 2008: 4)"

"You must still remember that when I was a teenager there was a prostitute..."

"Kawi..."

"Yes, I have said that. Even after getting married, I still had time to meet Kawi. Now I want you to track her down until you find her. Give everything you can do."

"I don't think it's difficult. When was the last time you met each other?"

"Thirty years... You know that."

"Saya ingin mengucapkan terima kasih pada Kawi. Sesungguhnya semua keberhasilan ini karena semangat dan dorongannya (Atmowiloto, 2008: 4).

"I want to thank Kawi. Indeed all this success happens because of her passion and encouragement."

Kawi yang menunjukkan bahwa biji srikaya itu enak, bahwa biji sirsak gurih, dan bahwa setagen itu berguna, bahkan ketika tidak memakai kain sekalipun (Atmowiloto, 2008: 19).

Kawi was the one showing that custard apple seeds are delicious, that soursop seeds are

tasty, and that female waist sash is useful, even when not wearing a cloth

Keintiman bukan hanya di ranjang [...] melainkan juga saat makan bersama. Cerita mengenai srikaya, mengenai belut, mengenai pasar, mengenai saudara (Atmowiloto, 2008: 25).

Intimacy is not only in bed [...] but also when eating together. Telling stories about custard apple, about eels, about the market, about relatives

Atmowiloto's narration about Eling being in relationship with a prostitute at his teenage age represents male in his puberty when he is physically mature and aware of his sexual urge (Jung, 2015: 114) to be instilled in female (Feist & Feist, 2008: 42). Based on Atmowiloto's narration, Kawi who was a prostitute pleasing Eling's sexual urge at his teenage age has lived for thirty years just in Eling's memory. Prostitute can live in localization (Abdi, 2019: 96), while memory exists in head or mental level (Bewernick, 2008: 110, 112). Both localization and mental level where Kawi is constructed by Atmowiloto are private.

However, from Kawi involved in private domain, Eling is narrated by Atmowiloto getting intimacy when in bed and when eating together that reflects intimate activities commonly done by male with prostitute (Soble, 2006: 853). From her, he is narrated by Atmowiloto getting stories about delicious custard apple seeds, tasty soursop seeds, and useful female waist sash which are related to domestic domain (Marshall, 2016: 183) included in private domain (Walby, 2014: 258) imposed on female where domestic tasks including productive works are done by female showing her important role in economic life (Beauvoir, 2011: 63). So, it is understandable if Atmowiloto narrates passionate and encouraging Kawi telling stories about domestic works which can lead to public ones through whom Eling gets inspired and becomes a successful male who wants to thank the female.

Forming Factors of Prostitute Praising Representations

As stated previously, constructionist approach is applied to representations. Hall (Hall, 1997: 27) states,

"Meaning depends on the relation between a sign and a concept which is fixed by a code. Meaning, the constructionists would say, is 'relational.'" Then, Hall (1997: 44) says, "Meaning and meaningful practice is therefore constructed within discourse." Hence, representation can be regarded as producing meaning by depending on the relation between a sign and a concept within discourse.

Discourse is linked to knowledge produced to legitimize the strength of masculine order neutrally (Bourdieu, 2001: 9). Regarding masculine order, Connell and Messerschmidt (2005: 848) say, "Gender is always relational, and patterns of masculinity are socially defined in contradiction from some model (whether real or imaginary) of femininity." Some model of femininity, especially hegemonic or emphasized femininity, focuses on compliance of patriarchy (Connell & Messerschmidt, 2005: 848). Patriarchy is a social structure system and practices in which males dominate, oppress and exploit females (Walby, 2014: 28). That being said, discourse essentially contains relation between masculinity and femininity which strengthens what Hall called patriarchal domination and oppression structure.

Post-1998 discursive formation is occupied by the state and religion strengthening patriarchal structure. It is said by Walby (2014: 29-30) that the state and religions are where patriarchal structure is built. Accordingly, prohibiting sexual behaviors in public or through various communication media as stated in *Undang-Undang Pornografi* atau Pornography Law is constructed by the state and religions to keep masculine domination.

Relation between Male and Prostitute as Male Sexual Pleaser by Being Object

Surrounded by post-1998 discursive formation engaging the state and religions prohibiting sexual behaviors in public or through various communication media to maintain masculine domination, Remy Sylado in *Ca-Bau-Kan: Hanya Sebuah Dosa* (1999) narrates:

Di malam harinya, Tinung seperti kebanyakan perempuan waktu itu, menganggap buka baju, telanjang bulat dan mengangkang di ranjang, demi kepuasan lelaki adalah fitrah. Dia mesti diam, tidak melakukan respon [...] dia biarkan dirinya menjadi seperti sawah atau ladang

yang diam melulu jika dipacul, dibajak sebelum ditanami benih. Tinung pun hari pertama di Gang Chaulan ini ibarat patung yang bernyawa, tak lebih (Sylado, 1999: 83).

At night, Tinung, like mostly females at that time, assumes that putting off clothes, being stark-naked, and straddling in the bed, for the sake of male's satisfaction are natural tendencies. She must be silent, not doing any response [...] She lets herself become like a rice field or lea that is always silent when it is bounced, plowed before it is seed planted. On the first day in Gang Chaulan, Tinung is like a lifeless statue, nothing more.

"Lu boleh tinggal disini," kata Tan Peng Liang. "Lu cocok sama aku. (Sylado, 1999: 83)"

"You may live here," said Tan Peng Liang "You suit me."

"Pokok'e ciamik. Lu tinggal dikasih sarung kebaya sing mahal, jadi ratu dah-sini," kata Tan Peng Liang. "Mau toh? (Sylado, 1999: 83)"

"It must be good. You just need to be dressed with expensive sarong-kebaya, then become queen here," said Tan Peng Liang. "You want it, right?"

"Mau toh lu?" katanya mengulang dalam dana membujuk (Sylado, 1999: 84).

"You want it, right? He repeated in persuasive tone.

Sylado's narration shows relation between Tan Peng Liang and Tinung pleasing him by becoming like a rice field or lea that is always silent when it is bounced, plowed before it is seed planted object and becoming like a lifeless statue, nothing more. In other words, Tinung is narrated by Sylado pleasing Tan Peng Liang by being object. Sylado's narration represents prostitute as a means treated by her client as an object (Soble, 2006: 853). Being object is also letting prostitute's body for unilateral use by male (Pateman, 2006: 60) as seen in Sylado's narration about Tinung putting off clothes, being stark-naked, and straddling in the bed for the sake of Tan Peng Liang's satisfaction. The result of Tinung being object is satisfaction on the

side of Tan Peng Liang indeed. He is narrated by Sylado asking Tinung to live in his house in Gang Chaulan for she suits him. Sylado's narration represents desire or satisfaction on the side of male by using prostitute's body in exchange for money or anything supporting her welfare (Pateman, 2006: 60). Since sexual desire is basic like human appetite for food, human has the means to satisfy sexual appetite to hand (Pateman, 2006: 61). It is seen in Tan Peng Liang narrated by Sylado having house in Gang Chaulan and expensive sarong-kebaya for Tinung to keep his sexual desire pleased by her, meaning to keep female being male's object.

Surrounded by the same discursive formation, Arswendo Atmowiloto in *Dewi Kawi* (2008) narrates:

Itulah pertama kali saya mengenalnya dan tidur. "Kamu cepat pergi, karena saya janji dengan tamu." Saya pergi, merasa puas, dan kembali tiga hari kemudian (Atmowiloto, 2008: 20).

That was the first time I met her and had sex. "Go quickly, because I have an appointment with a guest." I left, satisfied, and returned three days later.

"Saya bahkan tak mau tahu siapa namanya, atau biasanya membayar berapa. Duitnya sering tidak saya hitung, saya masukkan tas saja. Sama, saya hanya membuka paha, mengikuti saja." "Ciuman?"

"Kalau dia ngajak ya saya balas. (Atmowiloto, 2008: 87)"

"I don't even want to know his name, or how much he usually pays. I don't count his money, I just put it in the bag. It is all the same, I just open my thighs, follow him."

"What about kissing?"

"If he asks, I follow."

Atmowiloto's narration contains relation between Kawi and Eling having sex with her, getting satisfied by her and coming back three days later even after being asked to go by her. Atmowiloto's narration reflects male who holds the power to satisfy his biological need—sexual desire and desire for posterity—who does not mediate it for female is nothing other than male decides; she is thus called 'the sex', meaning that the male sees female essentially as a sexed thing

(Beauvoir, 2011: 5, 8). Being a sexed thing is being object controlled by one male to another as seen in Kawi narrated by Atmowiloto being object to whom male gives his money as much as he likes reflecting prostitute who depends on male being able to pay her sexual service (Jeffreys, 1997: 62) and object who follows what male decides to get satisfaction. If Atmowiloto narrates Kawi to have males coming back to her three days later and usually paying her, Atmowiloto constructs female to be object pleasing male biological need repeatedly.

Relation between Male and Prostitute as Male Success Inspirer by Being Private

Encircled by post-1998 discursive formation comprising the state and religions controlling female participation in public domain to comply masculine domination, Remy Sylado in *Ca-Bau-Kan: Hanya Sebuah Dosa* (1999) narrates:

Setelah itu Tan Peng Liang ke depan, memberi sambutan dan ucapan-ucapan terimakasih. "Saudara-saudara barangkali bertanya, apa yang mendorong saya berdiri seperti ini. Satu-satunya yang mendorong saya adalah keluarga. Saya ingin anak-anak saya berdiri di sebelah saya: Kim San, Kim Hok, dan Soen Bie. Keluarga dibina dari cinta. Cinta itulah yang menuntun saya kepada cita-cita. Tanpa cinta tidak mungkin ada cita-cita. Setelah menyambut anak-anak saya, saya ingin juga menyambut orang yang memberikan cinta kepada saya. Satu-satunya orang yang menyadarkan saya tentang cinta, adalah seorang perempuan. Ya, perempuanlah yang selalu menjadi ilham bagi seorang lelaki. Perempuan juga yang menyempurnakan kelakikan seorang suami. Nah, siapa perempuan yang saya maksudkan itu, saudara-saudara? Saya minta dia berdiri juga di sebelah saya. Dia adalah Siti Nurhayati."
Tinung berdiri malu, ia tersipu-sipu menyembunyikan mukanya di belakang tangannya yang mungil. Orang memberinya tepuk tangan.
"Nah, itulah Siti Nurhayati. Dia istri saya. Seperti dapat saudara-saudara lihat, badannya dua. Dia memang sedang hamil tujuh bulan. Hari ini merupakan juga upacara tujuh bulanan buat kami. (Sylado, 1999: 383-384)"

Then, Tan Peng Liang comes forward, gives opening speech and thanks.

"Ladies and gentlemen may wonder, what pushes me to stand like this. The only thing pushing me is family. I want my children to stand next to me: Kim San, Kim Hok, and Soen Bie. Family is built from love. Love is what leads me to my goals. Without love there can be no goals. After welcoming my children, I want to also welcome a person who gives me love. The only person who awakens me about love, is a female. Yes, female is always the inspiration for male. Female also perfects the masculinity of husband. So, who is the female I'm referring to, ladies and gentlemen? I ask her to stand next to me, too. She is Siti Nurhayati."

Tinung stands timidly, she blushes and hides her face behind her tiny hands. People give her applause.

"Well, that's Siti Nurhayati. She's my wife. As you can see, she's pregnant. She is indeed seven months pregnant. Today is also our seven-month ceremony."

Sylado's narration displays relation between Tan Peng Liang and Tinung or Siti Nurhayati who awakens him about love, inspires him and perfects his masculinity reflecting private domain. As argued by Freud, love is a sexual manifestation (Feist & Feist, 2008: 29, 30). Sexuality itself is domesticated (Foucault, 2008: 19-20) or linked to private sphere (Hall, 1997: 50) and perfecting masculinity as satisfying male biological need with regard to his sexual desire and desire for posterity (Beauvoir, 2011: 5, 8) is likewise. Meanwhile, inspiration lies within mental sphere (Pond, 186) which is unseen (Okeke, 2021). Simply put, Sylado constructs relation between male and female keeping her being private.

The relation keeping female being private is also contained in Sylado's narration about Tinung being called Siti Nurhayati as Tan Peng Liang's wife in public. Based on his narration, Siti Nurhayati is less-famous name than Tinung known as 'Si Chixiang' that means 'very famous and most wanted' in Kali Jodo (Sylado, 1999: 16) which is viewed as localization or prostitution area visited by males regarded as wealthy ones. Sylado's narration depicts prostitution in patriarchal state in which males have it both ways by closing prostitution outlets viewed as form of exploitation, while maintaining some supply

of females for government officials, diplomats, and foreign businessmen to buy for sex (Barry, 1995: 222). Besides, prostitution is not opened because prostitute is an abject, sinful, morally polluting person whom society is encouraged to avoid (Scoular, 2015: 30). Regardless of Tinung's fame as prostitute still noticed by people attending in event presented to Tan Peng Liang, he is constructed by Sylado to not exposing her stigma of being prostitute by calling her Siti Nurhayati instead of Tinung. If society is in patriarchal state, Tan Peng Liang, as the societal member, is encouraged by Sylado to avoid prostitute well-known as Tinung to whom negative traits are imposed on. By keeping prostitute being private, male is constructed by Sylado to not demeaning his masculinity.

For the sake of masculine domination, Tinung and Tan Peng Liang are narrated by Sylado in religious marriage only (Sylado, 1999: 231). Even though his legal wife who is paralyzed and in chronic pain gives her consent to them (Sylado, 1999: 86), Tan Peng Liang is not narrated by Sylado to divorce her in order to marry Tinung legally. Sylado's narration depicts religious marriage which gives private impression (Chambers, 2017: 106). In religious marriage, there is no legal recognition and protection (Nedelsky & Hutchinson, 2008: 59). Thus, Sylado narrates Tan Peng Liang as the only male saving Tinung from the torture of his sons from his legal wife who could not accept their father to pay more attention to prostitute than to their mother. Not divorcing his legal wife and not letting Tinung—prostitute married privately by him—tortured by his sons, Tan Peng Liang is constructed to be procreator, provider and protector of his family, meaning to strengthen masculine domination.

Encircled by the same discursive formation, Arswendo Atmowiloto in *Dewi Kawi* (2008) narrates:

*Aku teringat Dewi Kawi.
Apa sebenarnya yang sudah ku rekonstruksi dari
peristiwa-peristiwa dengan Kawi?
Bahwa ia pelacur, begitulah adanya.
Tapi cinta? Aku sendiri yang menghidupkan,
mendramatisir, membentuk sebagai sesuatu
yang indah.
Terus terang saat ini ku ragukan sendiri.
Apakah benar Kawi datang ke rumah kala itu?
Podo memang berkenalan, tapi mungkin sekali,
tidak di rumah. Apa benar Kawi bertemu Ibu
dan saling mengobrol? Mungkin sekali itu hanya
keinginanku (Atmowiloto, 2008: 48).*

I remember Goddess Kawi.

What actually have I reconstructed from the events with Kawi?

That she is a prostitute, that's how it is.

But love? I myself revive, dramatize, shape it as something beautiful.

Frankly, I have my doubts right now. Is it true that Kawi had come to my house at that time? Podo did get to know each other, but probably not at home. Is it true that Kawi met Mother and chatted each other? That was probably just my wish.

Bahkan juga, apakah aku dulu itu dibelikan sarung dan kaus secara khusus? Ataukah aku yang titip duit untuk dibelikan?

Dengan kata lain, kunci dari semua ini ingatan. Eling, seperti namaku. Segala sesuatu berdasarkan ingatan. Sesuatu menjadi bernilai, menjadi bermakna karena kita mengingat kembali (Atmowiloto, 2008: 49).

Moreover, was I bought a sarong and t-shirt particularly by her? Or was I the one who left my money for her to buy them?

In other words, the key to all of this is memory. Eling, like my name. Everything is based on memory. Something becomes valuable, becomes meaningful because we remember.

"Kalau saja ini bukan pelacuran dan tak berzinah ..."

"Ini bukan pelacuran. Saya tak membayar kamu sesuai tarif. Kamu membelikan kain sarung, memberikan kaus, mengizinkan saya bermalam—biarpun besar risikonya. Ini bukan pelacuran. (Atmowiloto, 2008: 92)"

"If only this weren't prostitution and not adultery..."

"This is not prostitution. I didn't pay you the rate. You bought me a sarong, gave me a t-shirt, let me spend the night with you—even if it was a big risk. This is not prostitution."

Atmowiloto's narration displays relation between Eling and Kawi loved by him in his memory. As previously explained, love is associated with sex by Freud (Feist & Feist, 2008: 29, 30). Sex is like wild horse strictly controlled and eyes-closed (Suryakusuma, 2012: 60). Containing libido, Eling's

love for Kawi is narrated by Atmowiloto driving him to revive, dramatize, and shape events with Kawi to be beautiful in his memory. Memory reflects mental level (Bewernick, 2008: 110, 112) which is unseen (Okeke, 2021) or closed like love as sexual manifestation. If Atmowiloto narrates Eling to be doubtful for the key of all is Eling's memory making something valuable, then Eling's success happening because of Kawi's passion and encouragement is just in Eling's memory. So, Atmowiloto basically shows male as the one reconstructing female to be his inspiration to be successful.

Besides, reconstructing female to be valuable happens in memory only which means in closed sphere. It is seen in Atmowiloto's narration about Eling remembering Goddess Kawi. Based on his narration, Eling is the only one knowing how valuable Kawi is. It means Eling's knowledge that cannot be regarded as true as stated by Hall (1997: 49), "All knowledge, once applied in the real world, has real effects, and in that sense at least, 'becomes true'." The truth known by Eling and Kawi narrated by Atmowiloto is that Kawi is prostitute linked to adultery. His narration reflects prostitution as sin prohibited by religions (Al-Qaradhawi, 2016; Konferensi Waligereja Indonesia, 1996: 29) legitimized by the state in post-1998 era in the form of *Peraturan Daerah* or Local Government Regulation (Robinson, 2018; Suryakusuma, 2012: 414, 421). It is understandable if Atmowiloto narrates Eling being confused of marrying prostitute regarded as sinner (Atmowiloto, 2008: 25) and ending up marrying decent female (Atmowiloto, 2008: 4) . Atmowiloto's narration about Eling stating that there was no prostitution and no adultery for he did not pay Kawi the rate, was bought a sarong and given a t-shirt particularly by her and was let to spend the night with her reflects Eling's reconstruction from events with Kawi in his memory only, not in his real world. Knowing everything is based on his memory, Eling is narrated by Atmowiloto to not meeting Kawi to thank her. That being said, Atmowiloto constructs male to keep female being private to uphold masculine domination.

CONCLUSION

After applying Stuart Hall's representation theory, it is found that prostitute praising is represented by Remy Sylado in *Ca-Bau-Kan: Hanya Sebuah Dosa*

(1999) and by Arswendo Atmowiloto in *Dewi Kawi* (2008) in private and public domain which are mixed up for prostitute is constructed to be private in male's public domain and is related to public in male's private domain. Accordingly, representations with regard to prostitute praising produced by the male novelists are male sexual pleaser and male success inspirer crossing male's public and private domain. The forming factors of the representations are relation between male and prostitute as male sexual pleaser by being object and relation between male and prostitute as male success inspirer by being private that highlight male power. In other words, Remy Sylado representing prostitute praising in *Ca-Bau-Kan: Hanya Sebuah Dosa* (1999) and Arswendo Atmowiloto representing prostitute praising in *Dewi Kawi* (2008) are subjected to post-1998 discursive formation occupied by the state and religions that uphold masculine domination. Therefore, praising prostitute is represented by male novelists to praise subordination of female in post-1998 era.

STATEMENTS OF COMPETING INTEREST

Herewith the author declare that this article is totally free from any conflict of interest regarding the data collection, analysis, and the editorial process, and the publication process in general.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Abdi, Y. (2019). *Prostitusi: Kisah 60 Daerah di Indonesia*. Surabaya: Airlangga University Press.
- Abi, R. H. (2020). *Jadi Pelajar Harus Beda!* Jakarta: Elex Media Komputindo.
- Al-Qaradhawi, Y. (2016). *Halal dan Haram dalam Islam*. Malaysia: PTS Publishing House Sdn. Bhd.
- Anderson, D. L. (2017). *Organizational Development; the Process of Leading Organizational Change. 4th Edition*. Thousand Oak: SAGE Publications.
- Atmowiloto, A. (2008). *Dewi Kawi*. Jakarta Pusat: Gramedia Pustaka Utama.
- Bandel, K. (2013). *Sastra Nasionalisme Pascakolonialisme*. Yogyakarta: Penerbit Pustaka Hariara.
- Barry, K. (1995). *The Prostitution of Sexuality*. New York and London: New York University Press.
- Beauvoir, S. de. (2011). *The Second Sex*. New York: Vintage Books.
- Bewernick, H. (2008). *The Storyteller's Memory Palace: A Method of Interpretation Based on the Function of Memory Systems in Literature*. Bern: Peter Lang.

- Bourdieu, P. (2001). *Masculine Domination*. Stanford, California: Stanford University Press.
- Bubandt, N. (2016). *Demokrasi, Korupsi, dan Makhluk Halus dalam Politik Indonesia Kontemporer*. Jakarta: Yayasan Pustaka Obor Indonesia.
- Carlock, J. C. (1999). *Men and Self-Esteem*. New York and London: Routledge.
- Chambers, C. (2017). *Against Marriage: An Egalitarian Defence of the Marriage-Free State*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Connell, R. W., & Messerschmidt, J. W. (2005). *Hegemonic Masculinity*.
- Creswell, J. W. (2013). *Qualitative Inquiry & Research Design: Choosing among Five Approaches*. Thousand Oaks.
- Defina. (2018). *Feminisme dan Gender sebagai Sebuah Teori Sastra*. Yogyakarta: Garudhawaca.
- Faruk, H. T. (2012). *Metode Penelitian Sastra: Sebuah Penjelajahan Awal*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.
- Feist, J., & Feist, G. J. (2008). *Theories of Personality*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.
- Forster, E. M. (2022). *Aspects of the Novel*. New York: Dover Publications.
- Foucault, M. (2008). *Ingin Tahu Sejarah Seksualitas*. Jakarta: Yayasan Obor Indonesia.
- Hall, S. (1990). *Cultural Identity and Diaspora*. London: Lawrence and Wishart.
- Hall, S. (1997). *Representation: Cultural Representations and Signifying Practices*. Sage Publications & Open University.
- Hall, S. (2011). *Cultural Studies dan Centre: Beberapa Problematik dan Permasalahan*. Yogyakarta: Jalasutra.
- Hariwijaya, M. (2017). *Smart Writing: Menulis Tanpa Bakat dan Teori*. Yogyakarta: Diandra Kreatif.
- Hatley, B. (2008). "Postkolonialitas dan Perempuan dalam Sastra Indonesia Modern" in Keith Foulcher and Tony Day (eds.). *Sastra Indonesia Modern Kritik Postkolonial*. Jakarta: Yayasan Obor Indonesia.
- Heryanto, A. (2012). *Budaya Populer di Indonesia: Mencairnya Identitas Pasca-Orde Baru*. Yogyakarta: Jalasutra.
- Hidayana, I. M. (2013). Budaya Seksual dan Dominasi Laki-Laki dalam Perikehidupan Seksual Perempuan. *Jurnal Perempuan Untuk Pencerahan Dan Kesetaraan: Agama Dan Seksualitas*, 18(2), 57-67.
- Jeffreys, S. (1997). *The Idea of Prostitution*. North Melbourne: Spinifex.
- Jones, T. (2015). *Kebudayaan dan Kekuasaan di Indonesia Kebijakan Budaya Selama Abad ke-20 hingga Era Reformasi*. Jakarta: Yayasan Pustaka Obor Indonesia.
- Jung, C. G. (2015). *Freud and Psychoanalysis, Volume 4*. London and New York: Routledge.
- Konferensi Waligereja Indonesia. (1996). *Iman Katolik*. Jakarta: Penerbit Obor.
- Kumoro, B. (2009). *Hamis, Ikon Perlawanan Islam terhadap Zionisme Israel*. Bandung: PT Mizan Pustaka.
- Marshall, D. (2016). *The Practice of the Meal: Food, Families and the market place*. New York and London: Routledge.
- Moleong, L. J. (2011). *Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif*. Bandung: PT Remaja Rosdakarya.
- Munaf, D. R. (2016). *Memahami dan Memaknai Pancasila sebagai Ideologi dan Dasar*. Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama.
- Nedelsky, J., & Hutchinson, R. (2008). *Law and Religious Pluralism in Canada*. Vancouver: UBC Press.
- Nencel, L. (1996). *Machos, Mistresses and Madonnas: Contesting the Power of Latin American Gender Imagery*. Verso: London and New York.
- Ngong, D. T. (2013). *Theology as Construction of Piety*. Oregon: Wipf and Stock Publishers.
- Okeke, C. C. (2021). *The Force of Mental Freedom*. Indiana: Archway Publishing.
- Pateman, C. (2006). *Prostitution and Pornography: Philosophical Debate about the Sex Industry*. California: Stanford University Press.
- Pond, D. (2008). *The Pursuit of Happiness*. Minnesota: Llewellyn Publications.
- Rao, C. S. (2015). *Indian Social Problems: A Sociological Perspective*. New Delhi: S. Chand Publishing.
- Robinson, K. (2018). *Seksualitas di Indonesia: Politik Seksual, Kesehatan, Keberagaman, dan Representasi*. Jakarta: Yayasan Pustaka Obor Indonesia.
- Roosa, J., & Ratih, A. (2008). *Perspektif Baru Penulisan Sejarah Indonesia*. Jakarta: Yayasan Obor Indonesia.
- Rothbard, M. N. (2018). *Anatomi Negara*. Salatiga: Penerbit Parabel.
- Scouler, J. (2015). *The Subject of Prostitution*. New York and London: Routledge.
- Soble, A. (ed.). (2006). *Sex from Plato to Paglia: A Philosophical Encyclopedia*. Connecticut and London: Greenwood Publishing Group.
- Strong, A. K. (2016). *Prostitutes and Matrons in the Roman World*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Sudaryanto. (2015). *Metode dan Aneka Teknik Analisis Bahasa: Pengantar Penelitian Wahana Kebudayaan Secara Linguistik*. Yogyakarta: Sanata Dharma University Press.
- Sudirman, A. (2014). *Sejarah Lengkap Indonesia*. Yogyakarta: DIVA Press.

- Sumardjo, J. (1999). *Konteks Sosial Novel Indonesia 1920 – 1977*. Bandung: Penerbit Alumni.
- Suryadinata, L. (2015). *Making of Southeast Asian Nations: State, Ethnicity, Indigenism and Citizenship*. Singapore, New Jersey and London: World Scientific Publishing Co. Pte. Ltd.
- Suryakusuma, J. (2012). *Agama, Seks dan Kekuasaan: Kumpulan Tulisan 1979 – 2012*. Jakarta: Komunitas Bambu.
- Sylado, S. (1999). *Ca-Bau-Kan: Hanya Sebuah Dosa*. Indonesia: KPG (Kepustakaan Populer Gramedia)
- bekerjasama dengan Yayasan Adikarya IKAPI dan the Ford Foundation.
- Talbot, W. (2019). *Religion? Of God or Man?* Indiana: Xlibris Corporation.
- Triandafyllidou, A., & Magazzini (eds.), T. (2021). *Routledge Handbook on the Governance of Religious Diversity*. Oxon and New York: Routledge.
- Walby, S. (2014). *Teorisasi Patriarki*. Yogyakarta: Jalasutra.
- Whyte, C. (2013). *Intersectionality und Kritik*. Berlin: Springer.