Table of Contents

JEWISH IMMIGRANT FOODWAYS: HYPHENATING AMERICA

Nadia Faradhillah
nadiafaradhillah@gmail.com

Abstract

The article's purpose is to examine the significance of Kosher Laws in Jewish foodways as religious and cultural signifier for Jews' identity. Besides, this article also aims to explain the way the Jewish immigrants assimilate with American culture through their foodways. This topic is chosen because Jewish immigrants have unique position in American society in accordance with their food way. In the "New Land" that guarantees them freedom they struggle to keep their identity and assimilate as religious and cultural group through Jewish foodways.

Qualitative method is used in this library research on Jewish foodways archives and writings. This article is started by introduction portraying Jews migration to the United States and their foodways that they brought along the migration.

The findings of this research show that Jewish foodways divided the Jews for the difference of opinion between the Jews towards their Kosher Laws. The non-religious Jews adapt easily to the American foodways. The religious Jews find it difficult to assimilate to the American foodways. However, they find a way to assimilate and still keep their obedience.

Keywords: Kosher Law, Jewish American, Theory of Practice, Post-Nationalism, Foodways

Introduction

Since the very first time the New Land was found, people are attracted to migrate to the New Land with diverse of reason. The immigrants mostly seek for better life, political freedom from governmental tyranny, and religious freedom. The Jews are one of the ethnical groups that migrate to seek for better life and religious freedom. They entered America in 1654 through New York and settled there (Deutsch and Saks, 2008: 14). This is the reason why New York has so many Jewish communities. The Jewish immigrants landed in New York and the other costal cities, such as New Port, Rhode Island, Savannah, and Georgia because the boats that they sailed on departed for those cities. However, not until 1830s-1840s, the first large wave of Jews immigrants enters United States and the second wave entered in 1860s continued until twentieth century (Deutsch and Saks, 2008: 15). The number of Jewish immigrants reaches its highest point when World War I and II occurred. So many Jews fled to the United States since they underwent unpleasant political condition in Germany and other Eastern

European countries (Deutsch and Saks, 2008: 16).

The common Jewish immigrants come to United States are the typically poor and low funded people that seek a chance to get better life. Fortunately, Jewish has strong ethnical bound so that the Jewish immigrants that had already settled in the United States will help the newly arrived Jews to start a new life in America. With the help of the Jewish community, the newly arrived Jews found occupations and start to earn a living. The occupations they had in the United States are something they are prohibited to do in their home country before the migration, such as doctor, lecturer, and business. Through the job, they are able to move to a higher social class. That change results in the abundance of food that they can afford (Diner, 2002: 179-180).

Food is the form of culture that is produced by a certain ethnical group. When an ethnic group migrates to any different area, they will bring the foodways with them to the new place. However, the condition in the new place will be very different from the former place. In the new place, everything is unsettled and it makes the group difficult in fulfilling their needs of food that suits their foodways. Hence, they need to adapt their foodways by seeking the complementary food that is similar to the food that they used to consume in daily basis (Almerico, 2014: 3).

Caplan in Mintz and Du Bois states that as the form of material culture, food serves ambivalence function which unites the group or destroys the group (2002: 109). The function of food which unites the group is shown in the Javanese's attitude that frequently offers other people to eat to show their compassion towards certain people. It is because the Javanese are not taught to say 'I love you' to express their love to other people. On the other hand, the function of food that destroys the group is when the food becomes the source of wars or that the food is defined as class identification.

Food is also used to determine the identity which relates to ethnicity, gender, race, and nationality. Nonetheless, Murcot states that the idea of identity itself is merely human imagination. In other words, Murcot wants to say that identity is socially constructed in people's mind and is embraced by the society as values (Mintz and Du Bois, 2002: 109). Hence, every aspect within the society is also socially constructed and just human imagination, including foodways. For instance is the idea of rice as primary food

to many Indonesians. There is a belief in Indonesians that they are not considered eating if they do not eat rice, even when they eat another form of carbohydrate, such as bread, corn, or potato. This idea is rooted deeply in Indonesians mind and builds the Indonesian identity through foodways. It is proven when the Indonesians go abroad, they will find a way to get the access to rice to eat even the type of rice that they get will be totally different to the rice that they usually eat in Indonesia, they will still eat it.

The Jews should adapt themselves in term of foodways since they had been lived in poor condition and face the scarcity of food. Moreover, they also have to adapt to the multi-cultural condition in the United States. The United Sates consists of so many immigrants that come from different ethnical group and historical background and each of the ethnical group brings their culture including foodways. As a result, the United States provide abundant types of ethnical food that are brought by the immigrant. Facing this condition, the Jews are difficult in balancing their religious and secular life. The difficulties are harder when it comes to the subject of foodways since the Jews has dietary laws that should be observed.

Because of the foodways, the Jews develop such a paradoxical position. The paradoxical position puts them between the obligation to be observant to Jewish dietary laws and the desire to connect to American life-style and society. On the other hand, the paradoxical position owned by the Jews is also depicted in these research questions: *What is the significance of Kosher laws in defining Jews identity in the United States?* and *How the Jews assimilate with American foodways?*

Methodology

Qualitative method is used in this research in order to get the interpretation of American Jewish identity and their foodways. Qualitative method is a way to cover the meaning of human beings, both as an individual or a member of a group through the problems exist in the society (Creswell, 2009: 1). The approach, moreover, is Post-Nationalism in American Studies as Rowe argued that this approach is based on varied culture and ethnic in the United States influence the intersection and interaction among American society. This approach surges as the counter-thesis of American Exceptionalism that has been dominating the course in American Studies. Post-

Nationalism approach emerge as a result of the immigration waves came to the United States which reform American society and create cultural hybrid in the society of Americans (2000: 24).

The research will go through two steps, namely, collecting data and analyzing data. As it takes the form of library research, thus, the collecting data process will concern to the study on books and articles about Jewish American foodways. Then, the data will be analyzed by theory of practice. The theory of practice constitutes routine activities which involve some elements that interconnect to one another that can result as bodily activities, "stuff" and its function in life, mental, emotion, beliefs, and knowledge (Reckwitz in Warde, 2005: 133). The theory of practice will be used to interpret the data to answer the research question.

Discussion

As what Reckwitz mentions that the routine activities done by human beings will produce belief. Jews is either ethnical group or religious group. It means that Jews do not only practice the cultural tradition but also obligate to observe some religious laws. Nevertheless, some people, outsider mostly, will interchange the

meaning of Jewish cultural tradition and religious observance. This is for the reason that there is lack of understanding the Jews as ethnical group and the Jews as religious group. One of the aspects that are frequently misunderstood by some outsider is the Kosher laws for Jews as religious group. The practice of Kosher laws has become the routine of the Jews long before they migrate to the United States. It has been in the Jews mindset that one of the deals for being a Jew is observing the Kosher laws. Supported by the issue of health and holiness, the practice turns into something that they must oblige and believe. The Kosher laws contain the regulation of anything that should and should not be eaten by the Jews (Deutsch and Saks, 2008: 105-106). For example, the regulation that prohibits the Jews from eating the derivation of meat swine and the regulation that prohibits them for eating meat and diary product at the same time. Kosher laws, furthermore, is the laws that arrange Jewish foodways, which according to Warde, cooking and foodways are included to the integrative practice. The term integrative practice means that the actions or activities done by human beings consist of complex structure because it contains all the three elements in the practice's interconnection;

understanding, rigid rules, and 'teleoaffective' which regarded as beliefs and emotions stuff (2005: 134-135). Warde, moreover, argues that when the three aspect of the practice's interconnection is met, which he also said to be an unusual case, it will be hard to change the practice (2005: 136).

From the beginning of their immigration to the United States, they face the difficulties to find food that in accordance with Kosher. Although the United States provide so many kinds of food that they can eat, they still have the difficulties to find Kosher. They realize that their dietary laws limit them in adapting and assimilating with America. Nonetheless, they still tenaciously observe the Kosher laws. For the Jewish Americans who live far away from the city with so many Jewish communities where provides the complete facilities to the Jews like New York or Port Chester, they have to buy the Kosher food from there or send a courier to buy them the Kosher food (Diner, 2002: 182).

The change of practice that had been lasted for a long time, nonetheless, is possible to occur since human beings as an individual and a member of the society will adapt themselves to the change of their surroundings (Warde, 2005: 136).

With the emerging multicultural society, soon, Jewish Americans notice the gap in their Jewishness and Americanness. Leaving their home country for more religious freedom, they feel alienation from their Jewishness to their Americanness. It seems that the Jewishness can not accommodate the religious freedom they longed even if the freedom is in front of their eyes. Because of this, some Jewish Americans start to think about their dietary laws and its applicability in the United States. Arguably, one of the reasons that they come to the United States is for religious freedom. They think that their migration will be in vain if they are still limited by the religious regulation. Therefore, as what Diner denotes that the Jewish American start questioning the significance of Kosher laws. Some of them think that by being observant to the Kosher laws restrict them to feel mainstream American experience which prevents the formation of their identity as Jewish-American. As a result, this type of Jewish American renegotiates the Kosher laws by themselves, and they become more flexible in assimilating and embracing mainstream American experience (2002: 184). It is seen that these Jewish Americans consider that their

"Jewishness" is descent from the ancestors. The Jewishness is not defined by the Jewish religious regulation like the Kosher laws. Moreover, as an immigrant they hyphenate their Jewishness to mainstream American experience and culture so that they can embrace the new identity as an American.

At the same time, the other group of Jewish Americans criss-crossing to the former group regards that religious laws are something that should be embraced and observed whenever and wherever they are to underline their identity as Jews (Diner, 2002: 180-181). Thus, the version of Jewishness according to this group is that the observance to the religious laws that makes them Jews. The Jewishness is not merely determined the ancestry but it is and should be determined by the values that is embraced by the people in the daily basis. Sticking to the Kosher laws is one of the embodiments of the Jewishness.

These different opinions and perspectives of foodways and dietary laws emerge dispute between the Jewish immigrants in the United States. Hence, this difference split the Jewish immigrants in to four groups (Deutsch and Saks, 2008: x). The first group is religious traditional Jews. Religious traditional Jews can be said as the orthodox Jews because they

stick to both cultural values and religious regulation to define their identity as Jews. Moreover, they regard that cultural values and religious regulation can not be shoved aside merely for migration and new culture. The second type group is called religious non-traditional. This people stick to religious regulation, but they also enjoy and embrace the other aspect of mainstream American experience. For example, they still observe Kosher laws and attend the synagogue, but they also have after work hangout to Kosher pizzeria. The third type of Jews is non-religious traditional. The people of this group practice the cultural values of Jewish culture, but they leave the religious practice and observance out of their daily basis. For instance these people will still attend the Jewish holiday, speaks in Hebrew, or, eat and cook Jewish food, but they do not observe Kosher laws or attend the Jewish religious rituals like synagogue. The last type of group is called non-religious non-traditional. They consider themselves as Jews by ancestry because they neither practice Jewish cultural values nor observe Jewish religious laws, especially in the case of foodways. They practically eat the same food as the Americans have in their area.

The food and foodways is proven to emerge dispute between the Jewish Americans so that they are grouped base on their observance to Kosher laws. For non-religious groups (non-religious traditional and non-religious non-traditional), the Jewish Americans who practically left the Kosher laws out of their daily basis, so that they will not be bothered by the food that they consume are in accordance to the Kosher laws or not. They immediately embrace the mainstream American culture and experience. They easily assimilate to other ethnical group and do not have major difficulties to socialize with them. This is one of the ways that the Jews from these groups used to define their Jewish-Americans identity, by not observing either one or both Jewish cultural and religious values. However, at some point, they will still attend the Jewish holiday with their family and they will automatically eat Kosher food or Kosher-style food (Deutsch and Saks, 2008: x).

On the other hand, the religious group (non-traditional religious and traditional religious) face more difficulties in assimilating with the society. In the case of food and foodways, they seem to be pickier to food than the average Americans. It is for the reason that they have to consider the Kosher laws that they observed and be careful to whatever they wanted to eat. It is harder when they have to eat with non-Jews friends or acquaintances because they face such a paradoxical situation, one that anchor them to obey the Kosher laws and the other that capture their urge for not hurting their friends' feelings. They sometimes should also face the awkward situations such as having matzah in lunch time for Passover when the other children in the class have original bread (Deutsch and Saks, 2008: 22). It may be practically not assaulting or discriminating but it reminds the Jewish Americans that they are Jews and not fully embrace the mainstream American culture and experience.

It is stated that the non-religious group face less difficulties in choosing their food because they do not have to worry about the Kosher laws. Thus, it provides them with the abundance of food and foodways that they can get in the United States. As for the religious group, time emerge the desire to connect with mainstream American culture and experience, but they face harder fact that they is observant towards the Kosher laws to keep their Jewish identity. Thus, as the time rolls by the religious group try to balance their Jewish and American identity.

In the scope of food and foodways they reinvent the typically American food or other ethnical food that suit their Kosher laws by replacing or complementing any foodstuffs that do not go along with the Kosher laws to foodstuffs that suit to the Kosher laws (Deutsch and Saks, 2008: 49).

Kosher laws prohibit them for eating any meat produced without religious propriety and product that is derived from meat swine. Despite most of the meat product provided in the United States is made without any Jewish religious propriety, and some of the meat products are made of the derivation of swine, the desire to taste the mainstream American culture and experience through food emerge between the religious Jewish Americans. They find the way to compromise their desire to American experience and the Kosher laws by complementing all the meats with the meats that suit to the Kosher laws (Deutsch and Saks, 2008: 50). Moreover, the Kosher laws state that the Jews are prohibited to eat meat products and dairy products at the same time. For instance, the Jews are not able to eat cheeseburger, or have dessert after having the main course contains meat products. However, they will loose themselves and complement either meat or diary product

with 'fake meat' or 'soy (made for vegetarians) diary' so that the food will go along with the Kosher laws (Deutsch and Saks, 2008: 51).

The Jews will usually replace the cheese in cheeseburger with soy cheese. When they make mashed potato to be eaten with steak, they will complement butter and milk in the mashed potato with margarine and soy milk (Deutsch and Saks, 2008: 51). The complementary used should not change the taste of the food, so that they will still have the similar taste although the taste is not completely the same as the authentic food. The Jews are also interested in ethnical food, such as Chinese, Italians, and Mexicans (Deutsch and Saks, 2008: 50). The spaghetti made by the Jews use soy meat or 'fake meat' to complement bacon. While, the Chinese fried rice will use Kosher meat and 'fake shrimp'. The Jews interest towards Chinese food is so great that there are so many Kosher Chinese products are produced. Moreover, seeing this opportunity, the Chinese open Chinese restaurant near the Jewish community and provide them with Chinese food that is cooked by Kosher-style.

In term of the adapting food, the religious Jewish Americans are benefited by vegetarian life-style that invents soy-

based food industry that compromises the Kosher laws for the Jewish American. Through the adapting food, religious Jewish Americans can also invent their own mainstream American culture and experience. The adapting food also makes them possible to assimilate with the other foodways like Chinese, Italians, and Mexicans. Adapting food reform their identity as Jewish-Americans that permit them to embrace the American culture and experience through food and foodways and keep their Jewishness by observing the Kosher laws.

Conclusion

It can be concluded that the migration to the United States makes the Jewish questioning their dietary laws that are considered to restrict them to mingle in American society. Some of the Jews decide to leave the Kosher laws behind and follow the mainstream American culture and experience. This action immediately reforms their Jewish identity.

Furthermore, he dispute of Kosher laws in Jewish community in the United States split the Jews in to two major groups, the religious and the non-religious. The former group that leave the Kosher laws behind face less difficulty than the religious ones since they regard their

Jewishness is descended by their ancestry. The different fate should be faced by the religious Jews because they have to feel the dilemma to choose their observance to the Kosher laws or the desire to experience American culture. This group considers that their Jewishness is determined by their observance to the Jewish religious laws, such as Kosher laws. However, adapting food solve the religious Jews problem by complementing the non-Kosher food to Kosher food. At this rate, the practice of Kosher laws that firstly indicate will be hard to change, adapt to the socio-cultural surroundings of the United States' multicultural society. Thus, it allows the Jews, especially the religious group, to embrace both their Jewish and American identity.

References

Almerico, Gina M. 2014. "Food and Identity: Food Studies, Cultural, and Personal Identity." Journal of International Business and Cultural Studies 1-7.

Creswell, John W. 2009. Research Design Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Method. Los Angeles: Sage Publication.

Deutsch, Jonathan and Saks, Rachel D. 2008. Jewish American Food Culture. Westport: Greenwood Press.

Diner, Haisa R. 2002. <u>Hungering for America: Italian, Irish, and Jewish Foodways in the Age of Migration.</u> Cambridge: Harvard University Press.

Dresner, Samuel H. 1966. <u>The Jewish Dietary Laws: Their Meaning for Our Time.</u> New York: The Burning Bush Press.

Mintz, Sidney W. and Du Bois, Christine M. 2002. "The Anthropology of the Food and Eating." <u>Annual Reviews Anthropology</u> 99-119.

Rowe, John Carlos. 2000. <u>Post-nationalist American Studies.</u> California: University of California Press.

Warde, Alan. 2005. "Consumption and Theories of Practice." <u>Journal of Consumer Culture</u> 131-153.

FRAMING WOMEN POLITICIAN IN DEMOCRATIC ENVIRONMENT: A STUDY OF MEGAWATI SOEKARNO PUTRI AND HILLARY CLINTON

Nurlita Hapsari
lita.lohita@yahoo.com

Abstract

This research was aimed to examine how media coverage produces particular framing toward women politician during presidential campaign as well as the significance behind the framings toward gender conception in Indonesia and America. Media holds a vital political role as it helps shaping people's opinion over particular issues and figures. As media coverage toward particular candidates can profoundly affect election outcomes, it is interesting to see how media presents two women figures who ran for presidential race.

This is a qualitative research. The main sources of data are articles gathered from eight online-based mainstream news sources from Indonesia and America. The secondary data are all selected works or research related to the topic such as reference books and journals.

This research was done under the framework of American Studies. Since American Studies is interdisciplinary, it involves various theories and disciplines. This research uses gender theory to observe how media shapes the image of women politician through their news coverage. Critical discourse analysis is used to explore the significance of media framing on women politician to society's conception of women's gender roles. Then, framing theory is important to analyze media's method and ideology in constructing the facts within the coverage.

In the research analysis, it is found that there are various framings used by media to describe Hillary Clinton's and Megawati Soekarno Putri's personalities. While media in both countries put on different focuses, news coverage on both media shares the same women stereotyping theme such as emphasis on physical appearance and family association. In the end, learning from the media framing toward woman politician, we can conclude that despite feminist achievement in many areas, woman are still highly perceived as unfit to be in political world.

Keywords: gender, politics, media, framing

Introduction

Democracy becomes essential in understanding America as a whole nation because it symbolizes not merely a political system, but rather an entire civilization (Singh, Skidmore, and Sequiera, 1995) that has been shaping the characters of America itself. Being the father of modern democracy, America has come a long way to 'promote' democratic ideology to the world. However, we should note that there are always two faces

of America; *the ideal* and *the real*. There are times when the ideal is disrupted by the fact that what happens in the actual field is much different from the initial plan. Due to various reasons, the implementation of democracy does not guarantee to favor the common good. Historically speaking, the Constitution itself was actually the product of a small group of elites who acted and formulated the Constitution for their own sake. Owing to this nature, American democracy is prominently influenced by particular groups in power with their own interests, such that make it inadequate to represent all voices of Americans *(ibid)*. While democracy is supposed to guarantee equal rights for all citizens in terms of political involvement, uneven number of officer and power holder in the Senate and Congress implies how white and male politicians still hold the highest privilege in American democracy.

Despite contemporary number of women holding the highest political functions abroad such as German Chancellor Angela Merkel, United Kingdom Prime Minister Theresa May, and Bangladesh Prime Minister Sheikh Hasina, somehow politics is still widely regarded as male business in the United States of America. Many people argue that

politics deals with "manly men, doing manly things, in manly ways," (Duerst-Lahti in Holtz-Bacha, 2013). Owing to this prevalent conception in the society, no wonder that until 2017, compared to other 'younger' democratic countries, America has yet to witness a woman rise to the presidency. Regarding to complexity of society's perception towards woman as leader, it is inevitable that their presidential candidacy always comes with controversy. Among the most astonishing and contentious elections in American political history is the *2008 Presidential Election*, where Democrat party ran two candidates for President Nominee which both come from minority groups: a woman and a male African-American. However, we should note that they were running for a position where the default type is a white man. It would not be as easy as falling off a log to change society's perception about a female or Black president. As a consequence, both candidates had to run not only against each other but also against rigid construction in the public expectation of what a president is (Caroll, 2009).

In Democrat's 2008 presidential candidacy, Barrack Obama won over Hillary Clinton. Many scholars argue, especially the feminist ones, that there was a gender bias in media coverage of these

two candidates during presidential candidacy. If some said that America is not ready to have their first woman president (which explains why Obama, a male African-American, is preferred), this notion is not necessarily true. According to the study, 55% Americans are ready to have a woman president (Harper, "Gender bias did in Clinton?"). Then the question remains; why is there no woman in the White House as yet?

The possible answer for woman's inability to shatter the ceiling glass in White House might be owing to the existence of gender bias in the media coverage. Women consistently got less coverage than male candidates in the same race, and this did not improve over time. Sexism, more than ideology, has driven media's anti-Clinton theme that the press used many tricks to swipe at Clinton (Bedard, "Media Sexism Doomed Hillary's 2008 Bid"). Hillary's defeat from Barrack showed us that when gender is encountered with race, race seems to gain more privilege in the society. One possible reason for this phenomenon can be traced back from the nation's historical pattern.

> "Black men were given the vote a half-century before women of any race were allowed to mark a ballot, and generally have ascended to positions of power, from the military

to the boardroom, before any women," (Steinem, "Women Are Never Front-Runners").

That being said, when people have to choose between men vs. women within a bigger scope of gender vs. race, it seems that the answer remains on the favor of man, despite the fact that he comes from minority group. Thus, applying this hypothesis in 2008 Presidential Election, there was no room for a woman to be a president simply because U.S president should be a man, even if it means a Black man.

On the other side of the globe, as a newly-born democratic country, Indonesia was earlier than America to have its first female president. Taking the throne from former president Abdurrahman Wahid in 2001 to 2004, Megawati Soekarno Putri was the first female president in Indonesian political history. *DPR*'s (People's Consultative Assembly) announcement to raise Megawati as president is quite interesting, given that Indonesia has the biggest Muslim community in the world. The influence of Islamic teachings is profoundly-spread in every aspect of Indonesian's society, including in politics. Some Islamic leaders have strict teaching that only men can be a leader (*khalifah*), while women should just

be a loyal and obedient follower. Based on this view, women stand no chance to be a group leader, let alone to be the president of the nation.

In 2004, when her presidential duties ended, Megawati ran for the presidential election for the second time. This time, Megawati's party had to deal with not only her political opponents, but also attacks from the right wing. The largest religious organization in Indonesia, *MUI* (Board of Islamic Leaders) issued a *fatwa* (religious instructions) stating that it is forbidden for a woman to be a primary leader, such as president and governor (Liputan6, "MUI Yogyakarta Mengeluarkan Fatwa Haram soal Capres"). While the fatwa did not necessarily refer to Megawati, it affected her candidacy and might break her step to the throne. The issue of whether or not a woman can be a leader has always been becoming a polemic that leads to continuous debate among *MUI* bigwigs. However, considering how the fatwa was raised during the very moment of presidential election, there was an implication that the fatwa was occupied with political interest rather than public's interest.

By comparing what happened to Hillary and Megawati, we can see that both women had to face great obstacles in their way to presidency. Despite the existence of democratic ideology which offers equality, it seems that traditional and cultural gender view remains critical in how society perceives woman as a leader in both countries. As many have noted, traditional value in almost every society always puts women in the lower position than men. According to this value, a woman is not suitable to be a leader because naturally, her main duty is giving birth and nurturing children. So when a woman tries to break this traditional value, that is becoming a leader, she will be considered as evil, witch, or even monster for being too 'greedy' for power that she should not own. Women are excluded from many kind of jobs because the men who control the jobs define them as 'stupid', 'delicate', and 'emotional,' (Zanden, 1988). Here, women are distinguished for their emotional feelings. While in the workplace, as men argue, rational thinking is more important than emotional feelings. Therefore, it further confirms the conception that women should just stay at home and take care of the children to justify women's exclusion from job opportunity, such as those in political area.

Politics is still widely conceived as men's territory, so is the default type of a

president. Consequently, when a woman runs for presidential candidacy, she has to work more than their fellow men in order to get acknowledged by the constituents. Nowadays, the advance of technology has made it easier to do that. With the help of media power, each candidate builds their own image to appeal the voters. Media remains to be an effective means to promote and spread information because it can reach wide mass and audience. Thus, media creates such kind of imagery and frames toward certain political figure either to support or bring them down.

Women's position in political arena has always been inferior to men. So is their position in media. A research found that it is common for women to get less news coverage than men during campaign (Holtz-Bacha, 2013). Much worse, when they manage to get news coverage, media tends to deliver negative traits and usually focuses on their private life such as family, hobby, and physical appearance, rather than their achievement in leadership and political activities. This kind of coverage, more or less, does contribute in their winning or losing in the elections because society's perception is greatly influenced by media.

Thus, in this research, I analyze how media has shaped and framed Hillary Clinton in her 2008 presidential candidacy and Megawati Soekarno Putri in her 2004 presidential campaign. Megawati and Hillary represent two of the most prominent women politician in their countries. However, it should be noted that they are not 'ordinary women' because they were wife and daughter of former leaders in America and Indonesia. With 'great' men behind their backs, it comes as no surprise that these male figures leave significant influences in these women's way to presidency.

Methodology

This research is conducted under the framework of American Studies. American Studies in itself belongs to interdisciplinary field, which is beneficial to obtain not only a new angle on traditional subject matter, but also to look on an event from several angles. Additionally, the concept of culture in American Studies revolves, cuts across, and includes the content of all other disciplines (Sykes, 1963: 254-256). Since the research discusses about women politician, women studies on gender theory is used to see traditional and cultural views on women gender role.

Gender, that is the feminine and masculine, is not born into one, but rather

emerges as one develops and experiences life. It is a socially-constructed concept created through various network of forces that intersects as one grows. More or less, gender concept affects our way of seeing and understanding things. For example, gender role has been successfully excluding women's access from leadership and decision-making positions either in domestic or public area (Lois, 2006).

Socio-historical approach is also important to see the past and present of political life in America and Indonesia in order to understand why particular political issue arising in both countries. Furthermore, communication theory such as media framing is used because the research deals with how media represents women.

McDowell's concept of past, present, and future in American Studies is also important in this research. "Today American Studies are using the resources of the new learning to bridge past and future," (McDowell, 1984). It means that by looking at the past and learning about it, we might understand the reasons of why something happens in the present. By evaluating the past, we find explanations about present conditions, and thus predict what will happen in the future.

This research also applied McDowell's reconciliation of region, nation, and world concept. Looking geographically, it is no doubt that Indonesia is far away from the United States. However, historically, Indonesia and America have been interrelated since a long time ago even before Indonesia is independent from Dutch colonialism. In a book entitled *American Visions of the Netherlands East Indies/Indonesia: US Foreign Policy and Indonesian Nationalism 1920-1949* (2003), Francis Gouda explains how American democracy has influenced Indonesian later independence.

By comparing two women politicians running for presidential candidacy in two democratic countries, the study would like to find out how democracy has been adopted in politics and gender both in the United States and Indonesia.

The main data of the research are collections of curated news coverage related to Hillary Clinton's and Megawati Soekarno Putri's presidential candidacy. For Hillary, the news are taken from five most popular websites based on Nieman Lab's *Top 15 newspaper sites of 2008* as follows; *The New York Times, USA Today, The Washington Post, The Los Angeles*

Times, and *The Wall Street Journal*. While for Megawati, the news from three most popular websites based on Alexa Rank; *Detik, Liputan6,* and *Tempo* are used. The popularity of these particular media at the time (2004 and 2008) becomes the main consideration of choosing the data. More popular the news platform means more people read and follow them, which also means that it will shape more people's opinion. Although *Kompas* and *Tribun news* are noted on Alexa Rank with high scores, they are not included in the research because there are no published article archives from 2004.

Despite the utmost efforts done to find the same amount of articles from Indonesia and America, it is inevitable that the data cannot be *apple-to-apple*. Owing to the lack source of data, the number of articles analyzed in this research is not the same (25 articles on Hillary and 14 articles on Megawati).

In analyzing the data, this research uses Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA), especially Teun van Dijk's theory. CDA is used to see how a text is established by observing the social and political context in which the text is shaped and developed. This theory is developed from the idea that there is no such thing as 'value-free' (van Dijk, 2001), because a text does not merely fall from the sky or emerge from a vacuum, but rather formed by a particular discourse in the society. This discourse is closely related to power control which dominates and even hegemonizes certain groups. For example, when a text is written with strong sense of women marginalization, it requires an observation of how the text can work and take form.

Van Dijk combines three dimensions of discourse analysis; text, social cognition, and context (Eriyanto, 2001). In text dimension, van Dijk observes basic components of a text, such as the theme, the framework, as well as the writing style and word choice. Then, social cognition refers to the awareness, knowledge, or point of view which is used by journalist or writer in the process of text production.

Within CDA, theory of media framing analysis is used to scrutinize the data (news texts). Framing analysis is an approach to see the journalist' perspective in selecting an issue and writing the news to be more meaningful and appealing to the readers (Sobur, 2001). However, the salience of news should be in accordance with the society's belief and ideology so it can be accepted by the society. Thus, the use of categories and stereotypes become an important element in framing theory (*ibid*). The involvement of journalist'

perspective, value, and ideology play an important role in deciding which facts to deliver, to emphasize, or to ignore. According to Robert Entman, there are four functions of framing, including problem identification (seeing an event as positive or negative), causal interpretation (seeing the source of problem), moral evaluation, and treatment recommendation (Entman in Sobur, 2001).

Discussion

Thanks to the advancement of technology, everything can be found easily on the internet today. *'If you cannot find something on the internet, maybe that thing actually never exists in the real world too'.* This expression shows the prevalent influence of internet in nowadays lifestyle. With the advance of technology and information, latest news are discovered and created in seconds. To accommodate people's need for quick and reliable news source, many once printed-based newspapers are now moving their platform to online-based news website. Despite the change of media, the news principle remains the same. In presenting particular news, topics, or issues, journalists are greatly influenced by their point of view to develop certain opinion towards the matters. Because of this

viewpoint, media will select particular issues that fit their norms and values to construct the outline of their news. And thus, framing is the outcome of this process.

In this research, it is found that there are five most common themes used by media in their framing of women politician.

Family and Personal Issue

It is irrefutable that women and family is an inseparable entity. Based on this notion, the belief that the best place for every woman is in their home and the only career they can pursue is housewife has always been rooted and ingrained in the society. Supported by values and norms which favor patriarchal system such as religion, the notion that women should just stay at home becomes the basic reason to prevent women from working outside the home, including in politics. That being said, it is no surprise that media keeps showing a bias tendency when it comes to the representation of woman politician. In the coverage of female politicians, media often put on wrong focus and attention by talking more about trivial and private matters such as family and personal issue.

As many have known, Megawati Soekarno Putri is the second daughter of

the first president of Indonesia, Soekarno. Titled as the Father of Proclamation, Soekarno is widely recognized for his excellent service in the struggle for Indonesian independence. Megawati is one of Soekarno's daughters who constantly attracts media's attention, especially when she decided to pursue a political career in the 1990s.

The research finds that there are several articles published in Indonesian mainstream media which continuously related Megawati to her family issues. One of the articles discussing about Megawati and her family was *Sukma: Rachma akan Dukung Mega* (trans. *Sukma: Rachma will Support Mega*) published on *Detik*. Here, the writer used the unification of Soekarno's daughters as the news frame to talk about Megawati's family. *Putra-putri Bung Karno Berkumpul* (trans. *Soekarno's Daughters Gathered*) published in Tempo also put internal conflict within the Soekarnos family as the main frame. Furthermore, media reference to family was also found in Liputan6's *Megawati, dari Ibu Rumah Tangga Menjadi Presiden* (trans. *Megawati, from a Housewife to be a President*). On their coverage, media often implied that '*Megawati was just a housewife happen to be Soekarno's daughter*', a sense that media took lightly

of her political ability. Observing such patterns, we can see how media would prefer to talk about female politician's relationship with their powerful family member, rather than talking about their own political ideas.

Meanwhile, American media also made coverages about Hillary Clinton in relation to her family and personal matters. If Megawati was highly associated with her father Soekarno, then Hillary was vastly linked with her husband who was also the 42nd president of America, Bill Clinton. As Bill Clinton was publicly known as controversial figure with his extramarital scandal with Monica Lewinsky in 1993, media often talked about this subject in their coverage of Hillary Clinton. Some examples can be found in Washington Post's *Clinton Talks about Dark Times,* the New York Times' *Clinton Proudly Talks of Scars While Keeping Her Guard Up,* and USA Today's *Clinton's faith helped her cope with husband's infidelity*. Here, we can see that the writers used family framing by placing woman in private sphere. This suggested that female politician can never be separated from family issue, especially when they have bad record about it.

Besides the scandal, media also frequently brought up topic about Hillary's

reliance on Bill Clinton. Examples can be seen from The Wall Street Journal's *Two Presidents in the White House?* and the Los Angeles Times' *Hillary Clinton cold, calculating? Not according to Bill*.

Women and Gender Issues

It is no secret that women and gender issues often become the main vision and mission raised by female politicians when they run for political position. Employing this strategy, on one hand a female politician will have bigger chance to gain votes from the constituents, especially those who concerns on women issue. On the other hand, it may actually be detrimental because, once again, it implies that woman is destined only to take care of domestic issues, with only wider area here. This notion is strengthened by media's constant coverage of women figure's involvement in womanly issue and topics, such as education, childcare, healthcare, food, and other social affairs. It seems that it is easier to find media's coverage of women's participation in womanly and 'soft' activities rather than their contribution in manly and 'rough' issues such as state security, war, or gun policy.

This issue can be seen from the USA Today's *Clinton unveils details of her health care plan* and the Washington Post's *Clinton Presents Plan for Universal Coverage*. As the title suggests, both articles talk about Hillary's presentation of her health care plan details for presidential campaign. With strong reference to her failed health care plan during Bill's presidency, media seems to provoke people to underestimate Hillary's ability in dealing this issue. Besides health issue, gender issue is often brought up by media, especially on how Hillary tried playing with gender card as her campaign strategy. Examples can be seen from The New York Times' *Gift of Gall,* the Los Angeles Times' *Hillary plays the winning gender card*, and Wall Street Journal's *Did Sexism Derail Hillary Clinton?*

On the other hand, media in Indonesia also associate Megawati with women and gender issue, which can be found in Liputan6's *Megawati Meminta Perempuan Mendukung Capres Wanita* (trans. *Megawati Asked Women to Support Woman Candidate*) and Detik's *Menneg PP: Semoga Ibu Mega Terpilih dalam Pemilu 2004-2009* (trans. *Minister of Women's Empowerment: I Hope Mrs. Mega Will be Chosen in 2004-2009 Election*). In both articles, the writers emphasize how Megawati takes advantage of her status as a woman to gain sympathy

from other fellow women. However, in an article published in Tempo entitled *Megawati Diminta Peduli Terhadap Nasib Perempuan dan Anak-anak* (trans. *Megawati Asked to Care for Women and Children's Issues*), Megawati is criticized by a women forum for her ignorant behavior towards women and children issues. Here, Megawati is seen only as symbol rather than a real woman leader.

Fashion and Physical Appearance

Aside from her natural instinct, being pretty seems to have become a social demand for every women, especially those who work in public spaces such as politicians. No wonder, then, fashion and physical appearance often become the main topics raised when media reported on women politicians. If this kind of coverage only happens once or twice for a while, then it could be counted for intermezzo or entertainment purposes only. Unfortunately, media often distort their focus more on female politician's physical appearance rather than their brains and inner qualities. Be it a praise or criticism, media's excessive devotion on female's appearance indicate that in media coverage, women continue playing the supporting role in politics rather than the main role.

One of the most controversial articles that invoke wide debates is published in The Washington Post entitled *Hillary Clinton's Tentative Dip into New Territory Neckline* and the Los Angeles Times' *Cleaving over Hillary's cleavage*. By framing women politician using their physical appearance, it feels like Hillary's bodily appearance, compared to what she presented on the event, was a greater issue that public should focus on. This kind of notion would be misleading, because readers are invited to focus on physical appearance rather than the content of Hillary's speech at that night.

Women's passion for fashion issue also becomes the main theme in several media platform such as in The New York Times' *Hillary Clinton as the Fashion Police: My Polka-Dot Dress Should Be Arrested,* Wall Street Journal's *Women in Power: Finding Balance In the Wardrobe*, and USA Today's *Out-of-style thinking.* These articles talk about problematic relationship between woman politician and fashion in public discussion. While not all of these articles use negative tone, nevertheless this implies that women are still trivialized in politics by media's constant identification on things that have nothing to do with political issues they represent.

Although Indonesian media do not show much attention to Megawati's appearance, at some point they tend to highlight female politician's association with something feminine such as fashion show. An example can be found in Tempo's article *Megawati Buka Acara Kuntum Kahyangan di Istana Bogor* (trans. *Megawati Opened Kuntum Kahyangan Event in Bogor Presidential Palace*). The event was a batik exhibition and fashion show attended by important figures in Indonesian government. Here, we can see that media makes Megawati's visit to a fashion show as a big deal that needs to be emphasized. On the other hand, in Detik's *Perempuan Pro-Reformasi Kecam Ajakan Pilih Paling Cantik* (trans. *Pro-Reformation Women Cavil the Invitation to Vote for The Prettiest One*), Megawati is criticized for being sexist because of her remarks during a campaign. Using Megawati's remark as frame, the writer suggests the readers to perceive Megawati as a sexist figure who sees woman only from their physical appearance rather than actual brains.

Political Relation

Political relations often arise from kinship, such as parents to the children, grandfather to the grandson, a husband to his wife, or vice versa. If a family possesses a strong political background, it becomes a kind of tradition that the family's next generation will follow their predecessors' steps into politics. Considering the phenomenon of such political relations happening a lot around the world, media often link women politicians with their family members who have powerful positions in the government.

Political relation becomes an important issue as many American media cover the issue in their articles, such as the Washington Post's *Hillary Clinton Embraces Her Husband's Legacy*, the Wall Street Journal's *In Evoking Good of '90s, Clinton Risks Memories of the Bad,* and the New York Times' *The Clintons Campaign in New Hampshire.* Although public knows that Hillary is an independent individual who has a political track record of her own, in fact, her relationship with the former president cannot be separated since people keep judging her marriage with Bill. At this point, we can see how media often bring up political relations issue between woman candidates with the previous rulers. Be it positive or negative, it seems that women in media have not been able to stand as an independent individual.

Thus, media used other variable to assess their quality as a leader; that is to see their relationship with other male politicians. Moreover, the Los Angeles Times' *Hillary and Bill Clinton in Defeat and victory: When pictures tell the story* and USA Today's *Question for Hillary: What will Bill's impact be?* also talk about Bill's powerful influence to Hillary's way to presidency.

In Indonesian media, Megawati's figure is also closely linked to her predecessor, Soekarno. This trait can be found explicitly in Tempo's article *Guruh Minta Rakyat Beri Mega Waktu Lima Tahun Lagi* (trans. *Guruh Ask the People to Give Mega More Five Years),* Detik's *Ratusan Orang Hadiri Haul Bung Karno di Perintis Kemerdekaan* (trans. *Hundreds People Attend Soekarno's Death Anniversary in Perintis Kemerdekaan*), as well as Liputan6's *Megawati: Saya Sudah Bekerja Maksimal* (trans. *Megawati: I Have Worked Maximum*). In almost every chance, whether it comes from her own campaign spokesperson, her political rivals, or people's opinion, the reference of Megawati as Soekarno's daughter is always brought up by media.

Stereotypes and Negative Traits

Stereotype and media can never be separated. Media uses stereotype as a way to perpetuate social perception in favor of particular class or group. While several stereotypes are positive, negative stereotypes are at risk of becoming a kind of blind generalization, which makes it become the common reason of one group to isolate or even bully other groups. Mass media such as newspapers also employ stereotypes as their main frame in creating news coverage of women politicians.

Media often use strong tone of gender stereotypes in their coverage of woman politician. For example, the Los Angeles Times *Clinton the organized* which denounces woman's organized character or USA Today's *Has the political risk of emotion, tears faded?* which talks about woman's emotional state. Besides stereotypes, media are also fond of writing coverage about the disadvantage of being women. An example is The New York Times' *Women Are Never Front-Runners*. Not only that, media also talk negative traits of woman as seen in the Washington Post's *We Scream, We Swoon. How Dumb Can We Get?* and The Wall Street Journal's article *Sex and the Presidency.* It seemed that media always finds a way to criticize female

politicians and put them in awry position. If they show dominant feminine side such as Congressman Nancy Pelosi, they are condemned as not strong enough to lead the country. However, if they do the opposite and show their strong and tough side, women will be judged by media as ambitious person who makes them deficient as a woman.

In Indonesian media, stereotypes might not be the main theme raised by media in their coverage of woman politician. Rather than that, media often relates woman leader and religion, especially Islamic view. Examples can be found inLiputan6's *Kiai NU Jatim Menolak Presiden Wanita* (trans. *NU Priests in East Java Refuse Woman President*) and Tempo's *Tim Sukses Mega-Hasyim Minta Dukungan Ulama Banten* (trans. *Mega-Hasyim's Campaign Team to Ask Support from Bantenese Islamic Leaders*). In both articles, media blows up the news about Islamic religious leaders' agreement to forbid woman candidacy as president. Despite the seemingly neutral tone, by using particular frame that corner woman leaders' position, the writer suggests that woman should not be chosen as leader since it is not in line with religious belief. Not only religion, personal character also becomes media's focus. For

example, *Detik*'s article *Berlomba Mencari Simpati Massa* (trans. *Race for People's Sympathy*) also talks about how Megawati has made use her privilege as president to gain political benefits for herself.

Framing as the result of media and journalists' filter contributes to the creation of public's opinion toward certain news. In fact, at one point, media coverage toward particular candidates can profoundly affect election outcomes. Specifically, gender bias in media coverage can disadvantage female candidates than male candidates in the same race (Uscinski and Goren, 2001: 855). In the case of Hillary Clinton's presidential bid on 2008, she was defeated by her rival, Barack Obama at the end. It also happened to Megawati Soekarno Putri who was stopped in the second round of 2004 presidential election after being defeated by Susilo Bambang Yudhoyono.

Particularly in Hillary's case, many people especially feminists argued that sexist media coverage had driven her out of the race. Meanwhile, in Indonesia, there was no party claiming the existence of sexist media coverage toward Megawati. Although there is a uniform tendency for media to cover particular issues, each media gives different emphasis and portion

in allocating their slot to present this news. In theory of Critical Discourse Analysis, van Dijk explains that social cognition is vital in analyzing a news item in order to get a better understanding of the social context. Through social cognition, we can assess how media and journalists behind news production work and think. Thus, we can figure out how the news is produced and what factors make the news framing significant.

Social Perception of Woman as Leader

Stereotype is one among many things that will limit someone's perception toward something. Due to stereotype, one's perception will be mechanically formed by the knowledge he acquires socially rather than by his own experience. As consequence, his interpretation toward this matter will be very partial. In the previous sub-chapter analysis, we find that media often make use stereotype in their framings toward women politician. Because of stereotype, one ordinary issue can be perceived and even turned into something extra-ordinary and sensational when it is committed by a female politician. For example is crying, a common emotional activity which causes mixed public response when media spotted a woman politician sheds tears in an event.

Social perception on woman's relationship with her family also influences media coverage on women politician. Incidentally, two figures discussed in this research are known with their intimate relationship with previous power-holders in Indonesia and America, so media provides coverage on this issue too.

Media Ideology

Behind the creation of framing, there is definitely media ideology interest. As repeatedly stated, media plays a great role in shaping people's opinion towards particular topics. Media as the channel of information do not necessarily tell the public an information as it is, but rather filter and develop the information first through a framing process. Although objectivity should be the main goal for every media, we should note that there is no media which is a hundred percent neutral in their editorial, since there remain some gaps of subjectivity influenced by certain ideology. In the United States, copious studies have been conducted to examine media's affiliation with particular political faction as well as their coverage affinity, whether it inclines more to the right wing (conservative) or left wing (liberal). Thus, people could know better where the editorial tends to side.

Meanwhile, in Indonesia, there are not much studies conducted to examine media's affiliation and inclination toward particular political groups. Different from America public which sees the importance of clear statement on media's political stance, there is yet a study on the level of liberalism or conservatism of Indonesian online news media. From three online news media used in this research; *Tempo, Detik,* and *Liputan6*, there is no study yet mentioning their affiliation on political groups. Nevertheless, Goenawan Mohamad, *Tempo*'s senior journalist stated that media does not have to be neutral, but media should not spread rumors as well as tell lies against certain parties (Tempo, "Goenawan Mohamad: Media Tak Harus Netral").

Political Dynasty

One striking similarity between Hillary Clinton and Megawati Soekarno Putri is that both have family member that once ruled the country. Furthermore, the men behind these women politician are recognized for their excellent leadership track record that they have strong supporter basis even after they step down from presidency. Given the central role of Bill Clinton for America and Soekarno for Indonesia, many media associate these

figures with women politician when Hillary and Megawati's presidential candidacy coming to the surface. Either directly or indirectly, media argue that women's popularity or involvement in politics has something to do with their husband's and father's big names. It implies that if only Hillary were not Bill's wife or Megawati were not Soekarno's daughter, they would not be able to reach the position they achieved today. Here, media underestimate the ability of women's leadership by constantly reflect on the fact that they have direct and close relationship with the former leaders.

Considering the pervasive social conception that woman will not make a great leader, in order to boost their electability, women need dominant figure as their backup support, which is male. This male figure plays a vital role in endorsing woman's character in politics since he is believed to be able to provide good example and mentoring for woman who wants to fight the other male candidates in the race. Stemming from this notion, many media employ political dynasty as their framing in presenting women politician coverage. As political dynasty has more negative connotation than the positive ones, media coverage on women politician within this theme often

leads to misleading conception that might backfire her image.

Conclusion

In Indonesia, the country's growing reputation as the biggest Moslem population in the world is predicted to influence the way media perceive woman leader. However, the research shows that it actually does not affect much towards political business. It is found that media do not pay much attention to the religious view of woman leader. There is neither direct objection from media while presenting news coverage about Megawati nor direct reference to certain religious interpretations. Instead of religious values, it seems that Indonesian media pay more attention to the candidate's political relation and social perception. Not only Megawati's family was highly scrutinized during her presidential campaign, media also keeps associating her with Soekarno. Media also repeatedly bring up stereotypical issue of woman politician such as focusing more on her physical appearance rather than her work plans. This way, media trivializes woman's candidacy by leading public's focus on minor things that have nothing to do with her political view.

On the other hand, American media still clings onto the stereotype of woman leader that it influences their way of presenting news coverage toward Hillary Clinton. The commonest traits used by media to talk about Hillary's candidacy are physical appearance and association of family. It is quite easy to find articles written in sexist and negative tones in describing Hillary's physical appearance and behavior. Finally, woman will never be separated from domestic issue as media find that talking about her marriage life is much more interesting than discussing her future work plans.

Towards the end, from the analysis of news coverage on Hillary Clinton and Megawati Soekarno Putri, we find striking difference between media in two countries. It seems that American press and media is way more open and at liberty in expressing their opinions toward particular candidates. As can be seen in the previous chapter, there are many articles with direct satirical remarks and sexist criticisms toward Hillary.

While in Indonesia, it is difficult to find the same thing. It seems that media are more reluctant in expressing their opinions toward Megawati. So if we look at it, media coverage on Megawati is done in much very subtler and implicit way, let

alone using satirical writing style. Meanwhile, media in America is more to the point and explicit in proposing their opinions about Hillary's candidacy. Finally, learning from the media framing toward woman politician, we can conclude that despite feminist achievement in many areas, woman are still highly perceived as unfit to be in political world.

References

Caroll, Susan J. 2009. Reflections on Gender and Hillary Clinton's Presidential Campaign: The Good, the Bad, and the Misogynic. *Politics & Gender, 5*. USA

Eriyanto.2001. *Analisis Wacana, Pengantar Analisis Teks Media.* Yogyakarta: LKiS

Gouda, Francis and Zaalberg, Thijs Brocades. 2003. *American Visions of the Netherlands East Indies/Indonesia: US Foreign Policy and Indonesian Nationalism 1920-1949).* Amsterdam University Press

Holtz-Bacha, Christina. 2013. Who takes care of the children? The presentation of female top politicians in the media. *Revista Compolítica, n. 3, vol. 2, ed.* jul-dez, ano 2013

Kellner, Douglas. 2002. Presidential Politics: The Movie. *AMERICAN BEHAVIORAL SCIENTIST*, Vol. 46 No. 4, December 2002 467-486

Lois, Tyson. 2006. *Critical Theory Today Second Edition.* New York: Routledge

McDowell, Tremaine. 1948. *American Studies.* Minneapolis: The University of Minnesota Press

Singh, Amrit, Skidmore, Max J, and Sequiera, Isaac (eds). 1995. *American Studies Today: An Introduction to Methods and Perspectives.* New Delhi*:* Creative Books

Sobur, Alex. 2001. *Analisis Teks Media.* Bandung: PT Remaja Rosda Karya

Sykes, Richard E. 1963. American Studies and the Concept of Culture. *American Quarterly, Vol. 15, No. 2, Part 2: Supplement (Summer, 1963)*, pp. 253-270. The John Hopkins University Press

Uscinski, Joseph E and Goren, Lilly J. 2011. What's in a Name? Coverage of Senator Hillary Clinton during the 2008 Democratic Primary. *Political Research Quarterly* 64(4) 884–896

Van Dijk, Teun A. 2001. "18 Critical discourse analysis". *The handbook of discourse analysis*, pp.349-371.

Zanden, James W. Vander. 1988. *The Social Experience: An Introduction to Sociology.* USA: Random House Inc

Electronic Sources

Bedard, Paul. *Media Sexism Doomed Hillary's 2008 Bid.* 2011. Retrieved from http://www.usnews.com/news/blogs/washington-whispers/2011/12/23/media-sexism-doomed-hillarys-2008-bid at January 6, 2015

Harper, Jennifer. *Gender bias did in Clinton?* 2008. Retrieved from http://www.washingtontimes.com/ne

ws/2008/jun/06/gender-bias-did-in-clinton/ at January 6, 2015

Liputan6. *MUI Yogyakarta Mengeluarkan Fatwa Haram soal Capres*. 2004. Retrieved from http://news.liputan6.com/read/81155/mui-yogyakarta-mengeluarkan-fatwa-haram-soal-capres at 16 February 2016

Steinem, Gloria. 2008. *Women Are Never Front-Runners* retrieved from http://www.nytimes.com/2008/01/08/opinion/08steinem.html at April 27, 2016

THE FORMULATION OF TASTE AND VALUE IN AMERICAN ACTION-SPY MOVIES: AN ANALYSIS OF *THE BOURNE* SAGA

Muchammad Sofyan Firmansyah
sofyanfirman19@gmail.com

Abstract

The popularity of Hollywood action movies is undisputed, especially the ones related to espionage. The movies such as the 007 series and Mission: Impossible series are best known as successful action-spy movies as they are always considered the top blockbuster movies. However, the start of the release of *The Bourne* movies in 2002 changed audiences' perspectives toward the depiction of espionage as commonly shown in *007* and *Mission: Impossible*. Four of The Bourne movies that consist of *The Bourne Identity* (2002), *The Bourne Supremacy* (2004), *The Bourne Ultimatum* (2007), and *The Bourne Legacy* (2011) are used as the object of this research. Furthermore, the different depictions of espionage in *The Bourne* movies successfully reached the attention of action-spy audiences. Many audiences from throughout the world expressed their feelings after watching these movies on the movie review site as IMDb.com. The audiences' responses toward the different portrait of espionage that are presented in the movies may depend on the taste of those audiences with regards to the depictions inside the movies that may present certain American values as the narrative of the movies concerns an American named Jason Bourne. There are two goals of this research. The first is to reveal whether there is any relation between audiences' taste and the values depicted in movie whether these movie are products of popular culture or not. The second is to know how these movies mold the American values in their narrative to appeal to the desire of audiences. This research is conducted under the American studies discipline, especially the paradigm of transnational American Studies. Furthermore, some theories are employed as tools to analyze the object in order to achieve the goal of this research. Conducted as qualitative research, books, movies, articles, and videos related to the focus of this research are used as supporting data.

Keywords: The Bourne, Audience, Taste, Value

Introduction

The popularity of Hollywood movies, especially the ones belonging to the action genre, is unbeatable. People tend to love in watching the depiction of action, especially the battles between good and evil. However, making these kinds of movie that is accepted by many people is not easy task to do. The moviemakers must mold certain aspects in society into their movies as one of many important ways to popularize their movies. They will go to such a great lengths of research in order to mold their movies into a reflection of the audiences' beliefs and values for the sake of the success of their movies (Nachbar & Lause, 1992, p. 7). This procces must be done because movie as a product of popular culture must carry cultural beliefs as they express complex feelings, values, and ideas

through symbols and myths (Cawelti, 1976, p. 7).

These action movies have certain formulas that always attract people to watch it. The formula such as "the narrative that tends to show the battle between the good versus the bad (Adi, 2008, p. 68)", has been repeatedly adapted to some action movies, some of it become box office hits. It is not a secret that some action movies such as *Die Hard*, *Cliff Hanger*, *Lethal Weapon* and *Under Siege* were also popular because of their adaptation to the action formula.

Nowadays, the action movies with depiction of espionage have become the most popular ones. Some box-office movies such as the *007* franchise, *Mission: Impossible* franchise, and *Jack Ryan* franchise present the same depiction of espionage. The repetition of the depiction of espionage in action movies established a success that has created an independent sub-genre, spy, under the action genre. Some small budgeted movies such as *Kingsman: The Secret Service* (2015) and *Hitman: Agent 45* (2015) that adapted the depiction has also been profitable.

However, the depiction of the action formula that is repeated in many action movies makes the audiences want to see something different. Consequently,

moviemakers have to observe the latest issues that are happened on the society in order to create a movie that will meet audiences' tastes. Furthermore, moviemakers also must imply certain values of society in the narrative of their movies in order to attract the audiences, as Brockmeier & Carbaugh (2001) argued "narrative is erected upon a universal value-logic of presumably 'good reasons' that it presumes particular beliefs and actions as a condition for its production (p. 11)."

On 2000s, *The Bourne Series* that is an adaptation of Robert Ludlum's famous novel is presented differently rather than other action movies at that time. The movie which currently consists of four movies: *The Bourne Identity* (2002), *The Bourne Supremacy* (2004), *The Bourne Ultimatum* (2007), and *The Bourne Legacy* (2011). These movies show a different depiction of the threat while some action movies depict the superiority of the nation in facing international threats. Rather showing the mainstream depictions of action movies, *The Bourne* contrastly depicts the world of action movie. It reflects a culture and collective identities steeped in marketing, popular culture, consumerism, and fear on a society (Froula, Randell, & Birkerstein, 2010, p. 11).

Jason Bourne as the hero of *The Bourne* movies is different to majority of action-spy heroes such as James Bond, Ethan Hunt, or Jack Ryan who are always depicted as being professional. Most of them work as federal agents who are specifically dealing with international issues. They, as hero, must have certain motives, such as; securing the condition and peace of the society, solving certain problems, or personal motives such as revenge (Adi, 2008, p. 68). In contrast, the hero in *The Bourne Series* is a man who lost his memories and only wants to know his identity. To be called as a hero, his motive is unclear as well as his mission.

The product of popular culture as a Hollywood movie that is produced by Americans reflects the beliefs and values of their society. The evolving ideas and perspectives of the society may affect the changing of the depiction inside those cultural products. Thus, the popular culture here is put on attention, because there is a mutual relationship between the society and the industry of popular culture, in which the products are reflecting the cultural values that exist in the society. There is a tendency to use popular culture to control the societies through certain depictions in it.

In this case, the tastes and values that are implied in the movies are seen from their representation through the scenes, dialogues and acts of the characters. The representation of taste may reflect the changing depiction of action in the movie. In addition, the values presented in the movies have some relation to the reception of the audiences through the popularity and profits gained by the movies. The present researcher sees *The Bourne* movies as the media to control the tastes and values not only American society, the global society as well. Therefore, the approach of transnational American Studies is employed in this study to identify the research problems.

Methodology

This research is conducted in the inductive qualitative methodology, as it is mainly a literature study that relies heavily on library research. Creswell explains about the qualitative research method in the book *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative and Mixed Method Approaches*, as he states that:

> Qualitative research is a form of interpretive inquiry in which researchers make an interpretation of what they see, hear, and understand. Their interpretations cannot be separated from their own backgrounds, history, contexts, and prior understandings. After a research report is issued, the readers make an interpretation as well as the

participants, offering yet other interpretations of the study (Creswell, 2003, p. 212).

In the qualitative research method, the data collection and analysis are conducted simultaneously, focusing on discovering the nature of the specific events under study through inductive reasoning. The data are presented in a straightforward manner, as a descriptive summary of the selected events resulting in a straightforward description of the phenomenon being examined.

The main purpose of this research is to seek the formation of taste and social values shaped by popular culture, especially with regard to the movie, which are not only related to the represented but also those related to the audiences' reception toward it. This research is particularly conducted to discover the formulation of these movies and the factors that made them globally popular in line with the response from audiences. The representation proposed by Stuart Hall is used to analyze the mechanism of taste and social values in the popular culture, especially in movies. This representation seeks to show what do the movies stand for, present, and represent. The data consists of images, scenes, and dialogues from each movie on *The Bourne* Trilogy

that were selectively picked in order to understand the depiction of messages that are encoded before analyzing them using the process of decoding. These decoding and encoding processes are important to gain knowledge of American social values represented in the movies.

Furthermore, these formulations will be related to audiences' response as found in the secondary data to know whether there is a relationship between the tastes and values in the movie and the audiences or not. Since the analysis is also related to the audiences of action-spy movies, Roland Barthes' reception theory is applied. Other secondary data is utilized and taken from box office revenue to know the public reception of the movies. These secondary data will be processed and will support the finding of decoding and encoding processes. Thus, the results found from the analysis of taste and values are related to the habit of the audiences, as the concept of habitus from Herbert Gans is employed to understand whether the reaction of audiences toward the taste and social values in the movies is related to their surroundings or not. Furthermore, Foucault's concept of power is used to analyze more deeply, whether these movies tend to change or even control the society by the depictions inside it.

Discussion

Developing the Action-Spy Movie into Audiences' Desire

Many action movies show the same depiction of the hero against the criminals who threaten and endanger the peace of the country. The introduction to the heroes and villains tends to be shown at the beginning of the narration. Moreover, those action movies illustrate the excellence of hero and his ability to pursue and capture the villain. The audience has not stopped watching action movies despite such depictions having been shown too often even by action-prone movies. This is because the audience loves the action scenes of fights between the hero and the villain shown by action movies. These action movies are also more interesting to watch because of the appearance of handsome and beautiful actors. Furthermore, the depiction of modern technological devices shown in the movies makes the acts in movies appear more convincing. Despite the formula of making no assertions about 'quality': the movies it selects for examination may or may not be the 'best' ones produced. Highlighting the function of the formula, Nachbar & Lause (1992) stated the formula leads us to ask why these movies achieved such remarkable popularity, not to

determine whether they 'deserve' to be successful (p.41).

Furthermore, there is a tendency to reproduce certain formulas of action that have already been successful in movies with the hope that the new movie will become a blockbuster. This successful formula is repeatedly demonstrated in many action movies, though the movies cast different actors and present different plots. Furthermore, the repetition of certain formulas creates a sub-genre. A movie that is considered the best by most movie critics often has many elements and is categorized by a complex combination of genres (Adi, 2008, p. 69). Some action movies tend to show the similar depiction of action from the previous movies. The example is the *007* franchise as its sequels are still produced, with the latest sequel entitled *007: Spectre* released in 2015. The sequels are still about a British agent named James Bond who works for MI6. Although many actors have already played the role of James Bond, but the hero's characteristics are still the same, as he is depicted as a disobedient agent that does not follow the agency's protocols while doing his missions. The movies repeatedly depicted similar formulas of action; the luxurious sport cars, some beautiful women as supporting characters, hi-tech devices, and

explosions. Adapting the *007* formula, the *Mission: Impossible* movies have also inherited the success of *007* as they are also considered as blockbuster movies.

However, Hollywood has tried to present different depiction of action genre as it combines the genre to some formulas of various genres. The first step of Hollywood in presenting different depiction of action genre was in 2002 At that time, Hollywood released the screen adaptation from Robert Ludlum's novels entitled *The Bourne series,* hoping the popularity of the movie will be raising as high as the novel that shows the depiction of action as the formula has flavoured with espionage. The first Bourne movie was very unexpected in the audience's eyes as if the audience's got a new experience from watching action movie. Although the profit gained by the movies was not as much as the sequel of *007* or *Mission: Impossible, The Bourne* series got the attention of global audiences. The first movie was released in 2002 under the title of *The Bourne Identity*. Doug Liman directed and the scriptwriter was Tony Gilroy for this first series. IMDb rated the movie 7.9 stars and Metacritic rated it 68% (www.imdb.com). However, it only earned a worldwide gross of $214.034.224 (www.boxofficemojo), which is far from competing with *Mission:*

Impossible II, but the movie itself was successful in capturing the audiences' attention. Responding to the audiences' curiosity about the sequel to first movie, *The Bourne Supremacy* was released two years later. Doug Liman was replaced by Paul Greengrass. Toni Gilroy still remained the scriptwriter for these movies. It seems that Greengrass successfully developed *The Bourne* movies into action movies that audiences wanted to see. Greengrass showed his capability as a professional director of action movies and this showed in the increase in profit made by the release of *The Bourne Supremacy* (2004). Hollywood trusted him to return to direct the third movie in the series, *The Bourne Ultimatum* (2007) because of the success of the second movie. Hollywood expected the third movie to be more spectacular than the previous ones and fortunately it earned $442.824.138 at the box office worldwide.

Jason Bourne, Ethan, James Bond

Furthermore, Hollywood released a movie that was entitled *The Bourne Legacy* in 2011 in order to seek more profit. This

movie was based on book in the continued series of Ludlum's Bourne novels written by Van Lustbader, who has already written nine new novels to add to Ludlum's Bourne novel series. In the first announcement of the release date of *The Bourne Legacy*, many action movie lovers put high expectations on this movie because it starred by Jeremy Renner and Rachel Weisz. Another factor that is increasing the audiences' expectations toward this movie was that Tony Gilroy who was the screenwriter of the previous three *The Bourne* series was chosen as director of this movie. Unfortunately, the worldwide gross gained by this movie was less than the previous movies. This movie only earned $276.144.750 worldwide. The release of the *Bourne* movies can be called as an experiment of Hollywood to know the reaction and respond of audiences.

The Bourne movies challenge the established depiction of the action agent, often illustrated as someone who actively works for a certain agency such as the KGB, CIA, MI6, SWAT, or U.S. military forces. This narrative does not clearly display the hero's identity at the beginning of the movie as other action movies before did. The first movie, *The Bourne Identity* (2002), started by showing a man who had four bullets in his back floating in the sea

was helped by a fisherman. Furthermore, the man suffers amnesia which prevents him from even remembering his name. He is only identified by a chip with a bank account implanted on his hip.

Furthermore, audiences will be confused about how to judge whether that man is the hero or not as *The Bourne* movies do not depict the man as a stereotypical hero that is already familiar to the audience; a handsome-man wearing a nice tuxedo who drives super modern cars and has the best weapons. The audiences get confused with the quality of the man who fits the role of hero in the action movie, as the identity of the man is not clearly presented. The identity is important for people to be able to identify each other. Margaret Wetherell (2009) explained that:

> Identity draws attention to 'names' and 'looks'. It is lived out in grand narratives and performances which construct sometimes passionately invested 'imagined' routes and destinies as well as in the more mundane arenas of everyday interaction, inter-subjective relations and in social institutions. Identity guides and predicts social action. It highlights positions and intelligibility defining what is possible and livable and what is unthinkable and excessively troubled (Wetherell, 2009).

Looking to the character of the man who loses his memory in the movie, of course

he cannot be considered as a hero. The audience is confused about whether to call the man a hero or an agent of action because the identity of that man is not clearly presented in the narration. How can the hero or agent accomplish his mission if he does not even know his identity? Using this question, the movie attracts the audiences' curiosity about discovering who the man is.

A passport with Jason Bourne name printed on it. (Identity, 2009)

The acts inside *the Bourne* movies look real, as the audiences believe that they can meet those espionage activities in the real life. Although *007* and *Mission: Impossible* present their heroes clearly as the fights between the heroes and villains happened right after the heroes were introduced. The introduction of the hero is rarely presented by using an authorized citizenship identity card or a passport. It is different with *The Bourne* movies in that the hero knows his name firstly from his passports. In addition, although he has four other legal passports from four different nations with four different names, his

awareness toward his identity as American makes the hero choose Jason Bourne as his name as it is printed in his United States passport.

Driving Audience's Taste to Action – Spy Genre.

Summer means not only holiday for American people but it is also a period for movie producers to release commercial movies, especially big-budget movies. The movies that are released in summer usually have the more general themes of family, action, animation, book or comic book adaptation, and sequels. The studios even schedule the release of big-budget movies in summer in order to gain the production cost back and to win box office revenue. All of *The Bourne* series that was produced by Universal Pictures is also released on summer. Doug Liman, the director, had approached many action actors such as Brad Pitt, Russell Crowe, Arnold Schwarzenegger, Tom Cruise and Sylvester Stallone who all refused to play the role of Jason Bourne before he cast Matt Damon. In addition, Doug Liman was not wrong in choosing Matt Damon (Hanrahan, 2007) who bravely plays dangerous scene himself while played the role of Jason Bourne. Damon even trained by a stunt choreographer, Nick Powell, for three

months to be able to use guns and martial arts.

The proccess of casting of the main character is very important for the popularity of the movie. Audiences tend to watch a movie with famous actors or actresses in it. However, we can not say that famous actors or actresses is the important key to make a movie become popular or even be watched. In fact, some movies starred by famous actors or actresses even fail to reach popularity. The measurement of the movie's popularity is the acceptance of the audiences to the story, plot, and movie itself.

Another effort to make the movie become world wide success is screening. The movie's studios often hold private screenings for their movies, especially for small-budget movies. The studio invites movie critics, board members of the Academy of Motion Picture Arts and Sciences, and selected press to join the private screening in order to give feedback about the movie screened. The movies that are considered to be good will be nominated for the awards and be reviewed in some media. Furthermore, the media's response about whether the movie is a good or not to be watched will influence the interest of the audiences to watch it.

The important measurement of the successfull of a movie is whether it is nominated for Oscars and Golden Globe Awards or not. Winning or being merely nominated for the awards can boost not only the popularity of the movie but also the profit gained by the studio. Certain requirements must be meet for a movie to be nominated for those awards. The academy itself has strict rules about the people or movies that can be nominated. The rules are: the movie must be over 40 minutes in length; must be publicly screened for paid admission in Los Angeles County (with the name of the particular theater where it screened included); and must screen for a qualifying run of at least seven straight days (Hutchinson, 2016). In addition, the movie cannot have its premiere outside of a theatrical run— screening a movie for the first time on television or the internet.

In addition, audiences tend to watch a movie starred by famous actor or actresses. The reason is simple as they want to see their idolized actor play in the movie or even become the hero. Some audiences even do not care about the plot or the story, they are happy as long as their idols showed. However, the director can not cast some actors or actresses to his/her movies recklessly. They have to know how the

actors or actresses casted will boost the popularity of their movies.

Matt Damon in Saving Private Ryan (1998)

Doug Liman, the director, cast Matt Damon with several considerations. Before playing in the *Bourne* series, Matt Damon started his career in *Mystic Pizza* (1988), but the movie did not do well and his career failed to take off. Furthermore, he decided to drop out of Harvard University to focus on his career in 1993 after the release of his movie entitled *Geronimo: An American Legend* (1993). Damon garnered accolades for *Good Will Hunting* (1997), a screenplay he had originally written for an English class at Harvard University. *Good Will Hunting* (1997) was nominated for nine Academy Awards, one of which, Matt won for Best Original Screenplay along with Ben Affleck. In the year 1998, Matt played the title role in Steven Spielberg's movie, *Saving Private Ryan* (1998), which was one of the most acclaimed movies of the year. Matt Damon's most recognizable work of is his role in the *Bourne* movie franchise. He plays as an assassin named Jason

Bourne who suffers amnesia, in *The Bourne Identity* (2002), *The Bourne Supremacy* (2004), and *The Bourne Ultimatum* (2007) (www.imdb.com).

Meanwhile, the name of Doug Liman is not known by audiences as he had only directed one movie entitled *See Jane Run* (2001). His first movie was not categorized as a success because it did not win and was not nominated for any awards. Take a look to his records, the audiences doubted the capability of Doug Liman as the director for the next sequel of *Bourne Identity* (2002) as his first movie only won three awards and five nominations. Consequently, Paul Greengrasss replaced him for *the Bourne Supremacy* (2004) and *the Bourne Ultimatum* (2007). Although he did not success in the *Bourne Identity* (2002), Doug Liman successfully prove his capability as a director of action movie in: *Mr.&Mrs. Smith* (2007) and *Edge of Tomorrow* (2014) which are box office hits. Meanwhile, Paul Greengrass brought *the Bourne* movies success as *the Bourne Supremacy* (2004) won 5 awards and 21 nominations (www.imdb.com). Fortunately, *the Bourne Ultimatum* (2007) inherited the success of its predecessor as it won 3 Oscars, another 25 wins, and 38 nominations (www.imdb.com).

There is a tendency that the studio will make more of an effort to make the sequels more successful than the pilot movie. One way that this is accomplished is by the studio replacing the movie director, especially for a movie series that cannot live up to the expectation of the studio. By replacing the director, the hope is that the movie will become more popular. Another way is by increasing the budget for the next sequels if they think the sequels are more promising than the pilot movie. The first Bourne movie, *The Bourne Identity (2002)*, that was released to compete with other summer blockbusters on June 14, 2012 only received a budget of $ 60.000.000. Doug Liman as the movie director was unsuccessful as the movie only grossed $121,661,683 by November 21, 2002. Dissatisfied by the achievement of this movie, the studio took several steps for the next movies. Expected to be more popular than the *Bourne Identity*, the studio increased the budget up to $ 75.000.000 as they trusted Paul Greengrass to be the director of the second movie, the *Bourne Supremacy*. He was successful in making audiences love the movie that turned into a super-fast paced action movie as the movie earned $176.049.130. Furthermore, the studio increased the budget for the third movie, *The Bourne Ultimatum* (2007),

higher than the budget for the second movie. The third movie that won three Oscars was budgeted at $ 110.000.000.

The audiences are slowly driven to accept and watch a brand new depiction of action that is mixed by espionage in *Bourne* movies by the movie makers. Several ways that had been conducted by movie makers are (1) Casting the promised actor as Matt Damon to attract the interest of audiences. (2) Changing the director from Doug Liman to Paul Greengrass in order to make the movie become more popular. (3) Increasing the production budget for the continuation sequel. (4) Hold a movie screening project to get positive review from movie reviewer. (5) Participating in some nomination awards as Oscar in order to win the nomination and popularly known. These ways are really effective in driving the audience's taste from pure action genre movies to action-spy genre movies. The success of the movie makers in making the audience loves *Bourne* movies can be seen as the instalment of the fourth movie of *Bourne*.

Many audiences hope that they will see the heroic action of Matt Damon in the fourth movie entitled *Bourne Legacy*. After the success of the previous three *Bourne* movies that were adapted from Robert Ludlum novels, the studio made the third

installment based on the continuation of the *Bourne* novel written by Van Lustbader under the title *The Bourne Legacy*. The *Bourne* movielovers expected to see Jason Bourne in the fourth movie as the title still used the name *Bourne*. However, the movie dissatisfied audiences' expectations. The movie did not star Matt Damon rather it starred Jeremy Renner and Rachel Weisz. Instead of having Jeremy Renner step into the role of Jason Bourne, the moviemakers created another character in the same nature as Jason Bourne. "The problem is, viewers are invested in Bourne and not seeing him in the movie that bears his name feels like a cheat (Berardinelli, 2012)." Although this movie was budgeted around $125.000.000 which is higher than the previous three *Bourne* movies, its gross was less than the first Bourne movie. Consequently, the movie won only 1 award and 11 nominations.

The Emergence of American Values in the Heroes Existence

People have their own standards of what the hero of action movies should be. Many of them think that the hero must be perfect, have more abilities than the enemies, loved by many people around, and etc. However, the fact that make people idolize a hero is because there are similarity

in the social values between them and the characters of the hero.

People often think that the hero in an action movie will not be different to other hero in the previous action movies. In example, the name Jason Bourne which sounds a lot like James Bond made audiences put higher expectations on the *Bourne* movies as action movies. Furthermore, the popularity of the novel made audiences expect something as exciting as was depicted in the novel. The differences in the characterization and the depiction of action in *The Bourne* movies compared to other action movies became the uniqueness of these movies. *The Bourne* series showed the depiction of American espionage and American heroes while other action movies still adapted British classical detective fiction with glamorous heroes.

Jason Bourne wears casual clothes in US Embassy

The leading character of the movie called hero is the main subject that leads the narrative, so there is a certain emphasis in the characterization. The hero or heroine

in the movie is given certain power so that they are able to solve and conclude the narrative. The hero has to be an expert who is aware of his role and identity as a hero and works for a certain agency under government supervision: *007*, *Mission: Impossible*, the *Jack Ryan* series, and *Kingsman Secret Service* (2015). Because of this, the hero of action-spy movie is generally assumed to be an agent of government. However, the characteristics of Jason Bourne as an action-spy hero seemingly counters the stereotypes of the hero in action-spy movies that mostly occurs as British agent. Jason Bourne celebrates the American identity and social values of innocence and self-reliance. Countering this general characterization of a spy, Jason Bourne first appears as the most wanted fugitive of the CIA and he is not aware of his identity as he lost his memory.

Jason Bourne who represents the identity and values of Americans does not wear elegant suits like Bond and Hunt. He wears casual shirts like a typical American. He is very independent as he does not seek any help while searching for his identity and revealing the corruption of CIA. The social value of individuality of American is embodied in the figure of Jason Bourne. Heroes reflect the highest goals of culture

embodied in the life and the image of a specific individual (Nacbar & Lause, 1992, p. 26). Here, Jason Bourne is an embodiment of American individuality. *The Bourne* series does not criticize the value of American society through the narrative rather it celebrates American values.

In order to gain popularity and high box office revenue, the movie has to attract large audiences. Thus, a certain requirement that is universally accepted by American society has to be fulfilled, which includes social values and norms. To please the audiences, "the producers of popular culture (movie) will go to great lengths to mold their products to reflect the audience beliefs and values" (Nachbar&Lause, 1992, p. 3). In this case, although Jason Bourne is a spy, the moviemakers decided to depict him as an ordinary American as reflected in his appearances.

Nachbar & Lause (1976) argued that the traditional American beliefs and values in the box office top ten are individual freedom, technology as protector and savior, violence as a legitimate means of obtaining justice outside the law, youth as the best period of life and childhood in particular as a special time which needs to be protected and preserved (p. 47-50). Thus, *The Bourne* movies carry the belief

of individual freedom as Jason Bourne wants to live his own life without any assassins hunting him and they carry the idea that the CIA uses violence as a legitimate means of obtaining justice outside the law. Jason Bourne struggles for his freedom as well as his desire to know his identity.

The Bourne movies present the idea of individualism as it reflects on the hero's efforts to gain his identity and to fix misunderstanding that put him as a criminal. Jason Bourne, the hero, relies on himself without any help from other people. He is an embodiment of individualism as "heroes reflect the highest goals of culture embodied in the life and the image of a specific individual (Nachbar&Lause, 1992)." Although he has a girlfriend, he does everything himself. He feels that fixing the misunderstanding that caused him to be blamed for the CIA corruption is his obligation. He has to force himself to be able to survive the assassination attempts directed at him by bad CIA officers.

The depiction of individualism as shown in *The Bourne* movies is different compared to other action movies. For example, James Bond does not reflect the individualism of America as he is always assisted by the MI6 organization. He always runs to the organization to obtain some help in fixing his car or rearming himself with guns and other modern weapons. Similar to Bond, Ethan Hunt in *Mission: Impossible* is supported by his IMF team. However, Jason Bourne relies on himself to face all his enemies with anything he finds. He hijacks cars and motor cycles, uses weapons taken from enemies that he defeated and treats his own wounds. Jason knows that technology has a good and bad side that depends on the user. As he knows that the CIA has strong surveillance capabilities, Bourne prefers to keep himself away from cell phones, security cameras, and internet.

In the end, as explanation, there are two fundamental beliefs marking the characteristics of American society. Coming from their ancestors' ideas that society was composed of free and equal individuals, as they should preserve the value of individualism. According to Ralph Waldo Emerson, the idea of individualism born to encourage Americans to distinguish themselves from Britain and Europe. The idea of individualism is actually "to believe your own thought, to believe that what is true for you in your private heart that is true for all men, - that is genius. Speak your latent conviction and it shall be the universal sense: for the inmost in due time

becomes outmost (Emerson, 2001)." Individualism is a myth – whether it is a story or real legend in American history. "Myths are stories, drawn from history that have been acquired through cultural functioning of the society that produced them, historical experience is preserved in the form of narrative, and through periodic retellings those narratives become traditionalized (Slotkins, 1985)." In reality, this individualism is embodied in American society whether realized or not. The believer of this self-reliance and individualism is increasing as one realizes that he/she cannot depend on others help except himself/herself to life. That is why Frye (1990) argues, "A myth to me is primarily a mythos, a story, narrative, or plot, with a specific social function (p. 28)." Myth works in the society as it influences people's behavior. Moreover, the members of a society who lives inside the same myth will share the same perception of it. Thus, the moviemakers make the American value embodies in the representation of a hero as Jason Bourne in action movies, which is not to counter or to deny the existence of those values rather to celebrate and to let the world know about it.

Conclusion

The Bourne movies present different depictions of action in the American cinema. First, the movies have so many elements of fiction that some people categorize its genre as action-spy movies while the other people consider them action-thrillers. Movies that are categorized into more than one genre will be more fascinating for the audiences. Second, the characterization inside the movies is different from the action movies that preceded it. The introduction of characters in the series is not directly presented in the beginning of the movie but rather it is revealed by the situation. The way of this characterization is not common for movies in the action genre, since it occurs commonly in the movies under suspense-thriller genre. Third, the emergence of a hero in *The Bourne* movies is not presented with a clear introduction as in the majority of box office action movies. The amnesia suffered by the hero character is the key to attracting the curiosity of the audience as they want to know the identity of the hero. Fourth, Jason Bourne and Aaron Cross are different from other heroes in action movies because they are not working for a certain organization under the supervision of a government. They are not depicted as fashionable heroes who wear nice suits and

drive nice cars. Instead, they wear casual outfits; shirts, jackets, and jeans as a typical American. In conclusion, popular Hollywood movies follow traditional movie formats in their portrayal of heroes and villains with an American hero, most often a white Anglo- Saxon male.

The main factor that reformulated the depiction of action and the formula in Hollywood movies is the changing of the audiences' tastes and reception to the values shown in the movies. A movie is a reflection of the society as well as the beliefs, tastes, values, and ideas of myths that may change into something different over time. That is why the tastes and values that exist in the society where the audiences come from must be presented in it. Regarding the audiences' background, taste is very subjective as well as influenced by the imaginary built inside each audience. However, Hollywood controls the society's reception through the adjustment of taste and the dramatization of American values portrayed in its action movies especially *Bourne movies*. To attract mass audience, a movie has to satisfy the desires of its audiences. Since audiences' tastes are vary, some fiction formulas are mixed to create certain depictions in the movie. The social values implied are used to make the audiences accepted the depiction in the

movie. The social values are usually presented through the existence of the heroes as it is embodied in the heroes' appearance. In *the Bourne* movies, Jason Bourne and Aaron Cross as the heroes in the movies reflect the individualism, freedom, and innocence of American values through their actions. They present individualism through the actions they take to solve problems. Both of them want only their freedom to live without any assasination attempt directed to them. In addition, the movies and movie industry do not criticize a certain social values of society but rather dramatizes them to make their movies are accepted by worldwide audiences.

References

Adi, I. R. (2011). *Fiksi Populer: Teori & Metode Kajian.* Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.

Adi, I. R. (2008). *Mitos dibalik Movie Laga Amerika.* Yogyakarta: Gadjah Mada University Press.

Cawelti, J. G. (1976). *Adventure, Mystery, and Romance: Formula Stories as Art and Popular Culture.* Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Creswell, J. W. (2003). *Research Design, Second Edition.* Thousand Oaks,: Sage Publication.

Froula, A., Randell, K., & Birkerstein, J. (2010). *Reframing 911: Movie, Popular Culture, and the "War on*

Terror". New York: The Continuum International Publishing Group Inc.

BIBLIOGRAPHY Gilroy, T. (Director). (2012). *The Bourne Legacy* [Motion Picture]. Universal International Picture, Intermovie Cinema, Solar Entertainment.

Greengrass, P. (Director). (2004). *The Bourne Supremacy* [Motion Picture]. USA / Germany: Universal Studio, Universal Pictures, Buena Vista International.

Greengrass, P. (Director). (2007). *The Bourne Ultimatum* [Motion Picture].

Hall, S. (2005). *Culture, Media, Language.* New York: Taylor & Francis e-Library.

Hutchinson, S. (2016, January 20). *How Are Oscars Nominees Choosen?* Retrieved June 14, 2016, from Mental_floss: http://mentalfloss.com/article/54560/how-are-oscar-nominees-chosen

IMDb. (n.d.). *Matt Damon Bibliography*. Retrieved June 14, 2016, from IMDb: http://www.imdb.com/name/nm0000354/bio?ref_=nm_ov_bio_sm

Internet Movie Database. (2015). *Tom Cruise - Biography - iMDB*. Retrieved from Internet Movie Database: http://www.imdb.com/name/nm0000129/bio?ref_=nm_ov_bio_sm#salary

Jenkins, T. (2012). *The CIA in Hollywood: How The Agency Shapes The Movie and Television.* United States: University of Texas Press.

Liman, D. (Director). (2002). *The Bourne Identity* [Motion Picture]. USA, Germany, Cezch Republic: Universal Picture, East West, United International Picture.

Nachbar, J., & Lause, K. (1992). *Popular Culture: An Introductory Text.* USA: Bowling Green University Popular Press.

Paine, T. (1945). *Common Sense.* (P. S. Foner, Ed.) New York: The Citadel Press.

Tudor, A. (1986). Genre. In B. K. Grant, *Movie Genre Reader* (p. 8). Austin, Texas: University of Texas Press.

Yeung, A. (2015, August 11). *2015's Most Successful Movie Marketing Campaigns: Summer Blockbuster Edition*. Retrieved June 13, 2016, from mavrck: http://www.mavrck.co/2015s-most-successful-movie-marketing-campaigns-summer-blockbuster-edition/

SUBJECT INDEX:

BACKPACKING'S RUN-IN WITH MCDONALDIZATION THEORY

Rizky Amalia
rzkyamalia@gmail.com

Abstract

Vacation, unconsciously, has been one of the basic needs in human's life. It provides a break from the usual routine activity which somehow can trap the doer into an autopilot mode; leaving them to encounter a seemingly never ending task. Thus, vacation's purpose is to experience a different setup that is not usually found in everyday lives. This study focuses on how vacation has been set up in such a way that violates its initial purpose. Using the theory of McDonaldization proposed by George Ritzer, the discussion will flow into breaking down four concepts of the theory to be matched with the premise of backpacking; in which suggests a possibility of deconstructing vacation concept that is familiar in modern setting. However, with the development of era, backpacking slowly transforms into following the concept of McDonaldization in tourism, giving a glimpse on how modernity has touched every aspect of human's life and making what was once a breakthrough in tourism world a cliché that falls through some anticipated pattern.

Keywords: Backpacking, McDonaldization, Vacation

Introduction

In a world full of tension and work pressure, taking a vacation becomes an essential that is favored by many people to maintain the continuation of their daily routine (Bello & Etzel, 1985, p. 21). Enjoying time off from everyday life is a way to release stress and burden. Many tourism companies realize that and take the opportunity by offering many kinds of tour package. However, in this modern era, the types of tour package offered are almost identical between one another as an effect of McDonaldization. McDonaldization is a theory which proposes an idea that the principle of everything is becoming similar with the concept of the famous fast food restaurant McDonald's. In McDonald's, customers are being hypnotized with the idea of fastness, that everything which is modern should be fast and convenient. Additionally, customers will experience minimum surprise when ordering meals at the restaurant because of the clear description of the meal and the price in the menu (Smart, 1999, p. 6). This way of thinking slowly seeps in our everyday life, not only in ordering meals but also in behaving generally, including our decision in taking a trip. The trips that we take –or the tourism agency offer– mostly follow the principle of McDonaldization that it no

longer bears the idea of being different from everyday life.

However, the emerging trend of backpacking seems to deconstruct the idea of McDonaldization in tourism. Backpacking offers another way of enjoying vacation by letting the backpackers wandering in the wilderness instead of taking a part in a McDonaldized tour offered by tourism agency. Many agencies realize this trend and see the opportunity to make it commercialized. They begin to take backpacking to another level by offering backpacking tour as one of the options on holiday package they offer. Additionally, many fellow backpackers also build their own tourism agencies by offering backpacking package tours as their product.

In this paper, I will look at backpacking phenomena using McDonaldization theory in tourism as my glasses to analyze it. The focus will be based on the deconstruction of McDonaldization tourism with the trend of backpacking and the deconstruction of the basic principle of backpacking by looking at some institutionalized backpacking. In seeing the relation of institutionalized backpacking, I choose three backpacking agencies to complete my paper; Gapyear, Wildland Trekking, and Green Tortoise

because their only product is backpacking tourism –as they are run by fellow backpackers– and the three of them have different style of packaging their backpacking product.

Seeing the high exposure of McDonaldization theory on everyday life including tourism, this study will analyze how backpacking deconstructs the theory and how a modern way of backpacking deconstructs the very notion of backpacking itself. Both research questions will be studied using McDonaldization theory proposed by Ritzer.

Methodology

The purpose of this study is to find out how backpacking deconstructs McDonaldization theory and how the touch of modernity has changed the way backpacking is shaped in relation to the said theory. In doing so, a deep analysis on selected modern day backpacking companies is needed in order to see how institutionalized backpacking is offered to the future backpackers. Thus, the main data that are used in this research are taken from three tourism agencies, Gapyear, Wildland Trekking, and Green Tortoise. The three companies are chosen because of their premise in offering a backpacking

tour in their vacation setup. The information of the three tourism companies is taken from their official websites, as they provide most of their information there and prefer to do an online booking if anyone interested in their program. Given the way the data is collected, a library research using qualitative method is the most suitable method of analysis to complete the discussion. By using qualitative method, interpretation plays quite an important role in the flow of analysis. Moreover, Creswell argues that "interpretive inquiry" takes an important role in studying the main data but cannot take the researcher's "own backgrounds, history, contexts, and prior understanding" (1994, p. 212). Therefore, to complete a study on modern day tourism by examining the three aforementioned tourism agencies, a thorough explanation on the origin of backpacking concept and the theory that is going to accompany it is essential to be explored.

Discussion

McDonaldization Theory in Tourism

McDonaldization thesis is a theory proposed by George Ritzer based on the characterization of McDonald's fast food. According to Ritzer, the means of consumption in globalization era undergoes the same characteristics that are possessed by McDonald's franchise. The principles of McDonald's such as efficiency, predictability, calculability, and control, dominate many sectors of society around the world, including tourism. The basic foundation of the increasing growth of McDonaldized tourism can be seen from the paradigm of Disney theme parks (Jiajia, 2015, p. 2). Disney parks offer a kind of holiday which is convenient since almost everything is included in the visit to Disney Park, so that visitors do not have to leave the park in order for their need to be fulfilled. Moreover, since McDonald's came in the same era as Disney's theme park, the concept and principles of both McDonald's and Disney Parks underwent a similar manifestation which put forward the efficiency for the customer. According to Ritzer (1998), efficiency in tourism means that the tourists want to see how the money they spend will be used maximally in such a limited time (p. 244). The exact amount of money and time the tourists will spend is also elements of McDonaldization under the category of calculability. It means that the proposed holiday program has to be defined clearly and plainly for the tourists to choose and see. Following these two concepts is a notion of

predictability which will be the first priority in choosing holiday package offered by any tourism agency. "As our everyday life grows more and more predictable, we have less and less tolerance for, and ability to handle, unpredictable events" (Ritzer, 1998, p. 138). By projecting everyday life as something that can be predicted, holiday becomes somehow in line with the concept of no surprises. In addition to the "no surprises" concept, many tourists request a holiday with things they are familiar with, thus the concept of highly predictable vacations becomes the magnet of enjoyable tourism activity. The last concept of McDonaldization in tourism is control which is defined by Ritzer as the use of technology as well as schedule to minimize the error that may be caused in the vacation (p. 140). Advance technologies are preferred because of their ability in controlling the exercise both tourists and employees.

Following all concepts that are mentioned, the way people experienced vacation becomes highly predictable and many tourism agencies work hard to make sure that the visitors experience no surprise at all. Agencies predict and publicize all features they offer to the public in a great detail; from the estimation

price until the schedule of vacation down to every minute. Technology takes over the existence of human interaction, thus making the experience of human vacation turns into a non-human or even a dehumanizing experience (Ritzer, 1998). This makes the supposedly inexpensive vacation to be a high cost one. However, even though the cost for vacation becomes pricier, the experience that is embraced by the tourists somehow becomes more and more like the rest of their lives. This goes in line with the idea that a modern kind of tourism contains little to no surprises at all. With this concept to mind, the tourist industry in general becomes highly McDonaldized, at least, to some extent. The main reason for tourism which underlines the new and different experience is somehow undermined by the existence of McDonaldization of tourism (Ritzer, 1998, p. 136).

Backpacking

Backpacking is a growing trend in modern tourism society. The history of backpacking dates back since the sixteenth century when tourism was mostly done by young adults even though the term "backpacking" at that time had not been introduced to label those young adult travelers (Nieoczym, 2003, p. 42). The

concept of tourism itself was actually a simple activity of leaving the place of living and everyday activity in search for leisure and new experience. Until the beginning of nineteenth century, the term "tourists" and "travelers" has similar meaning as people who went into unfamiliar place to escape from their everyday life. However, in the mid of nineteenth century, the term "tourists" was used for a label of high class individual. People began to steer away from being a traveler because of the different meaning that it carries. The idea of tourism began to change and people started to classify themselves in the midst of being a tourist or being a traveler. Those who considered themselves as travelers started a movement since the 1960s by having thousands of American and European youth to have a "Hippie Trail" which message was to bring peace and love (Edwards, 2013, p. 2). This movement is followed by the conceptualization of "backpacking" in the early of 1990s and since then the term came to be extensively used on a worldwide basis.

Initially, the concept of backpacking was widely associated with wilderness hiking and camping. The naming of this new movement itself came from the characterization of the travelers in which

they have to bring a large backpack containing tent, sleeping bag, clothes, and all survival survive that they need without having to rely on the tourist convenience (Styles, 1976, p. 8). Since the main purpose of backpacking is to go to the wilderness and sleep in the open nature, the backpackers have to carry everything they need in one backpack and go into the adventures mostly by walking. Mostly, the style that the backpackers use in their way of journey is to travel independently which sometimes require them to stop at some route to take a rest. Sometimes, when needed, many backpackers will find temporary employment in the place that they visit in order to "replenish travel funds" (Nieoczym, 2003, p. 1).

The most noticeable pattern of backpacking is that the backpacker will go on a small group of people (more often than not, they will have an individual trip) and undergoes on a long self-directed journeys. The behavioral traits often found in backpackers are cheap lodging, flexibility, personal arranged itineraries, significant contact with fellow travelers, and longer period of time than the mainstream tourism (Wallstam, 2011, p. 5). Because of its flexibility, backpackers mostly do not associate themselves with agency and the trip can last according to

their preference. They make their own decisions about where to go, what to do, how to spend their money which all based in their culturally shaped imagination. According to Nieoczym (2003), the majority of people who want to go on a vacation will have an imagination of what kind of holiday they want to encounter which is different from one another, and that imagination will be based on one's culture (p. 4). Backpackers will follow their imagination and translate it into their own wishes since backpacking is an activity which emphasizes on its individuality. The nature of backpacking itself will bring out a new experience which will bring transformation in young people's imagination into their non-traveling lives as well.

Backpacking exists and is living well in the society because it is a kind of tourism which tries to emerge from the mainstream and differentiate themselves from mass tourist. The backpackers insist that they are different from the majority of tourists because of their independence to pick the kind of vacation they want. They also believe that they "live" in the destination rather than merely visit and leave for the next day. This kind of thinking comes from the typical encounter of backpacker with nature and local people

of the place they are visiting. Backpackers are more likely to engage in local culture and enrich themselves with new customs and experiences. They generally wish to obtain highly unique and authentic experiences by having integration with local people and live close to nature in remote locations (Wallstam, 2011, p. 11). In a more contemporary backpacking, the core of independent travelling still exists yet it is combined with the more engaging choice of accommodation. If previously backpackers sleep in tent and open space, backpackers nowadays usually will choose a youth hostel as a place to stay. Youth hostel is an alternative place to stay and is usually picked by backpackers for its inexpensiveness. Since backpackers highlight the concept of minimal budget, youth hostel becomes a new growing trend among backpackers. Most youth hostels offer not only affordable accommodations, but also physical space to socialize between guests and also information about travel and local attractions (Nieoczym, 2003, p. 4). Youth hostel is a crucial place for backpackers as a gathering place among other travelers. Contemporary backpackers do not only engage with nature and local people, but they also participate in the communal live among other backpackers.

Backpacking and McDonaldization Thesis

The concept of backpacking seems to be far away from the modernization of tourism which is summed up in McDonaldization thesis of tourism proposed by Ritzer in 1998. Backpacking offers an inexpensive way of travelling meanwhile McDonaldization idea suggests a kind of luxurious vacation. The principle of backpacking appears to deconstruct McDonaldization concept of efficiency, calculability, control, and predictability.

Highly Efficient Vacation

Efficiency becomes one of the crucial things in McDonaldization since people are used to efficiency in their everyday life that they have little tolerance in inefficiencies when it comes to vacation (Ritzer, 1998, p. 138). According to this notion, people are willing to pay more money as long as they can have the most efficient package tours. Package tours and highly detailed schedule become inevitable in arranging vacation in order to maximize the efficiency of travelling. Backpacking does not follow the concept of efficiency since most backpackers do not book package vacations (Edwards, 2013, p. 23), since they tend to create their own vacation based on their imagination that

they possess based on cultural experience (Nieoczym, 2003).

It is believed that every individual is a core of themselves, and as a core, they are shaped based on cultural information and experience that they receive. This cultural experience shapes every organism differently that they are able to produce wish, hope, and imagination, hence every one carries different cultural imagination compared to other people. This notion is then followed by a research done by Nieoczym resulting in the decision of individual to choose their destination of travelling as well as the way the want to travel and what activities will suit them the best. Having an arranged tour like what most tourists do in a package tourism will violate the spirit of different cultural imagination of people. That is why, the solution of this condition is to have a backpacking tour since backpacking is an individual vacation arranged independently by the backpackers. Moreover, the ability to take a temporary employment while backpacking is also a way to deconstruct McDonaldization which focuses more on the efficiency of leisure itself rather than the experience of growing self.

Highly Calculable Vacation

Calculability becomes important in vacation since "many people want to know in advance how much a vacation is going to cost, and they abhor cost overruns" (Ritzer, 1998, p. 138). Future tourists also want to have a clear estimation on the trip they are about to take, including the description of activities that are proposed by tourism agencies. Before taking any trip, future tourists mostly wish that they will be able to calculate not only the amount of money they are going to spend but also the activity they are going to do. This idea is in opposition with what backpackers do. The highlight of backpacking lays in its informal holiday activities, making the backpackers free to roam on their own. When connecting the concept of calculability with budget, backpacking often has uncalculated expenditure due to its "unfixed" schedule.

The main concept of backpacking is the minimal budget, however, there is no fixed amount at how minimal is the appropriate budget for backpacking. Backpackers may find the cheapest accommodation or choice of culinary activity but since there is no clear schedule, they may have to be ready for unexpected expenditure that they have to make. Additionally, the possibility to take a part time employment in the destination of their journey will add to the concept of incalculability of budget. Backpackers may actually come home with more money than they spend because of their endless possibilities when travelling.

Highly Controlled Vacation

In McDonaldization concept, Disney Parks are well known for their strict control over the employees and visitors. A much wider vision can be applied in terms of tourism when the behavior of people is tightly controlled by script instead of being free to behave as they wish (Ritzer, 1998, p. 138). Moreover, the use of technology is also widely practiced in controlling the vacation. In the spirit of minimizing the element of surprise, tourists will book ahead the kind of vacation they want by using technology. Usually, activities that are offered are also full of technology that makes it minimize human encounter during vacation. The most obvious example can be taken from the use of technology in Disney Parks. The kind of entertainment that Disney Park offers is highly technologized amusement park and human interactions. The employees at Disney Park have to follow several "script" requiring them to behave in the

directed manner, thus reducing the "real" interaction between humans.

The concept of highly controlled vacation will not be found in backpacking since this kind of tourism needs minimum exposure to technology and controlling behavior. The purpose of backpacking is to search new experience and leisure which mostly will be acquired by backpackers when they get in touch with local culture and people. The pride that backpackers mostly hold is that the ability to penetrate in host culture is much easier for them compared to mass tourism (Edwards, 2013, p. 2). When engaging with local culture, there will be more things go unnoticed and uncontrolled that they have to deal with.

Highly Predictable Vacation

In the world of well-planned activity, the element of surprise becomes an alien concept that is usually avoided by people. Unpredictable events develop into something that is less tolerable than we may have a whole century ago. This notion also enters in tourism world where "the last thing most of today's tourists want to experience is an unpalatable meal, a wild animal or a rat-infested hotel room" (Ritzer, 1998, p. 138). Many tourists want to have a service that they are already

familiar with and wish to encounter minimal exposure of surprise or unpredictable events. When given the brochure or read travel description on the internet, future tourists will hope to see the kind of accommodation that they will have, the possible leisure activity they may enjoy, and even the description of menu they will eat during vacation. Since future tourists demand such detail illustrations, tourism agencies are forced to make their tour as clear as possible so that the tourists can predict what kind of vacation that they want.

This concept is in opposition with backpacking. In backpacking, there are many things that will come at the moment and make it becomes unpredictable. One example can be taken by enrolling in the local custom. In several traditional cultures, local people may have different preferences for eating and this may cause unpredictability in one's vacation. Engaging in local culture can also mean having to be accustomed to different norms and behavior that perhaps will not be found in everyday life. Another example of the unpredictability that can happen in backpacking is through youth hostels. Youth hostels provide a cheap lodging for backpackers by setting them in a large room containing several beds.

Youth hostels also have enough space to socialize between guests so that the experience of interacting with humans will not be absent during vacation. However, the risk of having unpredicted encounter will be higher since not all backpackers are alike. In other words, the exposure of surprises will be even more possible between the backpackers and the nature and the backpackers among other fellow backpackers.

Seeing four elements of McDonaldization in relation to backpacking gives the conclusion that the idea of backpacking actually tries to deconstruct the concept of McDonaldization. Backpacking is a symbol of people who shun the stereotype of what it means to be tourists by not following every concept of McDonaldization of tourism (calculability, controlled, efficiency, predictability) even though the idea that lies in backpacking is still closely related to tourism. By having more surprises, backpacking is there to challenge the idea of simulacra of everyday life proposed by McDonaldization.

Backpacking Nowadays

The ever growing trend in backpacking has brought its charm to attract many people to join the euphoria of travelling independently by backpacking. By any definition, backpacking nowadays has undergone an increasing growth particularly among youth. Historically, backpackers were seen as low budget tourism and undesirable by many people, however the popularity of backpacking has made a tremendous change in local economy in a more direct fashion than the capital spent by the average mainstream tourism (Wallstam, 2011, p. 5). It means that the popularity of backpacking has made local economy grows increasingly compared to mass tourism. With the growth of local economy, the image of backpacking is also uplifted and welcomed well by society. This condition seems to deconstruct the stereotype of backpacking as the less desirable means of tourism and that backpacking is only directed to lower class society. More people choose backpacking as the way they enjoy their vacation and this leads to another classification of backpacking. If previously there is only one category of travelling independently to connect to nature –which is backpacking–, nowadays there is another term to describe a higher class of backpacking; flashpacking.

Flashpacking is a new trend in younger generation where the adventurer

relies completely on the World Wide Web and its technological process (Vaals, 2012, p. 12). The flashpackers are usually identified as a more wealthy and modern backpacker. They bring expensive backpack or trolley-like case, typically bring along their laptops with them, USB flash drive, high resolution camera, and a smartphone (ibid.). The phenomenon of flashpacking actually expresses the changing demographics in society where society nowadays is exposed to the modernity and development in technology. However, the naming of flashpackers is usually very exclusive and avoided by people, thus making those identified as flashpackers are still being called as backpackers. As a result of this, services and facilities concerning backpacking begin to show up and compete with each other, making the idea of backpacking to be commercialized or –as tourism study called it – institutionalized. The institutionalization of backpacking means that there is a "standardization and complex regulation of backpacker products and services to include whole destinations, transit regions between these destinations as well as the consumers themselves" (Wallstam, 2011, p. 9). By having institutionalized backpacking, there will be little to no distinction between

independent wandering and mass tourism organized by tourism agency.

The institutionalized backpacking has begun to be applied by many tourism agencies in America. Initially, they only offer a conventional way of vacation (i.e. booking trips, staying at hotels, scheduled activities) but in the response of backpacking, they start to enhance additional option in enjoying vacation. This trend leads several tourism agencies to take care on backpacking tours and cater the need of backpackers. Mostly, the founders of backpacking tours are a long-time backpacker. The three institutionalized backpacking that I will explore more in this paper are Gapyear, Wildland Trekking, and Green Tortoise.

Gapyear

Gapyear is a website-based company which focuses on backpacking around the world. They are proud of their program which helps anyone to arrange their holiday in a meaningful content because the tourists at Gapyear will not only able to enjoy their vacation, but they also may volunteer or take a temporary job while they have their holiday. This principle is actually in line with the traditional notion of backpacking, where backpackers may take a temporary job while travelling to

help their financial being. However, the difference lies in the essentiality of taking the job because to book a trip at Gapyear, a customer needs to have certain amount of money depends on the country they are going to. "We were created by backpackers, for backpackers, and offer expert advice on travelling, volunteering and working abroad, all tied together with inspirational ideas, opportunities and products" (gapyear.com) is the motto of Gapyear to instill the spirit of backpacking among youth. Not only offering trips, Gapyear also provides several options of hostels to stay in. They provide all kinds of information related to hostels ranging from the "start from" price until the pictures and conditions of the hostel around the world.

Gapyear also offers some kind of "arranged" backpacking where they have selected backpacking destination complete with price estimation and duration of staying. For instance, for a trip to Kenya, they label the trip as "Gorillas, Chimps, and Game Parks" and put £1,795 as the minimum price and 16 days as the duration of the tourists staying. They put a reasoning on why people should choose backpacking with guided tour, "Backpacker tours are brilliant for two main reasons. Firstly, you can be guaranteed to experience the absolute

highlights of any given destination. Secondly, tours are a perfect way to meet and interact with other travellers, and indeed locals" (gapyear.com). Gapyear's highlight on guiding the backpacker is based on the expertise on the team that they have without removing the original culture of backpacking itself.

Wildland Trekking

Wildland Trekking focuses on guided backpacking tours. They focus their destinations in two areas: USA and global, but mostly their main concern is in the area of hiking. Thus, the destinations that they offer mostly will be a place with mountains or hills to climb on. The guided backpacking trip will include the backpacker to be able to enjoy the wilderness and experience the beauty of nature while being guided so that they will not be stranded or lost. Wildland Trekking provides a backpack (between 25 and 45 pounds) that will be suited with the area, the duration of the trip, the time of year, and the height and weight of the customer. Not only that, the tour company will also provide tents, sleeping pads, sleeping bags, trekking poles, cooking gear, and a guide as long as the trip goes on (wildlandtrekking.com). The customer will only need to bring their personal belonging

and not to worry on meals since the guide on Wildland Trekking will provide all meals from the very first day. Additionally, Wildland Trekking also offers porter services for those who like to do a standard backpacking trip but prefer not to carry the gear. The porters can carry up to 30 lbs of guest gear and will hike with the groups for an additional $235 per porter per day (wildlandtrekking.com).

For the arranged tours, Wildland Trekking provides all details in their website, ranging from the estimated price to the level of solitude one will get. For example, a backpacking trip to Grand Canyon will cost $910 / $1125 per person, spend 3-4 days to hike and enjoy the beauty, have level 3 on difficulty and level 2 on solitude. The more detailed explanation on difficulty and solitude level can be found in their website, wildlandtrekking.com

Green Tortoise

Another American backpacking tourism company is called Green Tortoise. This tourism agency is unique because they offer a backpacking bus trip instead of hiking like a conventional backpacking do. Green Tortoise offers bookings on bus backpacking trip as well as hostels information that may be useful for travelers. The bus trip that is offered by Green Tortoise will collect several independent backpackers to go on adventure together. Their tour includes wilderness adventures, camping, and trekking in America's best National Parks (greentortoise.com). Green Tortoise has many options in arranging the tour. For example, a customer can choose between a three-day or two-day trip to Yosemite National Park. Of course, the estimation cost will be different from one arrangement to another. Compared to other two mentioned tour agencies, Green Tortoise provides a more detail time estimation because they also post the date of departure and arrival.

Institutionalized Backpacking and McDonaldization Theory

The existence of institutionalized backpacking makes the theory of McDonaldization that once was deconstructed becomes somehow fits again with the notion of modern backpacking.

Highly Efficient Vacation

The idea that backpacking once deconstructs the first principle of McDonaldization has to be clarified again since the coming of institutionalized

backpacking. The idea of efficiency in vacation comes from the notion that people will pay several amount of money as long as they can have the most of their vacation. From this concept of efficiency, tour companies begin to provide package tours so that the future customer can choose which one is the most suitable for them. In the case of three backpacking tour agencies that I propose (Gapyear, Wildland Trekking, and Green Tortoise), all three of them follow this concept of efficiency by giving package on every tour they offer, complete with the duration of staying and the total amount that will cost them.

Highly Calculable Vacation

The calculability factor that is proposed in McDonaldization offers a clear estimation of the trip, including the kind of activities that will be scheduled for them. When the theory of backpacking counter-attack that by letting the travelers wanders on their own, the institutionalized backpacking seems to bring back the theory of calculability. The three backpacking tour companies label their trips and offer a detailed schedule of each destination. Gapyear, for instance, mark their trip to Kenya for 16 days with a complete arrangement per day. For day 1,

they arrange a trip to Nairobi with museums and cultural attractions waiting to be explored. In the second day, the backpackers move to Lake Naruku and this arrangement goes on until the last day. Even though in each day the customers have any right to roam on their own, but the basic idea is somewhat in opposition with what backpackers are supposed to travel.

Highly Controlled Vacation

The exposure of technology has been spread to the non-technological way of travelling that is held by backpackers. For starters, the way customers book the trip that they desire is done through website. Moreover, the idea of guided backpacking tour will follow the concept of highly controlled vacation proposed in McDonaldization. Initially, there will be many things that will go uncontrollable by the backpackers since they will go to the wilderness and try to engage with the local culture and local people. In a guided backpacking, the backpackers will still have the ability to engage in local custom and people, but they will have things under control since the guide will tell them what to do and what not to do. The role of the guide will also be helpful since they will

most likely to tell the backpackers which road to take.

Highly Predictable Vacation

Thus, with an efficient, calculable, and controlled vacation, the backpacking activity will be very much predicted by the backpackers. The conventional backpacking which requires the backpackers to be ready at any unpredictable event, such as different preference for eating found in host culture, will not be found in contemporary backpacking in which everything is organized. One of the backpacking tour agencies that I mentioned, Wildland Trekking, even provides meals for every day so that the backpackers do not have any difficulties in finding something to eat that is not on their diet preference.

In short, all notions in McDonaldization that are deconstructed by the idea of backpacking are being deconstructed (again) by the institutionalized backpacking.

Conclusion

The concepts of efficiency, predictability, calculability, and control in McDonaldization come from the idea of McDonald's fast food restaurant that makes people are used to the idea of it.

These notions are so highly familiar in the society that it applies well to almost every aspect in daily lives, including in the way we plan our vacation. The vacation schemes that are proposed by mainstream tourism agency have shaped the way society idealize their way of taking time off from their daily routine. The movement of backpacking deconstructs those ideas by going against the four concepts proposed in McDonaldization. However, the touch of modernity makes backpacking institutionalized, therefore the concept of it begins to follow the theory that it once deconstructs. Backpacking nowadays relies on the comfort of the backpackers, so that they will experience little to no surprise along the way. This modern concept of backpacking is in opposition with the original concept of backpacking and follow along the concept of McDonaldization in tourism.

References

Bello, D. C., & Etzel, M. J. (1985). The role of novelty in the pleasure travel experience. *Journal of Travel Research*, *24*(1), 20-26.

Creswell, J. W., & Creswell, J. D. (1994). *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches*. Sage publications.

Edwards, R. (2013). "Backpacking In The Digital Age: Ethnographic Perspectives From Latin America".

Gapyear. http://www.gapyear.com/

Green Tortoise Adventure Travel – Hostels. http://www.greentortoise.com/

Jiajia, W. U., & Choi, W. Y. (2015). "Disneyization VS Glocalization: Critique to Chinese Style Disneyization of Shanghai Disney Resort".

Nieoczym, A. (2003). *Globalization, Tourism and the Commodification of Imagination: An Ethnography of Backpacking* (Doctoral dissertation, Theses (Dept. of Sociology and Anthropology)-/Simon Fraser University).

Ritzer, G. (1998). *The McDonaldization Thesis: Explorations and Extensions*. Sage.

Smart, B. (Ed.). (1999). *Resisting McDonaldization*. Sage.

Styles, S. (1976). *Backpacking: A Comprehensive Guide*. Macmillan.

Vaals, Ferda van. (2012). *The Future of Backpacking*. European Tourism Futures Institute

Wallstam, Martin. (2011) *Backpacker Institutionalization: Towards an Experience-Based Typology*. Mid-Sweden University.

Wildland Trekking. http://www.wildlandtrekking.com/

TRACKING DOWNS CHRISTIAN DIOR IN AMERICAN POST-WORLD WAR II FASHION UNTIL EARLY 1950S

Nurina Aulia Haris
aulianurina.aulia@gmail.com

Abstract

This article studied the accomplishment of Christian Dior during his business venture in American market by using his autobiography as the main source of the research and qualitative research used as the method of study. Graves's thoughts on Consumer Behavior are used as the approach of study under the umbrella of Transnational American Studies.

The success of Dior in the American market is not solely because of his dresses but there are other factors that support the success of it. The post-World War II situation was a time when people need something new to remind them of their past glorious day and it was provided by Dior through his creations. In addition, the promotions and assessments from fashion experts through fashion and lifestyle magazines also affect people's assessment of Dior's dresses and affected them to own his collections. Based on the theory described by Graves, people tendency to imitate others is capable to influence one's expenses and this can be seen from the phenomena occurring in American society toward Dior's works at that time.

Concisely, the result of this research shows that the success of Dior in American market happened because of two things. First is the nature of human being that loves beauty, neatness, and things which make them happy. Second is the timing of his debut which matched to what people searched: the pride they lost during the war caused by the limitation applied by the government and the condition itself. Therefore when Dior came with his collections they saw it as if it was their way to get back their pride as by wearing Dior's collection it can show their social status.

Keywords: Christian Dior, Fashion, Societies, World War II

Introduction

Lotman in his book *The Structure of Artistic Text* stated that a society cannot life without an art because art is the result of culture (Lotman, 1977). In addition, Edward B. Tylor, an anthropologist, defined culture in his book *Primitive Culture* as "that complex whole which includes knowledge, beliefs, arts, morals, law, customs, and any other capabilities and habits acquired by [a human] as a member of society" (1873: 1). Base on the two experts, all of the things done and produced by human being is culture which means that culture and human being are two things that cannot be separated.

In the United States, culture becomes central because it is composed by many cultures coming from around the world. Besides the white Anglo-Saxon culture brought by the puritan to US since 19th century from European countries, the

common cultures in the United States are the Native Americans, African culture, Latin America and also Asian ("American Culture", 2015). As a result, their familiarity in receiving new culture and their belief in freedom of expression make it easier for new culture to enter the country.

During the World War II, even though America did not experience it in their mainland they still can feel the impact of it as thousands of men were sent to the war which resulted most of American women had to take over male job in order to keep its country economic stability. One of the impacts from female taking over male job was that they need to change their outfit which fit their job. In addition, American government also regulating new rule regarding fabrics utilization in outfit making and also outfit style for women to be worn as their daily basis. Based on government regulation, the length the skirt was restricted not too long and not too short so that it can maximized the consumption of fabrics, daily gown was also made multifunction that can be worn as both day and night dress. Designers were ordered to make a new trend which suits the regulation during and postwar with the intention to preserve the rule (Olds, 2001: 47-49).

The situation in America and its characteristics have significant role in giving success to Dior and French fashion industry. For Dior, its openness and situation have made his job easier in running his business there while for French fashion industry, Dior successful venture helped the revival of French fashion industry as French designers started to gain more confidence in restarting their fashion business.

During World War II French fashion is considered 'dead' by not only fashion critics or fashion magazines editor but also many French designers themselves as they started to close their 'house'. However, a light of revival is seen from the blow of Christian Dior in February 1947 when he first shown his collection through a fashion show which he named it the "New Look" and received good reviews from many fashion editors and critics. Pochna citing Carmel Snow, *The Harper's Bazaar* editor in chief who states after seeing the fashion shows of Christian Dior that "It's quite a revolution, dear Christian! Your dresses have such a new look!" (Pochna, 1994: 9). His debut success in France spread throughout European countries and to the United States. Through his 'New Look', he had a chance to expand his business to America brought by Neiman Marcus Corp.

and was awarded an "Award for Distinguish Service in the Field of Fashion" from Neiman Marcus Corp. or commonly known as the "Oscar" of fashion world. However, all of his success was not only followed by the sweet results but also the bitter ones. With all of the praise he received, there are people who showed protest toward what Dior has done. Alexandra Palmer—the Senior Curator, Nora E. Vaughan Fashion Costume Curatorship—states:

> When Christian Dior's extravagantly feminine New Look burst upon the fashion-starved post-World War II scene, not everyone accepted it— French saleswomen literally tore the dresses apart, spawning numerous anti-New Look protests. A glimpse into the rise of—and shock waves caused by—a fashion icon (Palmer, 2010: 25).

The phenomenon attached in Dior, the events happened after his debut, was the topic of this paper. Mainly to the reaction of American people gave toward him and his creations. In more detail, on how he first enter the market and his way to maintain his existence there and also his influence toward American societies especially those who wore his dresses. This phenomenon is further discussed using Graves' Consumer Behavior.

Methodology

This article is conducted under the discipline of American Studies. Sykes on *American Quarterly* published by The Johns Hopkins University Press defined American Studies as "the study of American culture". Furthermore he explained that the main idea of it is the word 'culture' which brings both theory and method. In addition to that, he stated," The materials studied may be literary, but the approach will be that of the student of culture, not the critic."—"It is concerned with a culture which can be defined according to certain spatio-temporal dimensions" (1963: 254).

Additionally, quoting from Stanley Bailis in his article *The Social Sciences in American Studies: An Integrative Conception,* he mentioned the difference between American Studies and other disciplines in which they rarely allowed its scholars to conduct a multidisciplinary research. The following statement from Bailis supports the flexibility of American Studies as an interdisciplinary study which makes its scholars possible to conduct a research using multiple theories and methodologies from other disciplines (Bailis, 1974: 203).

American Studies has been highly responsive to the fluxion of its

historical surroundings. The field has thus emerged not as a discipline, but as an arena for disciplinary encounter and staging ground for fresh topical pursuits (ibid.).

The interdisciplinary of American Studies enable the discipline to take theories and methods from other disciplines and make them suppler than others. Furthermore, Rowe in *A Concise Companion to American Studies* described the characteristic of American Studies as:

> No longer focused exclusively on consensus history and assimilationist ideals, American Studies takes into account the many different and constantly changing communities that constitute the United State—The new American Studies is also attentive to the ways the US has participated in traditional imperialism, both in Manifest Destiny and slavery (Rowe, 2010: 7).

Additionally, he also mentioned the broad object study of American Studies which can include "all of the different nations and communities of the western hemisphere" and "the field should be understood as profoundly *comparative* and *transnational,* even when it concentrates exclusively on the internal diversity of the US (2010: 8)."

In this occasion the writer applied Transnational American Studies as the umbrella theory and conducted the research using Philip Graves's thought about

consumer behavior. Emory Elliott describes transnationalism as "genuine inclusiveness and broad international collaboration (2007: 6)." Then the importance of transnational in American Studies based on Fishkin is that it enables American Studies to participate in a global phenomenon as it studies the cross border of the nation, more specifically Fishkin said that:

> We are likely to focus not only on the proverbial immigrant who leaves somewhere called "home" to make a new home in the United States, but also on the endless process of comings and goings that create familial, cultural, linguistic, and economic ties across national borders—and more on the nation as a participant in a global flow of people, ideas, texts, and products (2005: 24).

Moreover, Fishkin also brought up the idea regarding the participation of "local spaces in global phenomena" in which they participate on the "[internal] and [external] migrations, the diffusion of cultural forms, the spread of capital and commodities—and all the attendant consequences (ibid.)."

Transnationalism has given the picture of American Studies as a discipline which enables its scholars to see the dynamic flows and the relations of human life—economic, culture, linguistic, etc—across the borders of American nations. Rowe explained that "border studies" in American Studies tried to see the cultural

hybridity as one of aspects which constituting the United States. Therefore transnational American Studies makes its scholars be able to witness the contact between America and other nations and how they influenced each other especially American influence toward other nations and "to work genuinely as a comparatist discipline" but "rather than treating such cultural differences as discrete entities, however, this new comparative approach stresses the ways different cultures are transformed by their contact and interaction with each other (Rowe, 2000: 24-25)."

Transnational American Studies provided the bridge to the writer to explore how Christian Dior as a French *couturier* spread his career in America and how both of them influence each other. The autobiography Dior wrote and biography about Dior from other writers provide the information on how they influence each other in good and bad ways.

According to Graves in his book *consumerology* people are likely to follow what others done and even stressed the point that this behavior is actually one of the indications which differentiate people to other creatures (2015: 53). This thought is important as it can strengthen the reason on Dior massive acceptance in America and hypothetically shows that people behavior

can influence their expenses. There are two points from Graves's thought that is used in analyzing this research they are *priming* or the first impression of a product (2015: 56) which he said that it really influential to the success of products (2015: 58) and environment of the market place (2015: 61). Moreover, he also stated that the cycle of fashion trends often happen because people are influenced by their surroundings (2015: 55). Additionally, they are unable to differentiate what they need just because others owned that (2015: 55).

Regarding the method of the study, it takes document analysis as the method of the study by using two types of data: the primary and secondary data. The primary data is Dior autobiography while the secondary data are the journals, documents, and articles regarding the study. The study was conducted by observing the use of word choices, metaphors, phrases, and others from the data that are used to describe the relationship between Christian Dior and the United States.

Discussions

Christian Dior and American Market

Fashion industry in America was growing better and becoming one of the promising industries there. The development of American Hollywood

movie also becoming one of the aspects which boosting the growth of American fashion. Decades later, 1930s to 1940, when everything was more modern also American fashion becomes more sophisticated, New York became one of international fashion center with the mushroomed of American high fashion brands under notable designers such as Elizabeth Hawes who became one of America's prominent designer that helped creating the birth of American style in 1930s.

> American fashion began to gain recognition and assert its place during the 1920s and 1930s. Hollywood helped by providing America and the world with the latest ideals of feminine beauty and glamorous dressing. As women saw their favorite stars in exciting new fashions, the demand for these garments transformed the costumers to designers in their own right (Mschoeny, 2001).

The growth of fashion industry placed the designers as the decision maker of a fashion trends, people who created trends among the societies and so did Dior. In 1947, Dior started his career as a fashion designer in Paris and got a great welcome from the societies not only in France and Europe but also America. Dior success in his homeland made Neiman Marcus Corporation proposed to open his store in their department store in Dallas, Texas. Moreover revealed by Dior that Neiman Marcus department store "offers the most expensive things in the world to the wealthiest buyers (Dior, 1957: 65)" which also signified that Dior collections is an expensive one which specialized for certain group of people that make it special and can be used as a tool to differentiate someone's social class.

The appearance of Dior in American market after World War II got various reactions from almost all group of people. For some people, the appearance of Dior was a medicine for women there to revive their confidence and fulfill their need of beauty because of the limitation they got during the war. Specifically, the emergence of Dior and his existence in America has helped them to get back their pride as a woman especially women from upper societies. In his autobiography, Dior said that his dresses was pointed for upper society women and can only be obtained by those who owned a lot of money. Therefore, in the writer opinion, by buying Dior dresses, it can help them to identify themselves and differentiate them from most people. The reactions Dior got was not only coming from the upper society but also the middle and lower society including American government that persuade their

people not to buy his collections because it contradicted with their rules (Olds, 2001: 51). It happened because Dior intentionally creates his dresses by consuming a lot of fabrics. Besides fabrics utilization, another aspect from his collection which attracts people attention was the style he created inspired from hour-glasses. Carmel Snow, the editor of *Harper Bazaar* America said that Dior first collection was a revolution in fashion industry (Pochna, 1994: 9). Dior bravely create dresses which shows the form of women body that similar with hour-glass by adding corset to show the beauty of their body form which was different from the previous trend which gave more freedom for women since it did not utilize corset.

Figure 1. Comparing fashion style in1940s (Craig; glamourdze.com) Left: During the war; Right: After the war/*New Look* 1947 by Dior

In another occasion, protests were done by people who rejected the existence of Dior either in New York or Paris (Olds, 2001: 51). Further, Olds explained:

> Many women criticized the New Look for being too extravagant, wasteful, expensive, and downright unpatriotic. In addition, these clothes were simply too expensive, not to mention impractical, for the average woman. Others complained that the heavy corset and padding necessary to achieve the New Look undermined the newly-found freedom of women (ibid. 51).

In addition, Dior also received many complaint letters from husbands whose wife always wore *Dior*. In his autobiography he said," A garage owner from Los Angles wrote and told me that he had sworn to "tear me apart" on his next visit to Paris. According to him, it was my fault that his wife looked like a stuffed doll of the time of the Civil War (Dior, 1957: 185)."

Figure 2. American feminists, who demonstrated against the New Look. (Palmer, 2010: 28)

In Louisville, 1,265 women believed that the New Look was not only impractical but also anti-feminist, and signed an anti-Dior petition as members of The Little Below the Knee Club—In Georgia, a group of outraged men formed the League of Broke Husbands, hoping to get '30,000 American husbands to hold that hemline' (Palmer, 2010: 27).

In the writer opinion, the negative and positive response he got were something common because everyone had their own idea in seeing something and it also the same the way they reacts to it. However, all of those responses were used as promotional tools because all of that made people familiar with Dior. In his opinion, Dior said that gossips and negative comments from people "worth more than the most expensive publicity campaign in the world (Dior, 1957: 34) and was a "first-class free advertising (ibid.)." In spite of all the negative response he got, Dior still maintains his place as a prominent and influential designer.

Priming (First Impression) and Marketing Strategy

Marketing strategy is important to determine the success of a business because with a good marketing strategy a business can be famous and become a trend among societies. In the case of Dior, by wisely taking and employing every chance he got, he can change his fate in its best condition.

As a fashion designer who expand his empire to America, he need to know the condition and the demand of his American costumers in order to meet their satisfaction and be able to keep their trust to him. Therefore by knowing the difference of French and American clientele he adapted it by making slight differences in his dresses which was marketed in France and America. Additionally, he also understood the culture of both French and American women regarding their habit in spending their money. French women tend to buy 'the quality over quantity' while American women was 'the quantity over quality'. For American women, as they know that what they bought will soon consider outdated they tend to do not mind the quality (Dior, 1957: 76-77). This kind of situation was often benefitted by Dior and his team to market their products. The following topic will talk about another strategy and his belief in producing his collections. The topic is discussed by using Graves's thought about *priming* or first impression toward a certain product and also the environment where Dior products were marketed. Graves explained that *priming* or first impression can shape or influence

people's thought and opinion then they will look for proofs that match with their impression (Graves, 2015: 55).

Priming or the first impression is an important aspect in marketing products because the first impression can last longer in consumers mind and it can influence their decision whether they will buy the product or not (Graves, 2015: 55). In his book, Graves gave an example how priming influence the way people think. The experiment he did is giving question on the following problem. People were asked to guess the answer of 1x2x3x4x5x6x7x8? and 8x7x6x5x4x3x2x1?. The average answer of the first problem was 512 while the second one was 2.250 however it actually has the same answer. The reason why people gave higher answer on the second problem was because the first digit of the problem is higher than the first one. They gave different meaning to the problem from the first digit they heard and estimated the answer based on their first assumption (ibid. p.56). If it is applied in marketing strategy, priming is assumed as the first step in building image on the prospective consumers mind therefore putting a positive image on a product can highly determine the success of it.

In conducting his business, Dior applied some strategy such as implementing the concept of limited edition in which he made limited pieces of his collections to keep the exclusivity of his products. Exclusivity is important since it can make the "commercial value" of the product become higher. In applying the concept of limited edition, Dior not only used it to his designs but also the material/fabrics he used to make the collection.

The next strategy was applying the concept of 'Tradition' as the key point in dress-making. Since the beginning of its establishment, *Dior* was made for fashionable women and arranged to meet Dior desire to preserve French fashion tradition which refers to luxury (Dior, 1957: 21). He also said that," I envisaged my house as a 'craftsman's workshop,' rather than a 'clothes factory'" (Dior, 1957: 21). It shows how persistent he was to keep the tradition alive in his *house*. In term of dress making, Dior is applying 'Old Style Tradition'. The 'Old Style' here was not implying to the older style of fashion but here he emphasized on the tradition. The tradition he keep in making the dress is the technique during the process of dressmaking which exist since before the war (Dior, 1957: 45). Since the old

technique of dress making Dior wants was coming before the war, there were not many skillful dress maker left as the result of the war therefore it is difficult for Dior to look for more member to his 'house'.

> I wanted my dresses to be constructed like buildings, molded to the curves of the female form, stylizing its shape. I emphasized the width of the hips, and gave the bust its true prominence; and in order to give my models more "presence," I revived the old tradition of cambric or taffeta linings.—My return to long forgotten techniques raised a host of difficulties for, of course, none of my staff had any experience with them (Dior, 1957: 40-41).

Then there were also 'Clientele Treatment' which he applied in order to make his customers feel more comfortable. In capitalist society, client is the king and need to be served at their best. This concept was applied by Dior to his clienteles. Every client will be served well to make them comfortable and feel as they were the most special one. In his *house*, each of his clientele will be given a staff especially to treat them from the process of order until the delivery of the dress to each clientele. The personal staffs will always presence every time the clientele come to the *house* for fitting or revising the dress. This strategy was applied to make the clientele comfortable and feel that they were cared.

The last is fashion show. Then there were a regular fashion show he held to keep his clientele informed of his latest collections. Dior debut in 1947 was anticipated by many people since they heard that "by the summer of 1946 word was out that Boussac was backing Christian Dior" (Palmer, 2010: 26). The news was spread widely and "the opening of the new house was announced in the US in the winter of 1946 in *Women's Wear Daily*, and in French *Elle* in January 1947" (Palmer, 2010: 26). This event was a history in fashion world industry since it was marking the revival of fashion industry after World War II. The hype of Dior first fashion show was shown by not only the abundance of attendees who came to the show but also the fact that the invitation letter of the first show also sold in the black market (Palmer, 2010: 26).

Fashion show is one of important aspects for a *couture house* to keep their existence in fashion industry. It is one of the *house* ways to introduce their latest collection to the public. Dior, like any other *couture houses* always held a fashion show every season to make sure that their clientele keep updated with the newest trend. All aspects in the fashion show can also determine the selling of his collections as stated by Graves that, "*Tingkat*

pencahayaan, suara ambient, aroma, produk-produk pelengkap, warna, musik, desain interior—baik dibuat secara artificial maupun alami, semua dapat mempengaruhi cara orang merasakan dan apa yang mereka pilih untuk dilakukan (*Graves, 2015: 86*)—"The lighting level, sound of the ambience, scent, complementary products, colors, music, interior design—either the artificial or natural, all of it can influence the way people feel and what they want to choose to do." Therefore Dior really gave a lot of thought in designing his fashion show hall as he decorated room with flowers, colorful fabrics match with the theme, lights, and even spraying some perfume (Dior, 19587: 135-136).

Conclusion

There are 2 things found in this paper which related to the success of Dior in American market. First is coming from the nature of human being that naturally love beauty, neatness, and things which can make them happy, specifically happened because a group of people wanted to bring back their pride which was taken by the war. Then, there was timing that became the second important things in the writer opinion which support Dior success in America. Post-World War II situation,

people need of luxury as their reminder of their past glorious days—which has been mentioned previously that it related to their pride—and the influence from the massive information from the influential people in fashion industry were some aspects which support his success there. People tendency to easily influence by others also helped Dior to vastly spread among American society especially women who were coming from the upper society as his main consumers. As a fashion designer and a businessman, Dior was quick in reading the demand of the society and efficiently adapted to it. Many people fall to his marketing strategy so that they did not think much to buy his collections. By employing human nature which loves to be taken care and treated as an important people, Dior was able to maintain his market and attract more consumers. Additionally, because there were many fashion houses which was difficult to restart or maintain their business, he did not have many competitors that can harm him in the industry which resulted to make him stay in the spotlight. In the end, his success was placed in his ability in reading the situation where after the war there were many people especially women who long for their previous luxurious life.

References

Bailis, Stanley. 1974. "The Social Sciences in American Studies: An Integrative Conception." *American Quarterly 26*: 202-224. Document.

Craig, Tia. *World War Two Fashion (glamourdazed.com/world-war-two-fashion/post-wwii-influence-in-the-1940s).* 11 July 2011. Pictures. 25 April 2017.

Dior, Christian. 1957. *Christian Dior and I* . New York: E. P. Dutton & Company Inc.

Elliott, Emory. 2007. "Diversity in the United States and Abroad: What Does It Mean When American Studies Is Transnational?" *American Quarterly, Vol. 59, No. 1*: 1-22. Document.

Fishkin, Shelley Fisher. 2005. "Crossroads of Cultures: The Transnational Turn in American Studies—Presidential Address to the American Studies Association, November 2004." *American Quarterly, Vol. 57, No. 1*: 17-57. Document.

Graves, Philip. 2015. Consumer.ology: *Mitos Riset Pasar, Kebenaran tentang Konsumen, dan Psikologi Belanja.* (Translated Version). Jakarta: PT. Elex Media Komputindo. Document.

Lotman, Jurij. 1977. *The Structure of The Artistic Text*. USA: Brown University Press. Document.

Mschoeny. *Fashion American Style: 1900-1999 America's 20th Century Rise to Dominate World Fashion.* 26 October 2001. Document. 9 May 2017.

Olds, Lauren. 2001. "World War II and Fashion: The Birth of the New Look." *Constructing the Past: Vol. 2 : Iss. 1 , Article 6*: 47-64. Document.

Palmer, Alexandra. *Dior's Scandalous New Look.* Spring 2010. https://www.rom.on.ca/sites/default/files/magazine/spring10_feature.pdf . 25 September 2016.

Pochna, marie-France. 1994. *Christian Dior: The Man who Made the World Look New*. New York: Arcade Publishing, Inc., Document.

Rowe, John Carlos. 2010. *A Concise Companion to American Studies.* The United States: Wiley-Blackwell. Document.

Rowe, John Carlos. 2000. *Post-Nationalism, Globalism, and the New American Studies*. California: University of California Press, Ltd., Document.

Sykes, Richard E. "American Studies and the Concept of Culture: A Theory and Method." *American Quarterly, Vol. 15, No. 2, Part 2: Supplement, The Johns Hopkins University Press* (Summer, 1963): 253-270. Document.

Tylor, Edward B. 1873. *Primitive Culture: Researches into the Development of Mythology, Philosophy, Religion, Language, Art, and Custom.* London: John Murray.

Zimmermann, Kim Ann. *American Culture.* 15 January 2015. Document. 20 June 2015. <http://www.livescience.com/28945-american-culture.html>

HYBRIDITY IN POPULAR CULTURE: A TRANSNATIONAL ANALYSIS OF AMERICAN ADAPTATIONS OF JAPANESE MOVIES IN 21st CENTURY

Della Putri Febrina
dellaputri_f@yahoo.com

Abstract

American popular culture has developed from time to time in producing the products. In the progress, the popular product has been modified to satisfy the taste of the consumer and Hollywood is being the one of popular product's makers which applies modifications in manufacturing movies; and the result of the development is hybridity seen in Hollywood movies.

This paper is written under American Studies discipline, by applying Transnational American Studies as the basis of the study. Furthermore, the research also used the theory of hybridity in constructing the analysis which concerned about American adaptations of Japanese original movies, namely *The Grudge, Hachi: A Dog's Tale,* and *Godzilla.* The method used in this paper is the qualitative research which comprises the library research by analyzing the three movies as the primary data and the information of the production as the secondary data.

As the result, there are some conclusions met in the analysis. The first conclusion is the three movies definitely adopt American and Japanese narratives and build a new sphere where the two nations living under the same frame. The adoption includes adoption of values, language, and iconic figure in Japan. The second conclusion relates with the changing of values and taste in Hollywood and shows that Hollywood has power in shifting the values of the original movies which is full of eastern values to be the ones which embodied American values. In short, it can be said that the three American adaptations studied in this paper triggers the emergence of American movies with Asian narratives.

Keywords: Hybridity, transnational, popular culture, adaptation

Introduction

America popular culture is famous across the world. There are music, fashion, movies, books, and many more types of American products which gain any followers and consumers around the world. Fiske mentioned in *Understanding Popular Culture* that "to be made into popular culture, a commodity must also bear the interests of the people" (Fiske,

1989, p.23). Thus, it is apparent to say that in American popular culture gains its reputation because American is succeeded in producing popular products. Some apparent examples may be taken from the growth of chain fast food restaurant such as McDonalds, Pizza Hut, and KFC. The following American fast food restaurants are successful in gaining many consumers in the world and it triggers the opening of

many branches in many parts of the world. Hence, there is particular phenomenon can relate with the branches of those fast food restaurant, especially in relation with the branches outside American. The fact that these branches also adapt to the local culture to create menus that can satisfy the costumers and that fact is eventually brought some impacts in the development of the American chain fast food restaurant. One of obvious impact is the variety of menu in each branch of American chain fast food restaurant.

Forni in *Chaucer's Afterlife: Adaptations in Recent Popular Culture* explained about the concept of adaptation that *"adaptation is never simply imitation but necessarily requires an interpretation of the prior work in order to make the text relevant, comprehensible, and appealing to new audiences"* (Forni, 2013, p.23). Later on, the mechanism is supported by the need of producer to meet the expectations from the audience and how taste influences this kind of method as later also mentioned by Kraidy,

> In this environment program-format adaptations and co-productions are increasingly common; the former entails the adaptation to local parameters of tastes and style of a popular program format gleaned from a different culture, whereas the

latter involve a partnership between several companies based in multiple countries (Kraidy, 2005, p.101).

The statement puts hybridity and adaptation in the similar position as the two concepts which works together to face the globalization in the 21st century. Hence, the practice of American products in adapting and hybridizing becomes the starting point of the paper in analyzing how American alters the taste and value of popular culture product which has different values.

In this study, the writer uses American adaptations of Japanese movies because it is interesting to see the change that can be happened in the adaptations. It is clear that American and Japanese have different values and taste in presenting the culture. Yet, the phenomenon of adaptation between American and Japanese movies has been doubled around 1990s until present. It was started with the invasion of Japanese Horror in America, which begins with the *Ringu, Ju-on, Rinne, Uzumaki, Noroi,* and so on. The hype is strong in America that the Hollywood urges to adapt the movies and makes the American version of those movies. It gives birth to *The Ring, The Grudge, One Missed Call,* and *Pulse* which are known as American version of Japanese Horror

movies. However, this paper will not only focus one genre of movie, but also other genres movies, namely Science Fiction and Melodrama. It is important step for finding the contributions of the two genres in some adaptations such as *Shall We Dance, Hachiko, The Edge of Tomorrow,* and many others. As a result, this paper chooses three adaptation movies with different genre as the objects of the study, namely *The Grudge*, *Hachi: A Dog's Tale,* and the 2014's *Godzilla.* The considerations in choosing these three movies are because these three movies are heavily depicted the three iconic figures in Japan which was *Onryou, Hachiko,* and *Godzilla* and the fact that the three movies gains huge impression in America.

Starting with the adaptation named *The Grudge¸* the movie can be considered as crucial moment in Japanese adaptation movies. Compared with the other two, the sales can be considered as the smallest, which is only $325,680 (boxofficemojo.com). However, the movie sets a franchise in America adaptations and has another interesting fact, namely *The Grudge* is remade by same director of the original movie, Takashi Shimizu. Meanwhile, the second object, *Hachi: A Dog's Tale* is adapted from *Hachiko Monogatari* which was released in 1987.

This story of the loyalty dog is eventually based on the real dog in Japan which receives much recognition among Japanese. The dog is also the symbol of faithfulness in Japan society as the figure is immortalized in Shibuya station and there are many stories about Hachiko written in the book such as Turner's *Hachiko: the True Story of a Loyal Dog,* Newman's *Hachiko Waits,* and Wroblewski's *The Story of Edgar Sawtelle.* The last movie is *Godzilla,* which eventually has been adapted into American version in 1956 by the name of *Godzilla, King of Monsters!* and being remade for the second time under the same name in 1998. The movie that is used as the object of the movie is eventually the third installment of *Godzilla* adaptations. Basically, it is vital to put this movie in study because the movie has a huge success in America. It reaches a bigger profit than the 1956's *Godzilla* and 1998's *Godzilla* as it hit $200,676,069 for the domestic sales and $328,400,000 for foreign sales (boxofficemojo.com). In correlation with the three movies, the writer wants to analyze if the practice of adapting and hybridizing undergone in the American chain fast food restaurant also happened in the American adaptations of Japanese movies. Hence, it is worthy to

see if the hybridity seen in the three movies has constructed a new system of adapting movies in Hollywood. It is because American and Japanese have different values, compared with the other genuine American movies which mirror American values or the adaptations that come from European countries.

Generally, the paper aims to analyze American adaptations regarding to the change of taste and value in Hollywood. The writer argues that the American adaptations of original Japanese movies have changed values beneath the original Japanese movies. Thus, the movie can be appropriate to be presented with American audience. In the same time, the adaptation brings the emergence of hybridity in American popular movies. Also, the adaptation of Japanese movies triggers a question if the taste of Hollywood begins to take interest in eastern value as Hollywood have made some American adaptations of Japanese movies, such as *The Grudge, Hachi: A Dog's Tale,* and *Godzilla* which are the objects of the study.

Methodology

This paper applies a descriptive qualitative approach which focuses on gathering the data related to the topic, but the data is only in the descriptive manner, with no numerical involvement. As Creswell (2003) stated that,

> Qualitative research is a form of interpretive inquiry in which researchers make an interpretation of what they see, hear, and understand. Their interpretations cannot be separated from their own backgrounds, history, contexts, and prior understandings. After a research report is issued, the readers make an interpretation as well as the participants, offering yet other interpretations of the study (p. 212).

Therefore, the research is done by the interpretation of the writer in analyzing the research and how the collection of data enriches the understanding of the writer in conducting further studies about transnational perspective in American popular culture that related to American adaptations of Japanese movies in 21st century. As the primary data of the paper is three movies which are adaptations of Japanese movies, namely *The Grudge, Hachi: A Dog's Tale*, and *Godzilla*, the data involves the close reading about each movie and the production process of the movie. Along with that, the secondary data is needed to complete the information about the nature of movie adaptations in Hollywood, the hybridity that is around American movies and the reception of the

audience toward adaptation movies. There is also information of other movie adaptations which is derived from other countries outside Japan. These data and information are collected from close book text reading, articles, journals, and the reliable websites in the Internet.

Also, the research is related to Transnational Studies which correlates the theory of hybridity, especially in relation with American adaptations of Japanese movies, namely *The Grudge, Hachi: A Dogs Tale,* and *Godzilla.*

Discussion

First object, *The Grudge,* is an American horror movie produced in 2004 and it is adapted from Ju-On which created in 2002. Ju-On is a Japanese movie which is actually based on a novel with a same title by Ohishi Kei. Thus, it is proper to say that *The Grudge* is an indirect adaptation of the novel because the previous adaptation, *Ju-On*, is based on a novel. *The Grudge,* precisely, is about an American social worker named Karen Davis who encounters *onryou* (spirit) which haunts a house and enrage the people who come and live in the house. From this occurrence, the writer finds that Hollywood deliberately changes the main character's nationality into American,

albeit the main character in the novel and original movie are Japanese. By seeing the changing of character, the writer finds that Hollywood purposely changes the character to emphasize that *The Grudge* is the production of Hollywood, even though the *onryou* is remained in the movie as the 'villain'.

Regarding to the concept built by Hollywood, the writer finds that the concept reflects the statement of Rosaldo in *Same Other: Negotiating African Identity in Cultural Production* that,

> Hybridity can imply a space betwixt and between two zones of purity in a manner that follows biological usage that distinguishes two discrete species and the hybrid pseudo-species that results from their combination. Similarly, the anthropological concept of syncretism asserts, for example, that folk Catholicism occupies a hybrid site midway between the purity of Catholicism and that of indigenous religion (Rosaldo via Palmberg and Maria, 2001, p. 14).

The Grudge constructs an interaction between America which is represented by the prominence of Karen Davis, the protagonist in the movie and Japanese which is encoded by the presence of *onryou* as the opponent of Karen in the movie. It creates a communication

between two different identities. However, the writer argues if the movie shapes a new identity as described by Rosaldo in his statement about folk Catholicism since the writer can still identify the difference between these two characters, Karen Davis is an American and the *onryou* is the ghostly character from Japan. Furthermore, the occurrence is rather close to Friedman's statement about 'intermingling of differences' (Friedman, 1998, p.84) which keeps the differences between the two characters and later, the differences are being blurred in the merging between the two characters. The portrayal of this kind of hybridity can be seen in *The Grudge* and is heavily depicted by the development of the character of Karen Davis.

Regarding the examples mirrored by Karen Davis as the main character in *The Grudge*, the writer can also relates them with the concept of mimicry and the 'Other'. Bhabha argues that "the process of mimicry leads to hybrid cultures as an ongoing process of colonial imposition and resistance from the colonized" (Jackson, 2011, p.113) in which Karen Davis, as the main character, portrays an individual that mimicked the local culture to mingle with the local culture, namely Japanese culture. In here, the writer assumes the hybridity in

the *The Grudge* emerged because of the process of mimicry where the main character is described as an American character who adapts with her new environment by studying the local culture and trying to imitate the manner of Japanese people. However, the notion is not completely worked in every scene. One of the examples is Karen behaves differently while she is witnessing a crying baby in the train. She's pitying the mother while everyone in the train consider it as a bother in public. It's an obvious thing in Japan that letting a baby in public area is a bother because it is considered as a violation to other people's privacy. In the same time, it tells that she does not completely absorb Japanese's way of as an American, albeit she is trying to learn the local culture. The writer sees the scene as the depiction of the 'Other' in the movie. The 'Other' is also a concept proposed by Bhabha and he explains that the concept is derived from a notion of "otherness that is insistently identified with the vagaries of the depolitized Eurocentric critic" (Bhabha, 1994, p. 19). The concept initially relates to the idea of the West and the rest where the West is valued as the superior. Yet, in *The Grudge,* as the movie is a product of adaptation from Japanese movie, the writer sees that the 'Other' is

depicted by the presence of American character, albeit *The Grudge* is a product of American production. However, the function of 'the Other' in *The Grudge* is seen as important asset as the movie often relies on portraying the condition of the 'Other' in the movie.

Regarding the idea of the 'Other' that presumed previously, the writer continues the discussion about *The Grudge* in the perspective of the 'Other' in the movie. In the discussion, the writer presents the evidences from the scenes which show how the American characters are intended to be the important aspects, despite the environment of the story happened in Japan and the core of the story is heavily related with the Japanese folk story about *onryou*. Plate and Jasper also states in *Imag(in)ing Otherness: Film Visions of Living Together (AAR Cultural Criticism Series)* that, "The term "otherness" is initially used here to denote that which resides outside the margins of the dominant culture representations, outside the social-symbolic order" (Plate and Jasper, 1999, p.4). In the process, *The Grudge* strengthens its eminence as an American movie, albeit the idea is derived from a Japanese movie entitled *Ju-On.*

Generally, from the portrayal of the American characters in the above discussion, the writer finds that there is a correlation of hybridity and the notion of the 'Other'. The American characters in the movie is aimed as the 'Other' which are identified differently with the local people, Japanese. Yet, the existence of American characters as the 'Other' seems to deploy the status of *The Grudge* as an American adaptations because it can be seen in the way the scenes employed the characteristics of American and Japanese. In fact, *The Grudge* is a horror movie that employs the idea of *onryou* as the villain in the story. As the movie has a clear relation with this evil spirit from Japan, the movie puts a subtle impression about the life of the Japanese and the value beneath the movie. Also, there is a clear mixture between American and Japanese characters as there are American and Japanese characters appeared in the movie. In portraying the characters, the writer also finds some American characters imitates the local culture, albeit there is a slight hint of 'Otherness' seen in the movie which emphasizes how the American characters are different with the Japanese characters. The mixture of language is also seen in *The Grudge* where some American characters are capable of speaking in Japanese and vice versa. Moreover, the adoption of *onryou* describes the hybridity

in the movie where *The Grudge* borrows, not only the plot of the story from *Ju-On,* but also the character of *onryou* in the movie.

Then, the second movie is *Hachi: A Dog's Tale* which released in 2009. As previously mentioned, the movie is adapted from a Japanese movie entitled *Hachiko Monogatari* which also based on the real story of a dog named Hachi. In contrast with *The Grudge,* the movie is directed by a Swedish director named Lasse Hallstrőm and the casts are almost all American actors and actresses with some minor Japanese actors. The movie itself is British-American production albeit it portrays about the story of loyalty dog in Japan and the important thing is the movie regarded as the American version of *Hachiko Monogatari.* While the plot remains in the same way, the story is built in American environment.

Then, to see the hybridity of the movie clearly the writer examines the scenes displayed in the movie which portrays the cultures between American and Japanese. The first scene is begun with the scene of elementary grade schoolers talk about the heroes of their lives in front of the class. The first girl, Heather, mentions Columbus as the hero in her life. Everyone is clapping their hands after she

ends the speech about her admiration about Colombus. Next, when a boy named Ronnie writes 'Hachiko' in the blackboard, everyone is frowning and none of them understands about the figure of Hachiko. In this scene, the atmosphere of 'Other' is employed as Hachiko is unknown by Ronnie's classmates. Slightly different with *The Grudge,* the 'Other' in the movie is Hachiko, the iconic figure of the movie. In relation with the finding, the writer quotes Rieser, Fuchs, and Phillips' statement about iconic figure in America,

> Icons are American icons not because they are limited to the nation, but because they create the nation state as an imagined community through the myth of an 'America' that is presented as a stable, indisputable term-historically (a genealogy that implicitly runs from 1607), geographically (delimited by national borders), and culturally (anchored in a supposed unity of cultural values). Thus, the American iconic figures are defined by the fact that they are adopted or accepted by a large segment of the national public, but, more importantly, in that they play a decisive role in the shaping of national discourses (Rieser, Fuchs, and Phillips, 2013, p.6).

Hachiko in the movie is the 'Other', nobody know about Hachiko. Even, Ronnie, who mentions Hachiko, does not

know for sure about Hachiko's origin. He only knows that Hachiko is his grandfather's dog.

Then, the movie continues and eventually shows that Hachiko is a dog from Japan and above of all, it is owned by a monk, before it is sent away to somewhere in America. The writer finds that the movie, somehow, gives an implied notion that *Hachi: A Dog's Tale* is an American adaptation of Japanese movie by transporting Hachiko, the iconic figure from the original movie, to America. Moreover, the movie highlights the relation between Hachiko and the monk as both of them are from Japan and how this relationship, later, is used to create the atmosphere of Zen in the movie. Zen is from Eastern and as proposed by Humphreys in his *A Western Approach to Zen,* he explains that Zen teaches people that the intellectuality is eventually limited and thinking beyond the thinking is the only way to reach the Truth and to gain the experience of knowing mind (Humphreys, 1999, p. 15). Hachiko's action by sitting and waiting for its late owner can be compared with the action that is usually done by the monk in meditating because both actions do not require anything, except to sit and focus into one purpose. In the movie, the purpose is achieved as the

director shows that Hachiko eventually meets his late owner again.

Initially, Hollywood also produced some movies about dogs and one of the well-known movies was *Lasssie Come Home* which portrays the story of a rough collie that reaches thousand miles only to come back to its true owner. The movie is a hit and Lassie becomes a symbol of friendship between a dog and its owner. The movie also inspires some other movies about dog which eventually highlights the bond between the owner and the dog, such as *Air Bud, Beethoven, Old Yeller, Far from Home: The Adventures of Yellow Dog,* and many more. Inevitably, the American movies about dog are always the story of a young boy who has a dog and how he creates a friendship with his dog. Because of that, dog is known as a man's best friend in America and that very idea is a bit different with the value that has been implemented in *Hachi: A Dog's Tale.* There were several characteristics of Hachi that has been explained in the story regarding his identity as a dog derived from Japan.

Generally, the hybridity in the movie is also employed similarly with *The Grudge,* albeit the setting of the movie is not in Japan, but in Woonsocket, Rhode Island. Hachiko's story is imported into

America and there is no change of the depiction of the dog, except the movie gives a subtle notion that the story is happened in America. The character of Hachiko is not changed into another 'Beethoven' or another 'Lassie', the movie keeps its identity as a Japanese dog and at the same time, the idea brings a new concept in American dog's movie because the identity and value of the dog are derived from Japan.

The last movie is *Godzilla* in 2014. The figure is famous among Americans. West in *The Japanification of Children's Popular Culture: From Godzilla to Miyazaki* states that the Americans takes interest in Japanese popular culture begins since *Godzilla* was put in the screen in Japan in 1954 and in America in 1956. The following movie about *Godzilla* is soon released and the American children are familiarized with *Godzilla* as same as the Japanese youngsters" (West, 2008, p. vii).

As American production, *Godzilla* which directed by Gareth Edwards, puts some implied notion that the American characters in the movie have close relation with Japanese culture. One of the scenes is when a young Ford Brody is planning to make a surprise birthday for his father. Among his toys, there are some American toys such as American toys soldiers, tanks,

helicopters, a miniature of Godzilla, a miniature of US rocket, and a huge poster of Godzilla which is written in Kanji. The depiction of the scene constructs an idea that this American movie is heavily related with Japan. In comparison with the previous installation, 1998's *Godzilla* cuts any relation between the movie and the original movie. Robert Emmerich, as the director of the movie, makes an American adaptation that completely removes the ties between *Godzilla* and the origin. Instead of showing the connection between Japan and America as it appears in 1954's *Gojira* and 1956's *Godzilla,* the movie is made the connection with French as the story of *Godzilla* in 1998 indicates that the appearance of *Godzilla* is caused by the French government.

Earlier, the writer has mentioned that the story develops its plot around the event that happened in a nuclear company in Japan. The portrayal of the story eventually depicts the Fukushima earthquake of 2011. The earthquake had many casualties and one of the events that gained much attention during that time is when there was a release of nuclear material that caused by the earthquake. Gareth Edwards, as the director of the movie, mentions his intention to put the event in the movie,

Our film is not about Fukushima at all, and the reactor is located in a fictional city near Tokyo," says Edwards, "but I wanted it to reflect the questions that the incident at Fukushima raised. The news images from the Tohoku earthquake are burned onto our minds. Other generations had the Titanic or the Blitz. For us it's tsunamis and September 11. "So when you make a disaster movie that is trying to say something about our world, you reach for images that haunt you." (Edwards via Collin, 2014, telegraph.co.uk).

Regardless the fact that the movie is the American version of *Gojira,* the director intentionally puts one of the significant accidents that ever happened in Japan. However, since the story is the American version, the involvement of America in the story is inevitable. The plot progresses into a point that harmful creature named MUTO went to Nevada, Texas to take away the nuclear disposal in there. In the movie, the American armed forces were heavily participated in managing the attack to MUTO and there was no any other party that cooperated with American in destroying MUTO, except *Godzilla.* From this depiction, the writer assumes the intention of the director to focus on the American armed forces and *Godzilla* is the metaphor of the collaboration between

America and Japan. The collaboration go even further when *Godzilla* was the one managed to destroy MUTO and one of the American characters named Ford Brody was the one who destroy the MUTO's eggs. Some of the characters in 2014's *Godzilla* perform code switching. In the movie, there is a portrayal of American family who lived in Japan. Unlike Ben's family in *The Grudge,* the family of Joe Brody in *Godzilla* has stayed in Japan for a long time and it is usual that the characters in the family were capable of speaking Japanese.

In sum, after extracting how the cultural hybridity is presented in the three movies, the writer have assumes that regardless the different genre of the movie, all the three movies makes clear boundary between the two cultural identities which surfaced in the movies. There is no truly blending culture in the movies as the writer can see on how the American and Japanese character carried out their culture in their own manners, even though there are some hints that some characters tried to mimic the other culture. Commonly, the three movies also put the Japanese narratives in the plot while the movies are executed favorably in Hollywood's way. The dramatization, the big explosion, and the terror which were put in those three

movies resembles the way of Hollywood produced the movie. However, the alienated cultural epitomes that had been shown by the iconic figure of *onryou*, Hachiko, and Godzilla fabricate the three movies into movies which surfaced American and Japanese storylines. The code switching is also important to be noticed in these three movies as the code switching has a significant implication to make the Japanese iconic figures keeps their identities as Japanese as the characters in the three movies which perform the code switching functioned as the bridge which shadows the American and Japanese cultures in the movies.

The hybridity is much related with the idea of adaptation in which the writer finds the adaptation is the reason why the emergence of hybridity seen in the three movies. Referring to the notion, the writer puts the consideration that the hybridity in these movies relates with its status as popular product. Crothers in *Globalization and American Popular Culture* mentions that,

> The primary purpose of popular culture was to be consumed by users who paid for the privilege of reading a mass-produced book or magazine. Such production was essentially secular in nature, meaning that nothing was sacred or holy-

everything was available for marketing and consumption (Crothers, 2007, p.13).

While the writer agrees that the presence of the movies is heavily related with the desire of the producer for getting much audience, the writer argues that the movies in thesis are secular in nature. All three movies carry identities of American and Japanese to create the adaptation movies and identity is important as stated by Weedon that, "identity is important to occupying the position of 'knowing subject' and it is as knowing subjects that we speak and act most effectively in the world" (Weedon, 2004, p. 154). Furthermore, the presence of the double identities in the movie creates hybridity in the three movies. The hybridity is seen through the adoption of characters, language, formula, and plot in the movie, creating the American adaptations of Japanese movies.

To relate these movies and the taste of the movie production in Hollywood, it is important for the writer to mention the significance of the taste. In *The Sociology of Taste,* Gronow (1997) explains about the taste's importance of Pierre Bourdieu that,

> Bourdieu adopted one possible empiricist solution to the antimony

of taste by claiming that the taste of the ruling class is always the legitimate taste of a society. But in his opinion this legitimate class is not genuine good taste: in fact, there could not possibly be any genuine good taste. Legitimate taste pretends to be the universally valid and disinterested good taste, whereas in reality it is nothing more than the taste of one particular class, the ruling class (p. 11).

Regarding to above statement, Bourdieu points out the taste usually relates with the ruling class. However, the writer argues if the taste in Hollywood's production related to the ruling class. In fact, Hollywood has extensive history in producing movies. There are tons of movies being produced from time to time and that is the reason why Hollywood can be regarded as one of the most productive movie industries in the world. Yet, by producing many movies, it means there is a possibility that Hollywood tries to employ the similar formula to achieve the demand in manufacturing movies and that is eventually the result of the hyper-producing movies in Hollywood. The producer tends to apply similar formula to make shortcuts in producing movies. The example can be seen in the fascination of the producer with composing slasher theme in creating horror movies and the

method is being reproduced from time to time by the expectation that the audience will favor the movie because it is the same as the well-known previous one. Langford (2005) mentions about the constant production of series in horror movies in *Film Genre (Hollywood and Beyond)* that,

> Horror films in general remain sensational, gory, and relatively cheap, and are promoted in ways that discourage 'serious' critical attention. The seriality and repetition to which horror properties are prone (*Halloween,* five installments since 1978; *Friday 13th*, nine since 1980; *Nightmare on Elm Street,* seven from 1984 to 1994, plus parodic franchise 'face-off' *Freddy vs Jason,* 2003; even knowing postmodern pastiches *Scream*, 1996, *Scary Movie* and *I Know What You Did Last Summer*, 1997, generating their own part-parodic but seriously profitable franchises) also render horror 'generic' in the old, pejorative sense of term (p. 160).

Some movies mentioned above produces some iconic figures such as *Ghostface, Leatherface, Freddy Krueger, Michael Myers, Jason Voorhees,* and many more. All of them engage with the insanity of outcast characters that drives the characters into killing machines. The other example that can be taken in projecting the similar horror movies villains is its ties

with demon-themed plot. Since *Rosemary's Baby, The Exorcist* and *The Omen* regain much recognition among American audience, the horror movies set with the demon as the antagonist become the common plot. For *The Omen,* the movie built its franchise and manufactured several sequels and a remake such as *Damien: Omen II, Omen III: The Final Conflict, Omen IV: The Awakening,* and 2006's *the Omen.*

Then, in the 2000s, the trend of Asian horror boomed all over the world, along with the arrival of Japanese Horror to America. Hantke (2010) in *American Horror Film (The Genre at the Turn of the Millenium)* frames about the beginning of Hollywood's fascination toward Asian films,

> Roy Lee, the so-called remake king whom *Variety* identifies as "the man who brought Asia's horror film culture to America," has been the engine driving this trend (Frater). He has brokered the sale of rights to remake numerous Asian films to American producers, earning himself and his company, Vertigo Entertainment, producer credits in the process (Friend). Lee began the process with J-Horror films in the early 2000s, with remakes of *Ringu* (1998) (remade as *The Ring* in 2002), *Ju-on* (2003) (remade as *The Grudge* in 2004), and *Dark Water*

(2002) (remade with the same title in 2005) (p.5).

Roy Lee, as told in the above statement, is the one who opened the gate of Asian movies, particularly Japanese horror movies. This concept transforms the idea about the ghost in American movies which, earlier, does not bear any identity, unless for some horror movies which based on Native Americans' myth and legend such as *The Shining* and *Poltergeist*. Nonetheless, the movies do not clearly imprint the cultural identity in in the movies as much as *The Grudge.* For instance, *The Shining* does not clearly depict the appearance of Native American as the spirit which haunted the protagonist in *The Shining*. Instead the director just gives some implied hints about the connection of the movie with Native American by the putting Native Americans' artworks in the movie. Nonetheless, the appearance of *onryou* in American horror movies provides an invention in American horror movies' characters that the 'monster' in the movie can possess characteristics that make it identifiable.

Japanese culture which is exploited in the movie adaptation functions as the attraction to American audience and the

Japanese culture are considered as the magnet that brings an interest in the audience because the movies are carried different values. It is an American movie that the audiences know, but there is an enigma about the movie because there is an alien culture that is different with the American value. This notion is slightly related with the hypothesis that is being assumed by Joseph and Fink in *Performing Hybridity* that "the hybridity might result a recolonizing multiculturalism which functioned as a tool to homogenize the complexity of cultural identities and historical specificity of narratives of origin" (Joseph and Fink, 1999, p. 250). In the production of the three movies, the complexity of the cultural identities of the characters brings hybridity in the movies as the movies does not focus entirely with America and its values, as there are other characters that obviously come from Japan. Related to that, the hybridity rejuvenates the familiar notion in Hollywood's method of producing movies. The cultural identity of Japan that is displayed in the three movies had added new insight of American movies that the American movies are no longer about America and Americans; it can be about another nation and implants

new values that are completely different with the American values.

In addition, the appearance of the three movies as adaptation movies maps the timeline of American adaptation of Japanese movies. *The Grudge* which is produced in 2004 initiates the emergence of adaptation of Asian horror movies such as *Dark Water* (2005), *Pulse* (2006), *One Missed Call* (2008), *The Eye* (2008), *The Echo* (2008) and many more; *Hachi: A Dog's Tale* is the continuation of Hollywood's adaptation of Japanese drama such as *Shall We Dance* which had similar actor, namely Richard Gere; and *Godzilla* (2014) prolongs the franchise of the monster's movie in Hollywood. Moreover, the writer finds that the adaptation adds some spice on Hollywood's fascination toward Asian narratives, especially Japanese, as Hollywood begins to produce more movies which are heavily related with Japanese culture, such as *The Last Samurai* (2003), *Memoirs of A Geisha* (2005), *Letters From Iwo Jima* (2006), *The Ramen Girl* (2008), *Emperor* (2012), *Unbroken* (2014), *The Forest* (2016), and many more.

Lev in *Transforming the Screen, 1950-1959* mentions that during World War II, England becomes the important consumer of Hollywood movies and then

the sales of the movies becomes even greater by the supporting of Western Europe, Latin America, and Japan in consuming the movies since in the early 1960s (Lev, 2003, p.147). Essentially, Nachbar and Lause mentioned in *Popular Culture: An Introductory Text* that,

> The need and desire of the producers of popular culture to reflect audience beliefs and values in order to ensure that their product will be accepted by the masses, and the uncertainty involved in defining the precise nature of this zeitgeist at any particular time (Nachbar and Lause,1992, p.6).

Therefore, from the above statement, the writer finds that the fascination of Hollywood in producing movies with eastern value can be related with the status of Hollywood as a global market and its desire to fulfill the audience's expectation.

Conclusion

The three adaptation movies taken as the objects of the study in the thesis have shown hybridity in textual and production perspectives. The mixture of elements that reflected in the movie implies that American adaptations have dual identities which replicate the American and Japanese elements. In the same time, there are also some adoptions of Japanese value seen in

the movies which indicates that the American adaptations of original Japanese movies in the 21st century tends to put the Japanese value in American sphere, as seen in *The Grudge, Hachi: A Dog's Tale,* and *Godzilla.* The values in the three movies can be strongly interpreted as the Japanese culture depicted clearly in the three movies by putting the three iconic figures from Japan in the three movies. *The Grudge* replicates *onryou* which came from Japanese folktale about avenging ghost, *Hachi: A Dog's Tale* put the story and the portrayal of Hachiko, a loyal dog from Japan, and *Godzilla* forms a story about the tall monster from Japan.

However, there is a clear distinction between the three American adaptations and the original movies which put the American adaptations as the product of Hollywood. *The Grudge* describes the story of *onryou* based on American characters' perspectives, *Hachi: A Dog's Tale* defines the story of Hachiko as a loyal dog seen in the perspective of the American people, and *Godzilla* which trails the story of a monster in the defending the American people from unknown threat. While the American adaptations clearly put the three iconic figures from Japan, the story within the movies are about American narratives. The

iconic figures of the three movies are adopted in the three movies to see the building of the story which relate to American people.

The domination of the American characters in the movie gives clear identities that the movies are American productions. The intention of Hollywood to put the American characters as the main characters in the three movies indicates Hollywood's need to make the three movies to identify the characteristic of American. From the emergence, the writer also sees Hollywood's intention to get the similar portion of popularity that once had been had by the original movies, albeit the original movies represent Asian narratives. *The Grudge* that once was known as *Ju-On,* a Japanese horror movie is labeled as an American movie, despite the plot is mostly similar with the original one; so do the two other movies, *Hachi: A Dog's Tale* and *Godzilla.*

Also, the American adaptations of Japanese movies that bring familiarity to American audience toward Japanese values also trigger the production of movies which related to Asian narratives. *The Grudge* which tells about an Asian horror made some producers in America to make some adaptations of Asian horror movies and in the same, the production of

the Asian horror movies in American sphere establishes the power of Hollywood in creating J-Horror in American environment; *Hachi: A Dog's Tale* enriches American narratives about dogs which later inspires some popular American products in depicting the loyalty of Hachiko; and *Godzilla* which previously had been known by American audiences had stabilized the connection of American toward the Japanese iconic figure as Godzilla is no longer seen as a threat for American, but as the hero that maintained the life of Americans.

References

Bhabha, H. K.(1994). *The Location of Culture*. New York: Routledge.

Creswell, J. W. (2003). *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Method Approaches, Second Edition*. California: SAGE Publications, Ltd.

Crothers, L. (2007). Globalization and American Popular Culture. Maryland: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers.

Fiske, J. (1989). Understanding Popular Culture. London: Routledge.

Forni, K. (2013). Chaucer's Afterlife: Adaptations in Recent Popular Culture. Jefferson: McFarland.

Friedman, S. (1998). Mappings: Feminism and the Cultural Geographics of Encounter. Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Gronow, J. (1997). The Sociology of Taste. New York: Routledge.

Hantke, S. (2010). American Horror Film (The Genre at the Turn of the Millenium). Mississippi: University of Mississippi Press.

Joseph, M., & Fink, J. N. (1999). Performing Hybridity. Minnesota: University of Minnesota Press.

Kraidy, M. M. (2005). Hybridity, of the Culture Logic of Globalization. Philadelphia: Temple University Press.

Langford, B. (2005). Film Genre (Hollywood and Beyond). Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, Ltd.

Nachbar, J., & Lause, K. (1992). Popular Culture: An Introductory Text. Bowling Green: Bowling Green State University Popular Press.

Palmberg, M., & Baaz, M. E. (2001). Same and Other: Negotiating African Identity in Cultural Production. Uppsala: Nordic African Institute.

Plate, S. B., & Jasper, D. (1999). Imag(in)ing Otherness: Filmic Visions of Living Together (AAR Cultural Criticism Series). Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Rieser, K., Fuchs, M., & Phillips, M. (2013). ConFiguring America: Iconic Figures, Visuality, and the American Identity. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Turow, J. (2013). Media Today: Mass Communication in a Converging World. London: Routledge.

Collin, R. (2014, May 13). Gareth Edwards interview: 'I wanted Godzilla to reflect the questions raised by Fukushima'. Retrieved May 23, 2016, from The Telegraph: http://www.telegraph.co.uk/culture/film/10820543/Gareth-Edwards-interview-I-wanted-Godzilla-to-reflect-the-questions-raised-by-Fukushima.html

Edwards, G. (Director). (2014). Godzilla [Motion Picture].

Hallström, L. (Director). (2009). Hachi: A Dog's Tale [Motion Picture].

Mojo, B. O. (n.d.). Godzilla (2014). Retrieved January 6, 2016, from Box Office Mojo: http://www.boxofficemojo.com/movies/?id=godzilla2012.htm

Mojo, B. O. (n.d.). Ju-On: The Grudge. Retrieved May 15, 2016, from Box Office Mojo: http://www.boxofficemojo.com/movies/?page=intl&id=juonthegrudge.htm

GUIDELINES FOR AUTHORS

The editor of Rubikon Journal welcomes article submissions in accordance with the following guidelines:

1. Articles have not been published or accepted for publication, or are being considered for publication elsewhere. In addition to the manuscript, a written statement should be attached which clarifies that the article is original and does not contain any elements of plagiarism.

2. Types of article suitable for publication include the following; research report (laboratory, field, archives), conceptual ideas, studies, theory applications.

3. Another suitable type of article is book review. Please note the following requirements for submitting book reviews:
   a. book being reviewed should be newly published (within the last one year for books in Indonesian and two years for books in other foreign languages),
   b. book reviews should be between 3-5 pages in length, and
   c. a copy/scan of the book cover should be attached.

4. Articles are written in Indonesian or English (preferable) using academic language along with standard academic writing structure and composition. Manuscripts are typed 1,5 spaced in a quarto paper size (A4), between 15-20 pages in length including references, pictures, and tables.

5. Article should be in essay from which includes:
   a. tittle (15-20 words),
   b. author's name (without academic degree) with an e-mail address and institution's name,
   c. abstract in English (150-200 words for each) which includes research problem, methods and result,
   d. keyword in English (5-7 words),
   e. author's personal information and e-mail address,
   f. introduction (without subsection, 2-3 pages) which includes background, objectives, and literature reviews/theoretical construct (if needed) of research. The introduction section ends with an emphasis on items to be discussed,
   g. methodology
   h. discussion,
   i. conclusion, and
   j. references.

6. Reference list format is based APA (American Psychological Association) style. Reference list should appear at the end of the article and includes only literatures actually cited in the manuscripts. References are ordered albhabetically and chronologically. When writting a reference list, plase use the following conventions;

   Azhar & Matsumura, K. (2010). A Study of 'Kenry' in Japanese and 'Hak' in Indonesian. *Jurnal Humaniora, 22*, p.22-30.

   Nur, T. (2008). *Verba dalam Bahasa Arab dan Bahasa Indonesia: Studi Gramatika Konstasif.* (Unpublished Dissertation). Universitas Gadjah Mada. Yogyakarta

   Reid, A. (2011). *Menuju Sejarah Sumatra: Antara Indonesia dan Dunia*. Jakarta: Yayasan Obor.

   Zachareck, S. (2008). Natural Women. *The New York Times*. Retrieved from http://www.nytimes.com /2008/04/27/books/review/Zachareck

7. The editor appreciates if authors excerpt information from subsequent published articles in Jurnal Rubikon.

8. Articles should be submitted in soft files using Microsoft Word application to jurnal.rubikon@gmail.com

9. Authors will be sent notification of receipt of manuscripts and editorial decisions (whether the articles are accepted or not) by e-mail. Manuscripts that are not published will not be returned to the authors.

10. A successful author is obliged to contribute publication fee with minimum amount of Rp. 100.000,00 (one hundred thousand rupiahs) and in return is entitled to 2 (two) copies of the print issue in which the article appears.