STUDY ON PLACE ATTACHMENT OF STREET VENDORS TO THE TRADING SPACE IN ALUN-ALUN JEPARA

Aisyha Farah Dina Purba¹, Dyah Titisari Widyastuti²

¹Department of Architecture and Planning, Faculty of Engineering, Universitas Gadjah Mada, Yogyakarta, Indonesia
²Department of Architecture and Planning, Faculty of Engineering, Universitas Gadjah Mada, Yogyakarta, Indonesia

ABSTRACT

The old alun-alun of Jepara is the center of city activity and also used to be the center of street vendors activity. Since 2019, the local government decided to move all the street vendors activity into new alun-alun where is one kilometre away from the previous location. The majority of street vendor stated that the new location is not as comfortable as the previous location. It becomes their reason for illegally returning to trade in the old alun-alun. This research aims to examine how far is the place attachment influence for trading based on the preference of street vendors. The exploration of place attachment was based on three variables, i.e. attachment of person, process, and place. Qualitative research method was conducted through literature review, interview, and field observation. The result shows there is no influence of person and process in street vendors place attachment in trading. Only the physical and social form of place indicates the significant influence in place attachment. The factors of access, space shape and size, amenities, and attractiveness activity contribute to the place attachment in trading that is not found yet in new alun-alun.

Keywords:
Alun-alun, Place Attachment, Trading, Street Vendors, Jepara

1. Introduction

Jepara is currently under renewal image of the city. Jepara become existence because it has the island of Java Karimun, and become a transit point for tourist who want to go to the Java Karimun. This is done to improve the quality of life of people and encourage people to be able to enjoy the city. One of the developments consists of open public space. The crisis of open public space in Jepara is important to be developed considering the existing city is currently losing open public space. In accordance with Hamid Shirvani in his book Urban Design Process (1985) there are elements that shape the city. Land use, shape and mass of buildings, circulation and parking, open spaces, pedestrian paths, wayfindings and signage.

In the urban context, alun-alun¹ is categorized as an open public space. A place for community activities both passive and active in groups of people and individuals. Alun-alun, as element of the city, cannot be seperated from the history of the city transformation. (Ikaputra, 1995).

Alun-alun is one of catur gatra elements of old city, besides palace, mosque and market. Alun-alun is rectangular in form, with two beringin trees in the middle and then there is the palace / kingdom / regent’s office and there are mosque and market next to alun-alun. This concept was then believed to be the concept that always underlies the formation of the old royal Javanese city (Ikaputra, 1995).

The location of the Jepara old alun-alun is in the center of government area with the Regent’s office on the east side, the Great Mosque is on the south side of the old alun-alun and market in the west of the old alun-alun.

On the other hand, new alun-alun is not Javanese alun-alun that has the philosophy of catur gatra. It can be interpreted as the Javanese alun-alun it should be. It is a common public open space that used by public for daily activity.

This research is located in the city of Jepara, Central Java. Precisely at the two alun-alun in Jepara. This research was conducted based on the issue of removal of all public activities especially street vendors from old alun-alun to new alun-alun by city government. Initially, this transfer is not going well because some traders are still selling again at the old place in old alun-alun.

1 Public open space that everyone uses to interact
Based on a map from Google Earth, it appears that the distance between the two alun-aluns is around about 1 kilometre, old alun-alun has a bigger size than new alun-alun. Old alun-alun about 0,9 ha and new alun-alun about 0,67 ha.

Old alun-alun is surrounded by government buildings and other public buildings and is on the city main street. Meanwhile, new alun-alun is next to the beach, which is rarely accessed by public who do not have destination to the surroundings building. The bus terminal, which is one of buildings next to the new alun-alun is also not oriented towards alun-alun which makes new alun-alun less visible.

Nowadays, in accordance with new government regulations, old alun-alun only be used for government sacred events. District folk parties or other celebrations. New alun-alun has been reactive since the government decided to move all activities in old alun-alun to new alun-alun.

In the old alun-alun, other than March, April and August, there are no activities or events that are accommodated. Although the activity has been focused on the new alun-alun, it does not have a positive impact on street vendors. Then it becomes a reason for street vendors back to old alun-alun illegally.

According to McGee and Yeung (1977) there are three kinds of distribution patterns of traders, distribution patterns, service patterns, and management patterns. Street vendors spread out in the edges of alun-alun follow the path of the alun-alun shape and the road pattern. The pattern of merchant services is a mobile trader who is localized. The emergence of street vendors in public open space is a common thing, but it can have a negative or positive impact.

At this time new alun-alun looks quite although fulfilled by street vendors, no visitors come.

The existing conditions between old alun-alun and new alun-alun looks quite different. Building and enclosure function next to the new alun-alun is not attracted people to come. Due to location factors, the condition of the square is poorly maintained and the square itself is not ready to accommodate activities.

There are factors that make street vendors uncomfortable to trade in new alun-alun.

This research focus on this question:

1. How are the street vendors activity setting in new alun-alun currently and the activity setting in old alun-alun in the past?
2. What factors influence place attachment of street vendors to old alun-alun?

From the problems that arise in new alun-alun, it can be concluded that there is a place attachment of the street vendors to old alun-alun. The purpose of this research is to find out what setting activities in the old alun-alun and in the new alun-alun. What factors influence the place attachment of traders to the old alun-alun. After that it also aims to provide recommendations to the government regarding the new alun-alun.

2. Literature Review

2.1 The Principles of Public Open Space

Public open space as shared space, where people do functional activities and rituals within a community, both daily life and in celebration periodically, a place of society do personal activities and in group.

In the physical sense, public open space must be open to anyone who wants to express, can be related to economic, social or cultural content. According to Darmawan (2007) one of the functions of public open space is as an economic space for street vendors in trading their merchandise. The presence of traders in public open spaces can be an attraction. So that the presence of traders can be a reason for visitors to come back to the public open space itself.

Stephen Carr (1992) identified five basic principles for fulfill the needs of users of public open space.

1. Comfort: Comfort is an attribute of successful public space. Complete amenities make visitors feel at home and comfortable in open space.
2. Relaxation: Natural element like park, pond, vegetation can affect someone psychologically and be an attraction.
3. Passive attachment: organizing event regularly can
generate visitor interest.
4. Active attachment: social space can make social activity and be a place.
5. Accessibility: good accessibility can be success of public open space because it can be considered safe and comfortable.

The principle of public open space is studied to assess the quality of old and new alun-alun as well as to compare the both of alun-alun.

2.2 Activity Setting
Activity Setting in this research is a form of interaction between user and place. This is because one of the elements in place attachment is a social element that often appears in public open space. Identification of activity setting on alun-alun explained by theory Gehl (2001):

1. Type of activity: type of commodity, beverage or non beverage
2. Time activity: Trading time in the morning, noon or night.
3. Pattern of activity: Street vendors trade with cart or stall, settle or moving and provide dine-in facility or takeaway.

Layouts of a place is designed in addition to getting aesthetic appreciation, the layout is also designed to accommodate certain activities. This is called the activity setting that are informed from human behavior. John Lang, in his book Creating Architectural Theory (1987) said that human behavior has several specific goals and are distinguished from each other based on more specific actions or activities.

Activity setting theory is used to determine whether the activity setting on the old alun-alun, affect the place attachment of street vendor. Activity setting is identified by field observation and interview to found the result. All of the activities managed by mapping in a plan.

2.3 Place Attachment
Place attachment is defined as the development of affective bond or link between people or individuals and specific places. (Hidalgo and Hernandez, 2001). In this sense, the concept of place attachment is incorporated to examine, evaluate and understand the feeling that are connected to the place, as well as to reflect its value. It is found that the physical attributes and characteristics have a strong influence on the degree of attachment. This is split in three variables (Scannel and Gifford, 2010):

1. Process: included affect, cognition and behavior. Based on length time that a person spends to get involved a place.
2. Person: subject or people always having an attachment of individual or group, culture, family to place. It is specific to an individual which affects place attachment directly and indirectly.
3. Place: Social interaction and physical natural and built. Includes a culture factor, interaction factor, social factor, preference and satisfaction.

Lewicka (2011), indicated that socio demographic, physical and social predictors play key role in attachment. Place attachment theory is elaborated to get any factors that influences attachment to the old alun-alun.

2.4 Attributes And Elements Of Research Variables
This research was conducted based on three theories, ie., principles of public open space (Stephen Carr, 1992), activity setting (Gehl, 2001) and place attachment (Scannel & Gifford, 2010). The determination of the research variables and indicators is formulated from several theories and literature that have discussed human attachment and place.

![Figure 5. Dialogue between Theory](image)

**Table 1. Research Variable**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Parameter</th>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Indicator</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Activity Setting of Street Vendors</td>
<td>Location of Street Vendor</td>
<td>• Pedestrian ways attached to alun-alun</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Pedestrian ways across alun-alun</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Time Activity</td>
<td>• Morning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Noon</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Night</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Type of Activity</td>
<td>• Dine-in Spot</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Takeaway</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Social</td>
<td>Active Engagement</td>
<td>• Accessibility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Visibility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Function and activities in the area</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>surrounding alun-alun</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Author Analysis 2020

3. Research Method
This study uses a qualitative method. Qualitative method is used to explain the phenomenon of behavior that occurs in a place without changing the natural conditions of the setting. This research using a main concept of place attachment. A bond between individual with a place that is alun-alun Jepara and street vendor.

This method is used to obtain deep and meaningful data. Through data collection methods it can explain how the research process takes place. The data used in the study are:

1. Literature study of the principles of public open space, setting activity theory and place attachment theory
2. Field observations were carried out in January in Jepara. Field observations made were observing the area of the old alun-alun and the new alun-alun, focusing on the existing conditions and surroundings, the location of traders and observe the activities on the alun-alun from morning to night.
3. Interview with street vendors in the new alun-alun,
(20 traders). The interview is conducted by asking how far the traders are attached to the old alun-alun and new alun-alun.

The method used to analyze data with deductive analysis, which is intended to review the properties that are temporarily running at the time the research is conducted and discuss certain events. Data obtained from literature studies, field observations and interviews obtained to arrange hypotheses.

The target respondent in interview is focusing on street vendor. To get more detailed and depth information on how street vendor engages with alun-alun. The questions asked in the interview are the type of merchandise, the street vendor past position in old alun-alun, what makes street vendors interested in old alun-alun?

4. Result and Discussions

Data collection to analyze street vendors’ preferences and activities was carried out with a brief interview of 20 respondents. The chairman of the association of traders in alun-alun informed that it is known that the number of traders has decreased dramatically from 60 street vendors to 20 street vendors today.

4.1 Activity Setting of Street Vendors in The Old Alun-alun and The New Alun-alun

Street vendors activity observed on weekdays and weekends. Observation time in the morning, afternoon and evening. The following is the result of the mapping of street vendors’ activities in the old alun-alun in the past and the new alun-alun at this time.

Street vendors activity in alun-alun at weekdays not so crowded as in weekend (Friday – Sunday). In the morning time, there are several street vendors who trade in the old alun-alun stimulated by public activities in the square.

At night, street vendors activities were more crowded than in the morning and afternoon. The street vendors start to selling their merchandise from 4pm – night.

Street vendors in old alun-alun use the cart and provide dine-in spot. Type of trader are beverage and non-beverage street vendors. Street vendors use the cart because it makes it easy for them to remove after trading. The carts are then stored in a storage area near the alun-alun. Street vendors activity time starts from 4pm - 6am, the time allowed by the government. Street vendors in new alun-alun use the cart but not all street vendors provide dine-in spot, because of the limited trading spot.

From the analysis of the activity setting theory, it can be identified the street vendor’s position in old alun-alun and new alun-alun.

In old alun-alun before, deployment point of street vendors has two types i.e:

1. Across the old alun-alun

   Street vendors in this area are food traders.
The existence of the enclosure and function of the surrounding buildings to the street vendor location provide space to dine-in spot, as well as, so that street vendor and visitors can feel comfortable toward climate. Street vendors in this area use the street-edge space to put the cart. The surrounding buildings also contribute to enhance traders' activities, many visitors come from Kartini museum, reading park and mosque.

2. Attached to old alun-alun
   Street vendors in this area are dominated by children toys rental trader.

Street vendors location on the pedestrian path attached to the alun-alun is dominated by non-beverage. The enclosure is formed by palm trees with a large selling area.

In new alun-alun, deployment point of street vendors has two types, i.e.:

1. Across the new alun-alun
   Street vendors in this area are food traders.

Street vendors in this location are directly adjacent to the bus terminal fence, this makes the space for trading is very limited, the traders use the part of street for their carts. The location of the tree and the cart is unorganized. Surrounding buildings is not profitable for street vendors activities. Some buildings do not facing alun-alun directly and others are empty buildings.

2. Attached to new alun-alun
   Street vendors in this area are dominated by children toys rental traders.

It can be seen from Figures 9 and 12 that although the activity setting are different, the location for trading is still the same. Street vendors location on the pedestrian path attached to the alun-alun is dominated by non-food traders. Basically, it was the same as the activity setting in the old alun-alun, but in this new place street vendors use the part of street for putting their carts as in the old alun-alun. But the street vendors use the part of street for their cart. The width of the pedestrian path is not enough for trading space. The enclosure includes several little trees and the surrounding buildings do not contribute to traders' activities, because the bus terminal does not face the alun-alun and some buildings have no activity.

The patterns of distribution are still clustered. Distribution of street vendor positions is still dominated by toy rental traders both in the pedestrian path attached to the old alun-alun or the new alun-alun. Meanwhile, the street vendors that is in the pedestrian path across the alun-alun is dominated by food traders.

The distribution pattern in the old alun-alun is fairly evenly and specifically in front of the Jepara Regent's Office there is no trading activity to maintain the physical and visual quality of Jepara City. However, in the new alun-alun the area dominated by street vendors is on the east side because it is the main road with a high level of vehicle activity. Whereas for the west side of the new alun-alun the opposite occurs because access to building functions is less attractive and the width of the road is limited.

Based on things related to the analysis of the activity setting mentioned can show that the pattern of distribution in the old alun-alun where the activity setting is evenly different from the new alun-alun with the activity setting centered on one area namely the east side of the new alun-alun. This shows that the physical and visual qualities of the alun-alun affect the setting of activities that occur.

4.2 Place Attachment of Street Vendors

Based on the results of the theoretical dialogue there are 5 place attachment assessment indicators. These five indicators will be used to get the factors of traders' attachment to the alun-alun. The data used came from field observations and interviews.

Place attachment is the attachment between humans and
place, can occur due to physical factors, or factors of meaning. Stokols, (1981) said that one of the principles of place attachment is place dependence, which is felt between humans and their environment. Attachment occurs because the space can meet their needs compared to other spaces. The principle of place attachment is carried out to identify what is the attachment between traders and old alun-alun.

From the place attachment theory, Scannell & Gifford (2010) said there are three variables that can assess the attachment of place between persons and place, i.e., person, process and space.

Five indicators are described as follows:
1. Size and setting of trading space: that is the position of the trading space and the size of the trading area. The location used by street vendors are in the pedestrian path attached to the alun-alun and the pedestrian path opposite the alun-alun and how large the part of the street is used.
2. Amenities: That is identifying the completeness of amenities, such as lighting, seating, trash, public toilets, shade and other things that are needed in the alun-alun.
3. Accessibility: That is ease of achievement. Pedestrian connectivity, access into and out of the area, and circulation around the area.
4. Visibility: That is legibility of street vendors for users of public spaces, positions in and out of buildings around, from the view corner of the alun-alun.
5. Functions and activities in the area: That is various functions and activities that are located in the alun-alun. Such as activities around alun-alun and the enclosure.

These five indicators are then used to compare the physical and social quality of the old alun-alun and new alun-alun.

Amenities is an important factor in public open space. Things that must be complete. According to Stephen Carr (1992), said amenities is the first point in the principle of public open space. The existence and completeness of the amenities greatly encourages the success of a public open space. Amenities data obtained from the result of interview. Tabel 3 shows a comparison of the physical qualities of the completeness of amenities. Old alun-alun have a complete amenity and neatly arranged, this fact will make street vendors and visitors feel more comfortable. Besides, new alun-alun is lack of amenities.

Table 4. Comparison of Accessibility in Old Alun-alun and New Alun-alun

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Old Alun-alun</th>
<th>New Alun-alun</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Pedestrian paths that are interconnected</td>
<td>Pedestrian path still obstructed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Informative</td>
<td>Lacking road markings</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Author Analysis 2020

Good access can be shaped by the location context on the city scale and circulation patterns. Table 4 shows comparison of social qualities of the accessibilities in old alun-alun and new alun-alun. It can be seen that alun-alun has a pedestrian path that is well connected and informative. Make it easy for visitors to interact. And the pedestrian at new alun-alun still obstructed and less information.

Table 5. Comparison of Visibility in Old Alun-alun and New Alun-alun

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Old Alun-alun</th>
<th>New Alun-alun</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>All buildings are oriented to the square</td>
<td>Some buildings do not have access points leading to the Alun-alun</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Large visibility make a wider view</td>
<td>Good enough</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>All view corner having a good quality</td>
<td>Less view corner</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Author Analysis 2020

Visibility of street vendors is one of the attractions of visitors. With its appearance and having the corners of a nice area visitors will be increasingly interested. Data of visibility obtained from the result of field observation. Table 5 shows comparison of social qualities of the visibility between old alun-alun and new alun-alun. Old alun-alun has a much better visual quality than the new alun-alun.

Table 6. Comparison of Function and Activity in the Area on Old Alun-alun and New Alun-alun

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Old Alun-alun</th>
<th>New Alun-alun</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Good Enclosure with city scale function</td>
<td>Not supported by enclosure of buildings surrounding the square</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Much activities</td>
<td>Less Activities</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Author Analysis 2020

Enclosure is one of the attractions of visitors, be a reason to visit a place. Table 6 shows comparison of social qualities of old alun-alun and new alun-alun. It can be seen that old alun-alun have an attractive enclosure. Meanwhile new alun-alun need more activities inside.

From the results of the analysis of the size and setting of the trading space, the area's amenity, accessibility, visibility and functions and activities in the area on the old alun-alun and the new alun-alun. We can find out the place attachments of street vendors to the alun-alun in Jepara with
an assessment of comfort and active connection. Both assessments are connected to physical and social conditions in alun-alun through the theory of place attachment, place. In the physical condition of the alun-alun, street vendors have more links with the old alun-alun and in terms of social street vendors also have more links with the old alun-alun.

Table 7. Collaboration Interview Result, indicators and Factors Result

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Response Answer for Old Alun-alun</th>
<th>Indicators</th>
<th>Factors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Near Centre City</td>
<td>Accessibility</td>
<td>Access</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Crowded Visitors</td>
<td>Function and Activities</td>
<td>Attractiveness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>More Space for Sitting</td>
<td>Size and Setting of Trading Space</td>
<td>Shape and Availability of Space</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Complete Public Facilities</td>
<td>Amenities</td>
<td>Amenities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Have a Shelter</td>
<td>Amenities</td>
<td>Amenities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>No Mosquitoes</td>
<td>Amenities</td>
<td>Amenities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>Wifi Area</td>
<td>Amenities</td>
<td>Amenities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>Comfort</td>
<td>Accessibility</td>
<td>Access</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>Good Enclosure</td>
<td>Function and Activities</td>
<td>Attractiveness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>Wide Pedestrian</td>
<td>Size and Setting of Trading Space</td>
<td>Shape and Availability of Space</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.</td>
<td>Good View Corner</td>
<td>Visibility</td>
<td>Attractiveness</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Author Analysis 2020

It can be seen that the factors of attachment of traders to the old alun-alun are access, space shape and size, amenities and attractiveness.

The result is street vendor’s attachment to old alun-alun is only influence by physical and social space variables. Street vendors are bounded to these places, because of physical, circulation or visual form.

1. Access: The existence of central government buildings in the center of the city and the area that is easily accessible because located along city main street. Pedestrian path are interconnected.

2. Shape and Availability of Space: Width of pedestrian paths to support trading activities

3. Amenities: Good lighting, availability of public toilets, bins, seating, shelter, parks and good drainage.

4. Attractiveness: The existence of city-scale building functions, visual and the concentration of activities.

5. Conclusion

This research indicates the significance of the place attachment in shaping place identity. The physical attachment is reflected in the ability of place to fulfill users psychological. In the context of open public space or alun-alun, the physical form of attachment plays a significant role in creating distinctive atmosphere.

From the description above it can be concluded that the activity setting of street vendors is enough to influence the existence of the alun-alun, in terms of the type of activity, time of activity and position of the trader. The street vendors have an attachment to the place with the old alun-alun due to four factors. Namely (1) Access, location that is in the center of the city, easily accessible and well-connected pedestrian paths. (2) Space and shape, proportion of the needs of the right trading space for street vendors. (3) Amenities, completeness of amenities which is fulfilled for street vendors and visitors. (4) Attractiveness covered by city-scale buildings that can be an attraction for the square.

Based on the results of the study there are some recommendations to be followed up, (1) The district government of Jepara needs to reorganize the new alun-alun as one of Jepara’s public open spaces. The arrangement of the new alun-alun adjusts to the presence of street vendors to harmonize the function of open space as a center for social interaction and supporting the economic sector. (2) Rearranging the area around the new alun-alun for attractiveness.

6. References


